

1 **The impact of fermentation on the distribution of cadmium in cacao beans**

2 Ruth VANDERSCHUEREN ^{a,*}, Vincent DE MESMAEKER ^a, Sandra MOUNICOU ^b, Marie-
3 Pierre ISAURE ^b, Emmanuel DOELSCH ^c, Daniela MONTALVO ^a, Jan A. DELCOUR ^d, Eduardo
4 CHAVEZ ^e and Erik SMOLDERS ^a

5

6 ^a Division of Soil and Water Management, KU Leuven, Belgium

7 ^b Institut des sciences analytiques et de physico-chimie pour l'environnement et les matériaux
8 (IPREM UMR 5254), Université de Pau et des Pays de l'Adour, CMR, E2S (Energy and
9 Environment Solutions) – UPPA, France

10 ^c CIRAD, UPR Recyclage et risque, F-34398 Montpellier, France Recyclage et Risque, Univ
11 Montpellier, CIRAD, Montpellier, France

12 ^d Centre for Food and Microbial Technology, KU Leuven, Belgium

13 ^e Facultad de Ciencias de la Vida, Escuela Superior Politecnica del Litoral, Ecuador

14 * Corresponding author: Vanderschueren R., KU Leuven, Kasteelpark Arenberg 20, 3001 Leuven,
15 Belgium. Phone: +32 16 37 33 73 E-mail: ruth.vanderschueren@kuleuven.be

16

17 ABSTRACT

18 A large fraction of the South-American cacao production is affected by new cadmium (Cd)
19 regulations in cacao. This work was set up to characterize the distribution and speciation of Cd
20 within the cacao fruit and to monitor potential Cd redistribution during cacao fermentation. In
21 cacao fruits from four locations, Cd concentrations decreased with testa > nib ~placenta ~pod husk
22 > mucilage. The distribution of Cd within cacao beans was successfully visualized using laser
23 ablation inductively coupled plasma spectrometry (LA-ICP-MS) and confirmed higher Cd
24 concentrations in the testa than in the nib. Speciation analysis by X-ray absorption spectroscopy
25 (XANES) of unfermented cacao beans revealed that Cd was bound to O/N-ligands in both nib and
26 testa. Fermentation induced an outward Cd migration from the nibs to the testa, i.e. against the
27 total concentration gradient. This migration occurred only if the fermentation was sufficiently
28 extensive to decrease the pH in the nib to <5.0, likely as a result of increased Cd mobility due to
29 organic acid penetration into the nibs. The change in dry weight based nib Cd concentrations
30 during fermentation was, on average, a factor 1.3 decrease. We propose that nib Cd can be reduced
31 if the nib pH is sufficiently acidified during fermentation. However, a balance must be found
32 between flavor development and Cd removal since extreme acidity is detrimental for cacao flavor.

33

34 1. INTRODUCTION

35 Although cacao-derived products are generally consumed in small quantities compared to staple
36 foods, they can be an important source of dietary Cd because of potentially high Cd concentrations.
37 The European Food Safety Authority estimated that cacao-derived products account for 4.3% of
38 the total dietary Cd exposure in the European population (EFSA, 2012). Therefore, the European
39 Commission approved threshold limits for Cd in cacao-derived products, which were enforced in
40 January 2019 (European Commission, 2014). Similar limits were adopted by the Codex
41 Alimentarius (Codex Alimentarius Commission, 2018). This new regulation on Cd in cacao will
42 impact South-American cacao farmers, as Cd concentrations in South-American cacao are
43 generally higher than those in cacao from other origins. Bertoldi et al. (2016) reported Cd
44 concentrations in South-American cacao beans more than tenfold larger than those in West-
45 African cacao. These findings have prompted researchers to explore potential techniques to lower
46 Cd in the final product, focusing mostly on the relation between cacao bean Cd and soil Cd. For
47 example, Argüello et al (2019) has mapped the concentrations of Cd in cacao beans and
48 corresponding soils in Ecuador and was able to identify soil parameters to predict cacao bean Cd.
49 Ramtahal et al. (2019) investigated potential soil amendments and showed that both biochar and
50 lime application may reduce Cd accumulation in cacao.

51 A recent survey by Vanderschueren et al. (2019) showed that the Cd concentration in cacao-
52 derived products is correlated to the cacao content of the product, indicating that Cd originates
53 from the raw material (cacao nibs) rather than other ingredients or contamination during
54 processing. Similar results have also been reported by Abt et al. (2018), Villa et al. (2014) and
55 Yanus et al. (2014). The cacao fruit (*Theobroma cacao* L.) consists of an outer pod husk containing
56 20–50 cacao beans (seeds), surrounded by a sugary mucilage and attached to a central tissue (cacao

57 placenta). Each cacao bean comprises of a seed coat or testa and two cotyledons known as the nib
58 (Beckett, 2008). Chocolate production requires extensive post-harvest processing, starting with
59 fermentation. The pod husk and placenta are discarded, and the cacao beans with surrounding
60 mucilage are fermented for two to ten days depending on the cultivar and local practices.
61 Fermentation is anaerobic during the first one to two days and the microbial population mostly
62 consists of yeasts. Pectinolytic enzymes produced by the yeasts liquefy the mucilage and cause
63 fermentation sweatings, which are drained through holes at the bottom of the fermentation boxes.
64 This results in an increase in oxygen levels, allowing growth of lactic acid and acetic acid bacteria.
65 The concentrations of lactic acid and acetic acid in the mucilage start to increase after two days of
66 fermentation (De Vuyst & Weckx, 2016). The fermentation process results in a temperature
67 increase from ambient temperature to 45–50 °C; an increase in mucilage pH from 3–4 to 4.5–5
68 due to conversion of citric acid to ethanol; and a decrease in nib pH from 6.5–7 to 4.5–5 due to
69 penetration of lactic and acetic acid (De Vuyst & Weckx, 2016; Thompson et al., 2007). After
70 fermentation, cacao beans are dried to reach a moisture content of maximum 6–8% (Afoakwa,
71 2010). During the second more industrial stage of the chocolate manufacturing process, the cacao
72 beans are roasted and the testa is removed. The roasted nibs are then ground to cacao liquor and
73 further processed to obtain consumer products (i.e. chocolate and cacao powder).

74 Post-harvest strategies that lower the Cd concentration in the cacao nib may offer viable options
75 to lower the Cd concentration in the final product because the nib is the only part of the cacao fruit
76 retained during processing. Developing such strategies requires better understanding regarding the
77 distribution and speciation of Cd in the different cacao tissues, as well as the influence of
78 conventional post-harvest processes on this distribution. Most previous work reports on the cacao
79 nib, testa and pod husk with little attention to the mucilage and placenta. The Cd concentration in

80 the testa is generally reported higher than in the nibs. For example; Lewis et al. (2018) found more
81 than twofold higher Cd concentrations in the testa compared to the nib, and Ramtahal et al. (2016)
82 reported higher Cd concentrations in the testa compared to the nib, in cacao from Trinidad and
83 Tobago. The reverse has also been observed. Chavez et al. (2015) measured the Cd concentrations
84 in cacao from 19 Ecuadorian farms and found generally higher Cd concentrations in the nib
85 compared to the testa. Sample treatment often differs, cacao samples were provided by chocolate
86 manufacturers with little information regarding sample processing (Lee & Low, 1985), samples
87 were either or not washed with water which can affect Cd concentrations in the outer tissues
88 (Gramlich et al., 2018; Lewis et al., 2018; Ramtahal et al., 2016), or samples were washed with
89 chelating agent solutions (Chavez et al., 2015). To the best of our knowledge, the influence of
90 fermentation on the Cd distribution in cacao has not been reported to date. Thyssen et al. (2018)
91 mapped the 2D distribution of Cd in sections of fermented cacao beans using laser ablation
92 inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (LA-ICP-MS) and found elevated signals for Cd,
93 Cu, K, Mg, Na, Pb and Zn in the testa compared to the nib, however they did not investigate
94 unfermented samples. Fermentation has been reported as a possible technique for reducing Cd in
95 rice (Zhai et al., 2019; Zhang et al., 2017). Zhai et al. (2019) reported Cd removal efficiencies
96 >90% for rice fermented with lactic acid bacteria and related this to a combination of the Cd
97 binding potential of the bacteria, and the effects of the organic acid production mobilizing Cd. This
98 phenomenon may also occur during cacao fermentation due to the lactic and acetic acid production,
99 but has not been studied to date.

100 The objectives of this study were (i) to determine the distribution and speciation of Cd between
101 and within the different cacao fruit tissues, i.e. pod husk, placenta, mucilage, testa and nibs; and
102 (ii) to investigate the influence of fermentation on the distribution of Cd between these different

103 cacao bean tissues. Better understanding of the distribution and speciation of Cd in cacao and the
104 influence of post-harvest processing may shed light on opportunities to lower Cd concentrations
105 in the final product.

106 2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

107 **2.1. Cacao material**

108 Ripe cacao fruits were collected at four fields in the provinces El Oro (batch A, CCN-51 cultivar),
109 Guayas (batches B and C, Nacional cultivar) and Sucumbíos (batch D, Nacional cultivar) in
110 Ecuador (Table 1). Unfermented cacao beans for XANES spectroscopy were collected at different
111 fields in the provinces Esmeraldas (Nacional cultivar), Guayas (CCN-51 cultivar) and Sucumbíos
112 (Nacional cultivar).

113 **2.2. Sampling and sample preparation**

114 A minimum of three intact cacao fruits was collected for each batch, and each fruit was considered
115 as an independent replicate. The intact fruits were manually separated to obtain pod husk, placenta,
116 mucilage and cacao beans. Residual mucilage was removed from the cacao beans using paper
117 towels and all cacao tissues were oven dried for 72 hours at 65 °C. After drying, subsamples of
118 intact cacao beans of batches C and D were collected for LA-ICP-MS imaging. The remainder of
119 the cacao beans was manually separated in nibs and testa, and all dried fractions (pod husk,
120 placenta, mucilage, testa and nib) were ground using a coffee grinder before chemical analyses.

121 **2.3. Fermentation**

122 Fermentation experiments were conducted to assess the effect of fermentation on the distribution
123 of Cd within cacao tissues, and comprised two cultivars (CCN-51 in batch A and Nacional in
124 batches B, C and C_{bis}) and three common fermentation methods (cascade fermentation in batches
125 A and B, single box fermentation in batch C and single box fermentation with pre-drying in batch

126 C_{bis}). No fermentation experiments were set up for the cacao of batch D. Batch C was split in two
127 fermentation batches, C and C_{bis}, which comprised of the same cacao (same variety and plantation)
128 but were subjected to different fermentation conditions (Table 1). Fermentation experiments were
129 conducted in Ecuador following local practices using wooden boxes with perforated floors to allow
130 drainage of the fermentation sweatings. The boxes were covered with jute bags to retain heat. For
131 each batch, the total mass of cacao needed to fill two fermentation boxes (about 580–1180 kg,
132 Table 1) was thoroughly mixed and divided in duplicate fermentation boxes. Different subsamples
133 of 1 kg cacao mass were taken and placed in mesh bags (Figure S1) to facilitate bean sampling
134 during fermentation. All mesh bag subsamples (3–7 per box, depending on the batch) were placed
135 in the center of the fermentation boxes at the start of fermentation and relocated in the same
136 position after mixing. Daily sampling was performed by taking out one of the mesh bag subsamples
137 from each fermentation box. Each mesh bag subsample was considered an independent replicate
138 for that fermentation day and the two fermentation boxes were considered as the duplicates for the
139 batches or fermentation experiments. Fermentations A and B were performed in cascades of three
140 wooden boxes measuring 60×60×60 cm (width×depth×height) and the fermenting masses were
141 mixed every two days by depositing them in the next box of the cascade (Figure S2). Batches C
142 and C_{bis} were fermented in single 100×100×60 cm wooden boxes. This cacao was mixed manually
143 after one day (C_{bis}) or two days (C) and remained in the initial box throughout the fermentation
144 period. Cacao beans of batch C_{bis} were pre-dried over night before fermentation, mimicking a
145 common practice in some fermentation facilities. In this pre-drying method, fresh cacao was spread
146 out on a concrete floor and left to dry overnight. This method, also referred to as bean spreading,
147 is a common practice to prevent excessive acidity of cacao beans during fermentation (Biehl et al.,
148 1990; Meyer et al., 1989; Schwan & Wheals, 2004). The total fermentation time for each batch

149 was determined by local practices (Table 1). The endpoint of each fermentation was based on
150 quality assessment by local farmers. Beans were sampled daily by removing one mesh bag
151 subsample (1 kg cacao mass) from the center of each box. The cacao beans in the mesh bags were
152 then manually separated in mucilage and beans and oven dried at 65 °C for 72 hours, with beans
153 split in nibs and testa and further ground as described above.

154 **2.4. Temperature and pH**

155 The mucilage pH was measured immediately after sampling or after opening of the cacao fruits.
156 Cacao beans with mucilage attached were vigorously shaken for 2 min in a 1:10 solid to deionized
157 water ratio and the pH of the suspension was measured. To determine nib and testa pH, dried and
158 ground material was treated likewise in a 5:10 solid sample to deionized water ratio and filtered
159 (F2040 filter paper, retention 7–9 µm, CHMLAB GROUP, Barcelona, Spain) to obtain a clear
160 supernatant for pH measurement. The temperature in the fermentation experiments was measured
161 daily in the center of the fermentation boxes using a digital thermometer (VWR International,
162 Darmstadt, Germany).

163 **2.5. Determination of the elemental composition of cacao beans**

164 Duplicates of 100 mg dry material were digested in 3 mL concentrated Suprapur® nitric acid
165 (HNO₃, 65% w/w; Merck, Darmstadt, Germany) in an open digestion block for 8 hours at a
166 maximum temperature of 130 °C. Digests were diluted five times with Milli-Q water (18.2 MΩ
167 cm⁻¹) and the Cd concentration was determined by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry
168 (ICP-MS, Agilent 7700x, Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, USA). The ICP-MS analysis was
169 performed in helium (He) collision cell mode monitoring the ¹¹¹Cd isotope, using ¹⁰³Rh as an on-
170 line internal standard. The limit of quantification (LOQ) for the ICP-MS analysis was 0.02 µg Cd
171 L⁻¹ which corresponded to a solid sample LOQ of 0.006 mg Cd kg⁻¹ dry matter. Blank samples (in

172 quadruplicate) and certified reference material NIST 2384 baking chocolate (in triplicate) were
173 included in all digestions and treated the same way as the cacao tissue samples. Recoveries of the
174 certified reference material ranged 98–108% and the coefficient of variation (CV) for the duplicate
175 digestions ranged 0.1–23% (average CV 5%). The concentrations of several other elements were
176 also determined, i.e. ^{27}Al , ^{75}As , ^{44}Ca , ^{59}Co , ^{52}Cr , ^{63}Cu , ^{39}K , ^{24}Mg , ^{55}Mn , ^{95}Mo , ^{60}Ni , ^{31}P , ^{208}Pb and
177 ^{66}Zn .

178 **2.6. Visualization of the elemental distribution by LA-ICP-MS in unfermented cacao beans**

179 Unfermented cacao beans for LA-ICP-MS imaging were sampled from batches C and D. For each
180 LA-ICP-MS sample (which was a single bean), the Cd concentration was determined from other
181 cacao beans obtained from the same fruit using the digest method and ICP-MS analysis as
182 described previously. Transverse cacao bean cross-sections with a thickness of 65 μm were made
183 following the method described by Lombi et al. (2009) for rice grains. The cacao beans were sliced
184 with a vibrating microtome (Microm HM 650 Vibratome, Thermo Scientific, Walldorf, Germany)
185 using diamond blades (GFD Gesellschaft für Diamantprodukte, Ulm, Germany). The cross-
186 sections were made at approximately 80% of the length of the cacao bean, measured from the
187 cacao radicle side. Once a flat surface was obtained, the surface of the cacao bean was defatted
188 using hexane (HiPerSolv Chromanorm 97%, VWR, Leuven, Belgium) to enable sticking of the
189 tape on the cacao surface. Then, a piece of Kapton polyimide tape was pressed on the surface and
190 the diamond blade cut underneath, leaving a cacao bean cross-section glued on the Kapton tape.
191 For elemental detection, a quadrupole 7700cs ICP-MS (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, USA)
192 was used, mounted with platinum (Pt) cones. The sensitivity and operational conditions (stability,
193 background and mass calibration) were checked using a 1 $\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$ Y, Tl, Li, Ba and Ce tuning
194 solution. The ICP-MS was then coupled to a 213-nm laser ablation system equipped with a TV2

195 cell (NWR213, ESI, Fremont, CA) and coupling was optimized using a NIST 612 glass by
196 monitoring ^{238}U and ^{232}Th for maximum sensitivity and a U to Th ratio as close as possible to the
197 unit. Imaging of cacao cross-sections was performed by subsequent line scans with a 20 Hz laser
198 shot repetition rate, a fluency maintained between 5–5.3 J cm⁻², a laser beam of 20 μm² and 50
199 μm², a scan speed of 23 and 50 μm s⁻¹, and a distance between each line of 40 and 100 μm for high
200 and low resolution images, respectively. The ablated cacao particles were transported with 800 mL
201 min⁻¹ He and mixed with Ar gas from ICP-MS before the ICP torch inlet. The ICP-MS was used
202 in He mode, allowing monitoring of ^{111}Cd (0.2 s), ^{114}Cd (0.2 s), ^{31}P (0.1 s), ^{39}K (0.005 s), ^{44}Ca
203 (0.15 s), ^{60}Ni (0.1 s) and ^{64}Zn (0.1 s as integration time). The acquisition time was set according to
204 the ablation time needed for one line. One data file recording the intensity of each element versus
205 time was acquired for each line, and a homemade program under Python was used to generate 2D
206 images of element intensities per pixel with a colour code.

207 **2.7. X-ray absorption near-edge structure spectroscopy**

208 The speciation of Cd in unfermented cacao was investigated using X-ray absorption near-edge
209 structure spectroscopy (XANES). The samples comprised of cacao beans from CCN-51 and
210 Nacional cultivars. The cacao testa and nib were separated manually and both materials were dried,
211 ground and pressed into pellets for XANES analysis. The XANES spectra were collected at the X-
212 ray absorption spectroscopy beamline (Australian synchrotron, ANSTO). The Cd K-edge (26711
213 eV) was scanned rather than the Cd L_{III}-edge (3538 eV) to avoid interference with the K K-edge
214 (3608 eV), as K is expected to be abundant in cacao tissues. Sample spectra were measured in
215 fluorescence mode with a 100-elements solid-state Ge detector, at 10 °K to prevent beam damage.
216 One spectrum represents the average of 2–26 scans, depending on the concentration of Cd. Each
217 scan was measured on a different spot on the pellet to limit beam damage. Reference X-ray spectra

218 for Cd metal foil were collected simultaneously with the sample spectra and were used for both
219 energy calibration and spectral alignment. Several Cd reference compounds were also measured:
220 Cd-chloride, Cd-phosphate, Cd-sulfate, Cd-oxide, Cd-acetate, Cd-lactate, Cd-citrate, Cd-histidine,
221 Cd-phytate, Cd-malate, Cd-cysteine and Cd-glutathione (details about reference compound
222 preparation are given in the supplementary information). Data extraction was performed using
223 Sakura (<https://sakura.readthedocs.org>) while background subtraction, normalization and linear
224 combination fitting (LCF) were done using Athena software (Ravel & Newville, 2005). For each
225 sample spectrum, LCF was performed by fitting regions between -25 and 70 eV using the library
226 of Cd reference compounds. Satisfactory fits were obtained with a combination of two reference
227 compounds. Three compound LCFs were not retained as the residual factor (R-factor) used to
228 assess the goodness of fit was not significantly smaller compared to the R-factor of the two
229 compound LCFs. Linear combination results were normalized to 100% to compare the relative
230 speciation between samples.

231 **2.8. Statistical analysis**

232 All statistical analysis was executed using JMP[®] Pro version 14.0.0 (SAS Institute 2018). The
233 differences in Cd concentration between the different cacao tissues were tested using Tukey's
234 Honestly Significant Difference test ($P\text{-value} \leq 0.05$) using the mean data of sampling replicates
235 (e.g. the two fermentation boxes), as the independent replicates. The effect of fermentation time
236 on the elemental composition of the different tissues was tested using Pearson's correlation test
237 ($P\text{-value} \leq 0.05$).

238 **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

239 **3.1. Distribution of Cd in unfermented cacao beans**

240 Cacao beans from batch D showed the highest Cd concentrations in nib and testa, followed by
241 batch C, and finally batches A and B (Table 2). The coefficients of variation (CV) of nib Cd
242 between cacao fruits of the same batch ranged between 20 and 37%, indicating variation in cacao
243 bean Cd between fruits from the same plantation. In a large survey of 159 Ecuadorian fields,
244 Argüello et al. (2019) observed that the average CV in bean Cd concentration among fruits of
245 different trees within the same field was 39%. They related this variation in bean Cd to the large
246 spatial variation in soil Cd. The Cd concentrations were overall highest in the testa, followed by
247 the nibs, placenta and pod husk (all similar in Cd content) and finally the mucilage. No information
248 was found in literature regarding the Cd concentration in the placenta or the mucilage. Gramlich
249 et al. (2018) measured the Cd concentration in cacao from 55 farms in Honduras and did not find
250 a significant difference between the Cd concentration in the pod husks ($1.1 \pm 0.2 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$) and that
251 in the nibs ($1.1 \pm 0.1 \text{ mg kg}^{-1}$). Conversely, Ramtahal et al. (2016) reported higher Cd
252 concentrations in the pod husks (0.53–4.49 mg Cd kg⁻¹) compared to the nibs (0.35–3.82 mg Cd
253 kg⁻¹) for cacao from 45 farms in Trinidad and Tobago.

254 Testa Cd concentrations were higher than nib Cd concentrations in all batches (ratio testa Cd to
255 nib Cd 1.8 for A, 1.7 for B, 1.5 for C and 1.7 for D). Considering the average weight fractions for
256 nib (0.93) and testa (0.07), 91% of the total bean Cd was located in the nib and 9% in the testa in
257 unfermented cacao beans. In accordance to the present work, Ramtahal et al. (2016) reported
258 significantly higher Cd concentrations in testa (0.44–4.41 mg Cd kg⁻¹) compared to nibs (0.35–
259 3.82 mg Cd kg⁻¹) for unfermented cacao beans from Trinidad and Tobago. Lewis et al. (2018)
260 reported more than two-fold higher Cd concentrations in the testa (average 1.83 mg kg⁻¹) compared
261 to those in the nibs (average 0.88 mg kg⁻¹) for unfermented cacao beans from the same genetic
262 group and grown in a common garden. Similarly, Lee & Low (1985) determined the Cd

263 concentrations in raw cacao beans from two different sources and reported higher Cd
264 concentrations in the testa (1.32 ± 0.06 and 2.05 ± 0.01 mg Cd kg⁻¹) compared to Cd concentrations
265 in the nibs (0.76 ± 0.02 and 1.01 ± 0.01 mg Cd kg⁻¹) for the two sources, respectively. Conversely,
266 Chavez et al. (2015) analyzed the Cd concentration in unfermented cacao nibs and testa from 19
267 different small-scale farms in the south of Ecuador and consistently found higher Cd
268 concentrations in the cacao nibs compared to the testa. However, the cacao beans in that study
269 were washed with a hypochlorite solution before peeling which may have removed some of the
270 Cd in the outer testa.

271 **3.2. Imaging of elemental distribution in unfermented cacao beans with LA-ICP-MS**

272 The elemental imaging maps obtained by LA-ICP-MS for ¹¹¹Cd and ¹¹⁴Cd isotopes showed close
273 agreement, which indicates that there were no interferences affecting the Cd measurement (Figure
274 1, and Figures S3 and S4). There were no zones found with consistently elevated intensities for
275 the measured isotopes (⁴⁴Ca, ¹¹¹Cd, ¹¹⁴Cd, ³⁹K, ⁶⁰Ni, ³¹P and ⁶⁴Zn, Figures S3 and S4) in the
276 obtained elemental maps, indicating that the samples were sufficiently planar for reliable image
277 interpretation and comparison. Regions with consistently lower signal intensity corresponded to
278 inherent cracks in the cacao bean samples as visible on the sample pictures (Figure 1). The overall
279 Cd concentrations in the nib and testa from batch D were nearly seven times higher than the Cd
280 concentrations in the tissues of batch C. When LA-ICP-MS imaging is performed at a higher
281 resolution, a smaller surface area of the sample is ablated and thus less sample material is
282 transported to the ICP-MS detector. Therefore, higher resolution imaging requires samples with
283 larger elemental concentrations (or very long measurement times). Because of this, the batch D
284 sample could be scanned at higher resolution (20 μm² laser beam size) than the cross-section of
285 batch C (laser beam size 50 μm²). The ICP-MS integration time was equal in both scans to limit

286 the measurement duration. Therefore, the signal intensity (expressed as counts per second, cps) of
287 the batch D sample was lower than that of the batch C sample even though the overall Cd
288 concentrations in D were larger than those in C.

289 The testa layer was clearly distinguishable from the cacao nib and showed elevated Cd intensities
290 for both samples (Figure 1), which is in line with the measured Cd concentrations in these tissues
291 (Table 2). Apart from Cd, only Ca displayed clearly elevated intensities in the testa (Figures S3
292 and S4). The distribution of K was approximately uniform between nib and testa; and P, Ni and
293 Zn were more abundant in the nib compared to the testa (Figures S3 and S4). Cadmium and zinc
294 were not co-located within the cacao bean tissues even though they are considered similar in
295 chemical properties and are often transported in plants through similar mechanisms (Smolders &
296 Mertens, 2013). Dissimilar Cd and Zn distribution patterns have also been visualized in rice
297 (Meharg et al., 2008). This may indicate a difference in transport mechanisms for Cd and Zn into
298 the cacao seed, possibly related to a defense mechanism of the plant as Zn is an important
299 micronutrient while Cd has no known function in plant growth. The distribution of Cd within the
300 cacao nib was not homogeneous throughout the cross-section. Further identification of nib zones
301 with higher Cd intensities may shed light on the way Cd is translocated into the cacao bean during
302 plant growth. Thyssen et al. (2018) created elemental maps of longitudinal cross-sections of
303 fermented cacao beans using LA-ICP-MS and observed elevated signal intensities for Cd in the
304 testa. However, they reported accumulation of P, K and Zn in the testa, which was not observed in
305 this study. These differences compared to the present work may be explained by the influence of
306 cacao fermentation or by possible differences in cultivars and overall different elemental
307 concentrations between these samples.

308 **3.3. Speciation of Cd in unfermented cacao beans**

309 The LCF procedure identified two reference compounds to describe the speciation of Cd in all
310 samples (Figure 2 and Figure S5). Optimal fits were obtained with a combination of Cd-histidine,
311 where Cd is bound to amino and carboxyl groups, and Cd-citrate, where Cd is bound to alcohol
312 and carboxyl groups. The proportions of both ligands were similar in most samples (39–58% Cd-
313 histidine and 42–61% Cd-citrate), except for nib 3 (84% Cd-histidine and 16% Cd-citrate) and
314 testa 1 (22% Cd-histidine and 78% Cd-citrate). These results indicate that Cd in the cacao nib and
315 the testa is bound to O/N-ligands. In hyperaccumulator plants, Cd was found with both S-ligands
316 and O-ligands, and the association with O-ligands was reported as a detoxification strategy in
317 contrast to non-hyperaccumulating plants where S-ligands were predominant (Huguet et al. 2012,
318 Isaure et al. 2006 & 2015, Vogel-Mikuš et al. 2007). In the present work, no evidence was found
319 for complexation with S-ligands (thiols) in the cacao nib or testa.

320 **3.4. Changes in pH and temperature during fermentation**

321 The nib pH in batches A and B decreased with fermentation from 6.2 to about 4.5, the mucilage
322 pH increased from about 3.7 to 4.5, and the testa pH increased from 4.3 to 5.0 (Figure 3). Changes
323 in pH were less pronounced in batches C and C_{bis} (final nib pH 5.2 and 6.0, mucilage pH 3.8 and
324 4.0, and testa pH 4.8 and 4.4 for the two batches, respectively). The fermentation times for C and
325 C_{bis} were shorter than in A and B (3–4 versus 5–7 days, Table 1), suggesting a lower extent of
326 fermentation. The temperature profile was similar in all batches and increased from the start of
327 fermentation reaching 45 °C after three to four days of fermentation. The pH and temperature
328 values are in line with values reported in literature, which state that the temperature of the
329 fermenting cacao bean mass increases from ambient temperature to about 45–50 °C and nib pH
330 decreases from 6.3–7.0 to 4.0–5.5 during fermentation (Belitz et al., 2009; De Vuyst & Weckx,
331 2016; Papalexandratou et al., 2011; Schwan & Wheals, 2004; Thompson et al., 2007).

332 **3.5. The influence of fermentation on the distribution of Cd in cacao beans**

333 One replicate sample of mucilage (fermentation day 3, batch B) showed an extreme Cd
334 concentration (6.6 mg Cd kg⁻¹) and was excluded from analysis. The concentration of Cd within
335 the different cacao bean tissues before the start of fermentation (day zero, Figure 4) was in line
336 with the values observed in intact fruits (testa > nib > mucilage, Table 2). The nib Cd concentration
337 in batches A and B decreased with fermentation time by a factor 1.3 (Figure 4). The final nib Cd
338 concentration in B was lower than 0.60 mg kg⁻¹, which is commonly considered the maximum
339 allowed Cd concentration in cacao beans destined for export to the EU. The mucilage and testa Cd
340 concentrations in A increased with fermentation time (factor 2.1 in testa and 7.8 in mucilage)
341 reaching a similar plateau concentration after four days of fermentation. The same was true for the
342 mucilage Cd in B (increased by factor 2.5) but no significant trend in testa Cd was observed. To
343 correct for changes in nib and testa weight fractions throughout fermentation, the Cd
344 concentrations in the different tissues were multiplied with the weight fraction of that tissue. These
345 weight fraction corrected results still showed a decrease in nib Cd content (expressed in mg nib
346 Cd kg⁻¹ total cacao bean) and an increase in testa Cd content (mg testa Cd kg⁻¹ total cacao bean)
347 for A and B (Figure S6). This suggests that Cd migrates from the nib to the testa and the mucilage
348 during fermentation, resulting in lower Cd concentrations in the final cacao based product because
349 the outer tissues (testa and mucilage) are removed at later stages of the post-harvest process. At
350 the end of fermentations A and B, approximately 80% of the total cacao bean Cd was located in
351 the nibs whereas 20 % was found in the testa.

352 As stated previously, batches C and C_{bis} were fermented less extensively than batches A and B.
353 This may explain why no change in nib Cd was observed by the end of fermentation in these
354 batches. The mucilage Cd concentration in C increased significantly with fermentation time (factor

355 6.2) in a similar pattern as observed for batches A and B. But in contrast to A and B, the testa Cd
356 concentration in C decreased with time. Fermentation of batch C_{bis} had no significant influence on
357 the Cd concentrations in the testa. The mucilage Cd concentration did increase by factor 1.7 but
358 this change was not of the same magnitude as observed in the other batches. The overall Cd
359 concentrations in C and C_{bis} were higher than those in A and B. However, results from a pilot scale
360 fermentation (5 kg) using the same high Cd cacao, showed that Cd concentrations in the nibs of
361 this cacao did decrease with fermentation time if the cacao was fermented more extensively, i.e.
362 four days with a decrease in nib pH from 6.1 to 4.8 (data not shown). This demonstrates that the
363 pH, rather than the total Cd concentration, explains Cd migration. Mass balance calculations of
364 bean Cd showed that the total bean Cd concentrations reduced with 15% by the end of fermentation
365 in batches A, B and C (Figure S7). This may be related to the loss of mucilage through fermentation
366 sweatings. No Cd loss was observed over the course of fermentation for batch C_{bis} which had been
367 air-dried prior to fermentation. Farmers estimate that the cacao loses approximately 25% of its
368 fresh weight during pre-drying as the mucilage liquid runs off and evaporates. As a result,
369 sweatings during the fermentation may be much smaller in such fermentation practices and the
370 total Cd mass may remain constant over the course of fermentation.

371 The nib Cd concentration was strongly correlated to nib pH throughout fermentation in batches A
372 and B, but not in C and C_{bis} (Figure 5). The nib pH in C and C_{bis} decreased by over one unit during
373 fermentation but remained >5, while the pH in batches A and B dropped to 4.5. This may indicate
374 the importance of fermenting long enough to reach nib pH values <5, in order to generate Cd
375 migration from the nib outwards. XANES speciation analysis showed that Cd was mostly bound
376 to O/N-ligands such as histidine and citrate. The pK_a value for the dissociation of the second
377 carboxylic group in citrate is 4.77, which can explain the increase in Cd mobility when the tissue

378 pH drops below that value. Conversely, the pKa values for histidine are 1.82 (carboxylic group),
379 6.00 (N in the imidazole ring) and 9.17 (amine group). Zhai et al. (2019) stated that rice
380 fermentation may decrease Cd concentrations and that this Cd removal capacity is related to the
381 acid producing abilities of lactic acid bacteria present during fermentation. They reported a pH
382 decrease from 6 (initial pH) to <4.5 by the end of fermentation, depending on the strain of lactic
383 acid bacteria used. Testa Cd concentrations were approximately a factor two larger than nib Cd
384 concentrations in unfermented cacao (Table 2). The migration of Cd during fermentation thus
385 occurred against the total Cd concentration gradient. However, the cacao testa has been identified
386 as a heavy metal adsorbent with potential applications in the treatment of industrial effluents
387 (Meunier et al., 2003). Because of the Cd sorption capacity of the testa and the differences in pH
388 between the nib and the testa, the concentration gradient of mobile Cd in fermented cacao beans
389 may be the inverse of the total concentration gradient, a key speculation that requires further
390 validation.

391 **3.6. The influence of fermentation on other elements in cacao**

392 Apart from Cd, several other elements were analyzed by ICP-MS (Al, As, Ca, Co, Cr, Cu, K, Mg,
393 Mn, Mo, Ni, P, Pb and Zn) and the concentrations of most of these elements in each tissue (nib,
394 testa, mucilage) were correlated with fermentation time (Table S1 and Figures S8 I–X).
395 Concentrations of Al, As, Cr and Pb were <LOQ in relevant fractions of the nib samples (Al 98%,
396 As 80%, Cr 72% and Pb 93%), the testa samples (Pb 22%) or the mucilage samples (As 37%) and
397 were not further discussed. Fermentation had no significant effect on Mo in any of the cacao
398 tissues. Elemental concentrations in the nibs generally decreased while testa and mucilage
399 concentrations increased. The nib concentrations decreased in batches A and B for Cu (factor A
400 1.4, B 1.2), K (A 1.6, B 1.4), Mg (A 1.4, B 1.3), Mn (A and B 1.1), Ni (A 1.7, B 1.6) and P (A

401 1.04, B 1.4). No significant changes were observed in the nib elemental composition for batches
402 C and C_{bis} with the exception of a significant increase in nib Ni concentration in C_{bis} (factor 1.1).
403 The testa concentrations increased with fermentation in batches A and B for Cu (A 3.2, B 1.8), K
404 (A 2.8, B 2.6), Mg (A 4.4, B 2.9), Mn (A 3.1, B 3.0), Ni (A 3.9, B 3.4) and P (A 9.8, B). Calcium
405 was the only element that displayed a reverse change in concentration, nib Ca increased while testa
406 Ca decreased with fermentation time. The elemental concentrations in the mucilage generally
407 increased, which might be caused by microbial deterioration of the outer layers of the testa. If
408 present, this deterioration was not strong enough to cause a significant decrease in the testa weight
409 fraction with fermentation time. The testa weight fraction remained in the range 0.05–0.10
410 throughout fermentation in all batches. However, regardless of the minimal change in testa weight
411 fraction with fermentation, changes in the morphology of nib and testa may still be possible. To
412 confirm migration of the elements rather than changes in the morphology of the tissues during the
413 fermentation process, the elemental concentrations in each tissue (nib and testa) were multiplied
414 by the weight fraction of that tissue. The weight fraction corrected concentrations corroborated the
415 migration of aforementioned elements (Cu, K, Mg, Mn, Ni and P) from the nib to the testa in
416 batches A and B. The observed migration pattern of Ni might be of importance in the future
417 because the European Commission mentioned cacao based products among important food sources
418 of Ni in the European population (EFSA, 2015). Based on the similar behavior of Ni and Cd
419 observed in this work, post-harvest strategies to lower Cd concentrations in cacao during
420 fermentation will likely also be effective for Ni.

421 4. CONCLUSION

422 In unfermented cacao fruits, Cd concentrations are highest in the testa, followed by nibs, placenta
423 and pod husks which all contain similar Cd concentrations, and finally the mucilage. This study is

424 probably first to report the fate of Cd and its distribution in cacao tissues during fermentation.
425 Migration of Cd from the nibs to the testa was only observed if the nib pH dropped below 5. This
426 acidic pH resulted from longer fermentation times. More extensive fermentation can thus result in
427 lower Cd concentrations in the final product as the testa and mucilage are removed later in the
428 post-harvest process. After fermentation, nib Cd concentrations decreased by a factor 1.3,
429 indicating that fermentation may be useful to comply to the new Cd requirements ($0.60 \text{ mg Cd kg}^{-1}$
430 ¹) in cacao beans with initial unfermented nib Cd concentrations up to $0.78 \text{ mg Cd kg}^{-1}$. Further
431 work is required to assess the full potential of Cd migration from the nib to the testa during
432 fermentation. Nevertheless, it is often recommended to avoid very low nib pH as this can cause an
433 unpleasant acidic taste in the final product (De Vuyst & Weckx, 2015; Schwan & Wheals, 2004).
434 A balance must thus be found between flavor quality and Cd concentration. This acidic flavor is
435 the main reason for pre-drying practices and results confirmed that the nib pH in pre-dried cacao
436 decreased less extensively compared to the other fermentation experiments. Our results indicate
437 that pre-drying and short fermentation times may reduce the extent of outward Cd migration.

438

439 SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

440 The supplementary information includes a description of the preparation of XANES Cd reference
441 compounds, pictures of the mesh sample bags (Figure S1) and the cascade set-up (Figure S2) used
442 in the fermentation experiments, LA-ICP-MS imaging of both cacao bean cross-sections for ^{44}Ca ,
443 ^{114}Cd , ^{39}K , ^{31}P , ^{60}Ni and ^{64}Zn (Figures S3 and S4), XANES spectra for cacao tissue samples and
444 Cd reference compounds (Figure S5), weight fraction corrected Cd concentrations in nib and testa
445 throughout fermentation for all fermentation batches (Figure S6), Cd mass balances of the
446 fermentation experiments (Figure S7), Pearson correlation coefficients indicating the effect of
447 fermentation time on the elemental composition (Ca, Cd, Co, Cu, K, Mg, Mn, Mo, Ni, P and Zn)
448 of each cacao tissue (nib, testa and mucilage) (Table S1), and the effect of fermentation on the
449 elemental composition (Ca, Co, Cu, K, Mg, Mn, Mo, Ni, P and Zn) (Figures S8 I–X).

450

451 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

452 This research was financed by the Research Foundation Flanders (FWO-Vlaanderen). RV is the
453 recipient of a predoctoral fellowship from FWO-Vlaanderen. ED received funding from the
454 European Union Horizon 2020 research and innovation program under the Marie Skłodowska-
455 Curie grant agreement No. 795614. Aquitaine Region and Feder are acknowledged for the funding
456 of the laser ablation system from the Aquitrace project (convention number 20131206001-
457 13010973). We acknowledge the farmers in Ecuador who supplied their expertise and the cacao
458 material, and allowed us to use their fermentation facilities. We also thank prof. Enzo Lombi for
459 his help and expertise regarding the XANES work and the Australian Synchrotron Facility for
460 allocating beam time for this research.

461

462 REFERENCES

- 463 Abt, E., Sam, J. F., Gray, P., & Robin, L. P. (2018). Cadmium and lead in cocoa powder and
464 chocolate products in the US Market. *Food Additives & Contaminants: Part B*, 11(2), 92–
465 102. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19393210.2017.1420700>
- 466 Afoakwa, E. O. (2010). *Chocolate Science and Technology*. Chichester, UK: Wiley-Blackwell.
467 <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781444319880>
- 468 Argüello, D., Chavez, E., Laurysen, F., Vanderschueren, R., Smolders, E., & Montalvo, D.
469 (2019). Soil properties and agronomic factors affecting cadmium concentrations in cacao
470 beans: A nationwide survey in Ecuador. *Science of The Total Environment*, 649, 120–127.
471 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.08.292>
- 472 Beckett, S. T. (2008). *Industrial Chocolate Manufacture and Use*. Oxford, UK: Wiley-Blackwell.
473 <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781444301588>
- 474 Belitz, H. D., Grosch, W., & Schieberle, P. (2009). *Food Chemistry*. Berlin, Germany: Springer-
475 Verlag. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-540-69934-7>
- 476 Bertoldi, D., Barbero, A., Camin, F., Caligiani, A., & Larcher, R. (2016). Multielemental
477 fingerprinting and geographic traceability of Theobroma cacao beans and cocoa products.
478 *Food Control*, 65, 46–53. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2016.01.013>
- 479 Biehl, B., Meyer, B., Said, M. B., & Samarakoddy, R. J. (1990). Bean spreading: A method for
480 pulp preconditioning to impair strong nib acidification during cocoa fermentation in
481 Malaysia. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 51(1), 35–45.
482 <https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.2740510105>
- 483 Castillo-Michel, H. A., Hernandez, N., Martinez-Martinez, A., Parsons, J. G., Peralta-Videa, J. R.,
484 & Gardea-Torresdey, J. L. (2009). Coordination and speciation of cadmium in corn

485 seedlings and its effects on macro- and micronutrients uptake. *Plant Physiology and*
486 *Biochemistry*, 47, 608–614. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.plaphy.2009.02.005>

487 Chavez, E., He, Z. L., Stoffella, P. J., Mylavarapu, R. S., Li, Y. C., Moyano, B., & Baligar, V. C.
488 (2015). Concentration of cadmium in cacao beans and its relationship with soil cadmium
489 in southern Ecuador. *Science of the Total Environment*, 533, 205–214.
490 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.06.106>

491 Codex Alimentarius Commission. (2018) Report of the 12th session of the codex committee on
492 contaminants in foods. 41st session of the joint FAO/WHO food standards programme
493 codex alimentarius commission. Rome, Italy

494 De Vuyst, L., & Weckx, S. (2015). The Functional Role of Lactic Acid Bacteria in Cocoa Bean
495 Fermentation. In F. Mozzi, R. R. Raya, & G. M. Vignolo (Eds.), *Biotechnology of Lactic*
496 *Acid Bacteria: Novel Applications* (2nd ed., pp. 248–278).
497 <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118868386.ch16>

498 De Vuyst, L., & Weckx, S. (2016). The cocoa bean fermentation process: from ecosystem analysis
499 to starter culture development. *Journal of Applied Microbiology*, 121(1), 5–17.
500 <https://doi.org/10.1111/jam.13045>

501 EFSA. (2012). Cadmium dietary exposure in the European population. *EFSA Journal*, 10(1).
502 <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2012.2551>

503 EFSA (2015). Scientific opinion on the risks to public health related to the presence of nickel in
504 food and drinking water. *EFSA Journal*, 13(2). <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2015.4002>

505 European Commission. (2014). Commission Regulation (EU) No 488/2014 of 12 May 2014
506 amending Regulation (EC) No 1881/2006 as regards maximum levels of cadmium in
507 foodstuffs. *Official Journal of the European Union*.

508 Gramlich, A., Tandy, S., Gauggel, C., López, M., Perla, D., Gonzalez, V., & Schulin, R. (2018).
509 Soil cadmium uptake by cocoa in Honduras. *Science of the Total Environment*, 612, 370–
510 378. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.08.145>

511 Huguet, S., Bert, V., Laboudigue, A., Barthès, V., Isaure, MP., Llorens, I., Schat, H., & Sarret, G.
512 (2012). Cd speciation and localization in the hyperaccumulator *Arabidopsis halleri*.
513 *Environmental and Experimental Botany*, 82, 54–65.
514 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envexpbot.2012.03.011>

515 Isaure, MP., Fayard, B., Sarret, G., Pairis, S., & Bourguignon, J. (2006). Localization and chemical
516 forms of cadmium in plant samples by combining analytical electron microscopy and X-
517 ray spectromicroscopy. *Spectrochimica Acta – Part B*, 61, 1242–1252.
518 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sab.2006.10.009>

519 Isaure, MP., Huguet, S., Meyer, C., Castillo-Michel, H., Testemale, D., Vantelon, D., Saumitou-
520 Laprade, P., Verbruggen, N., & Sarret, G. (2015). Evidence of various mechanisms of Cd
521 sequestration in the hyperaccumulator *Arabidopsis halleri*, the non-accumulator
522 *Arabidopsis lyrata*, and their progenies by combined synchrotron-based techniques.
523 *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 66 (11), 3201–3214. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/erv131>

524 Lee, C. K., & Low, K. S. (1985). Determination of Cadmium, Lead, Copper and Arsenic in Raw
525 Cocoa, Semifinished and Finished Chocolate Products. *Pertanika*, 8(2), 243–248.

526 Lewis, C., Lennon, A. M., Eudoxie, G., & Umaharan, P. (2018). Genetic variation in
527 bioaccumulation and partitioning of cadmium in *Theobroma cacao* L. *Science of the Total*
528 *Environment*, 640–641, 696–703. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.05.365>

529 Lombi, E., Scheckel, K. G., Pallon, J., Carey, A. M., Zhu, Y. G., & Meharg, A. A. (2009).
530 Speciation and distribution of arsenic and localization of nutrients in rice grains. *New*
531 *Phytologist*, 184(1), 193–201. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2009.02912.x>

532 Meharg, A. A., Lombi, E., Williams, P. N., Scheckel, K. G., Feldmann, J., Raab, A., Zhu, Y., &
533 Islam, R. (2008). Speciation and distribution of arsenic and localization of nutrients in rice
534 grains. *New Phytologist*, 42(4), 1051–1057. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2009.02912.x)
535 [8137.2009.02912.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2009.02912.x)

536 Meunier, N., Laroulandie, J., Blais, J. F., & Tyagi, R. D. (2003). Cocoa shells for heavy metal
537 removal from acidic solutions. *Bioresource Technology*, 90, 255–263.
538 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0960-8524\(03\)00129-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0960-8524(03)00129-9)

539 Meyer, B., Biehl, B., Said, M. B., & Samarakoddy, R. J. (1989). Post-harvest pod storage: A
540 method for pulp preconditioning to impair strong nib acidification during cocoa
541 fermentation in Malaysia. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 48(3), 285–304.
542 <https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.2740480305>

543 Papalexandratou, Z., Vrancken, G., de Bruyne, K., Vandamme, P., & de Vuyst, L. (2011).
544 Spontaneous organic cocoa bean box fermentations in Brazil are characterized by a
545 restricted species diversity of lactic acid bacteria and acetic acid bacteria. *Food*
546 *Microbiology*, 28(7), 1326–1338. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2011.06.003>

547 Ramtahal, G., Yen, I. C., Bekele, I., Bekele, F., Wilson, L., Maharaj, K., & Harrynanan, L. (2016).
548 Relationships between Cadmium in Tissues of Cacao Trees and Soils in Plantations of
549 Trinidad and Tobago. *Food and Nutrition Sciences*, 07(01), 37–43.
550 <https://doi.org/10.4236/fns.2016.71005>

- 551 Ramtahal, G., Umaharan, P., Hanuman, A., Davis, C., & Ali, L. (2019). The effectiveness of soil
552 amendments, biochar and lime, in mitigating cadmium bioaccumulation in *Theobroma*
553 *cacao* L. *Science of the Total Environment*, 693.
554 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.07.369>
- 555 Ravel, B., & Newville, M. (2005). ATHENA, ARTEMIS, HEPHAESTUS: data analysis for X-
556 ray absorption spectroscopy using IFEFFIT. *Journal of Synchrotron Radiation*, 12, 537–
557 541. <https://doi.org/10.1107/S0909049505012719>
- 558 Schwan, R. F., & Wheals, A. E. (2004). The microbiology of cocoa fermentation and its role in
559 chocolate quality. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, 44(4), 205–221.
560 <https://doi.org/10.1080/10408690490464104>
- 561 Smolders, E., & Mertens, J. (2013). Heavy Metals in Soils. In B. J. Alloway (Ed.), *Heavy Metals*
562 *in Soils: Trace Metals and Metalloids in Soils and their Bioavailability* (pp. 283–311).
563 Dordrecht: Springer Science+Business Media. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-4470-7>
- 564 Thompson, S. S., Miller, K. B., & Lopez, A. S. (2007). Cocoa and Coffee. In M. P. Doyle & L. R.
565 Beuchat (Eds.), *Food Microbiology: Fundamentals and Frontiers* (3rd ed., pp. 837–850).
566 Washington DC: ASM Press.
- 567 Thyssen, G. M., Keil, C., Wolff, M., Sperling, M., Kadow, D., Haase, H., & Karst, U. (2018).
568 Bioimaging of the elemental distribution in cocoa beans by means of LA-ICP-TQMS.
569 *Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry*, 33, 187–194.
570 <https://doi.org/10.1039/C7JA00354D>
- 571 Vanderschueren, R., Montalvo, D., De Ketelaere, B., Delcour, J. A., & Smolders, E. (2019). The
572 elemental composition of chocolates is related to cacao content and origin: A multi-element

573 fingerprinting analysis of single origin chocolates. *Journal of Food Composition and*
574 *Analysis*, 83. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfca.2019.103277>

575 Villa, J. E. L., Peixoto, R. R. A., & Cadore, S. (2014). Cadmium and Lead in Chocolates
576 Commercialized in Brazil. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 62, 8759–8763.
577 <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf5026604>

578 Vogel-Mikuš, K., Pongrac, P., Kump, P., Nečemer, M., simčič, J., Pelicon, P., Budnar, M., Povh,
579 B., & Regvar, M. (2007). Localisation and quantification of elements within seeds of Cd/Zn
580 hyperaccumulator *Thlaspi praecox* by micro-PIXE. *Environmental Pollution*, 147, 50–59.
581 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2006.08.026>

582 World Health Organization. (2010). Exposure to cadmium: a major public health concern.
583 Preventing Disease Through Healthy Environments.
584 <http://www.who.int/ipcs/features/cadmium.pdf/> Accessed 18 April 2019.

585 Yanus, R. L., Sela, H., Borojovich, E. J. C., Zakon, Y., Saphier, M., Nikolski, A., Gutflais, E.,
586 Lorber, A., & Karpas, Z. (2014). Trace elements in cocoa solids and chocolate: An ICPMS
587 study. *Talanta*, 119, 1–4. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.talanta.2013.10.048>

588 Zhai, Q., Guo, Y., Tang, X., Tian, F., Zhao, J., Zhang, H., & Chen, W. (2019). Removal of
589 cadmium from rice by *Lactobacillus plantarum* fermentation. *Food Control*, 96(1800),
590 357–364. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2018.09.029>

591 Zhang, L., Lei, Q., Cheng, Y., Xie, Y., Qian, H., Guo, Y., Chen, Y., & Yao, W. (2017). Study on
592 the Removal of Cadmium in Rice Using Microbial Fermentation Method. *Journal of Food*
593 *Science*, 82(6), 1467–1474. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1750-3841.13734>