Magmatic evolution biases basaltic records of mantle chemistry towards melts from recycled sources

David A. Neave^{a,b,*}, Olivier Namur^c, Oliver Shorttle^{d,e}, François Holtz^b

^a*School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, The University of Manchester, Oxford Road, Manchester, M13 9PL, United Kingdom*

^b*Leibniz Universität Hannover, Institut für Mineralogie, Callinstrasse 3, 30167 Hannover, Germany*

^c*Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, KU Leuven, Celestijnenlaan 200e, 3001 Leuven, Belgium*

^d*Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, Downing Street, Cambridge, CB2 3EQ, United Kingdom*

^e*Institute of Astronomy, University of Cambridge, Madingley Road, Cambridge, CB3 0HA, United Kingdom*

Abstract

The chemistry of erupted magmas provides a crucial window into the composition and structure of Earth’s convecting mantle. However, magmatic evolution in the crust makes it challenging to reconstruct mantle properties from volcanic rocks in important but incompletely understood ways. Here we investigate how mantle-derived compositional variability in primary oceanic basalts determines their phase equilibria relations and the nature of the geochemical signals they record. By performing experiments on synthetic analogues of compositionally extreme primitive lavas from the Reykjanes Peninsula of Iceland at realistic magma storage conditions (300 MPa, 1140–1260 °C), we show that melts from enriched mantle domains retain higher melt fractions as they cool than those generated by melting of typical fertile lherzolite (i.e. they crystallise less mass over any interval of decreasing temperature). These melt fraction differences arise because plagioclase crystallisation is suppressed in Na- and H₂O-rich but Ca- and Al-poor liquids derived from enriched source lithologies. Thus, compositional characteristics inherited from the mantle have a first-order control on the efficiency with which cooling basalts crystallise. This means that enriched melts will be more likely to survive crustal processing than depleted melts. Basalt chemistry will therefore be disproportionately influenced by melts from volumetrically minor enriched lithologies compared with melts from the upper mantle’s most common lithology, lherzolite,

systematically biasing basaltic records towards melts from recycled mantle sources.

We combine our experimental observations from Iceland with thermodynamic simulations on mid-ocean ridge basalt compositions and show that mantle-derived variability in crystallisation efficiency can explain two enigmatic features of the global oceanic basalt record: firstly, the anomalous over-enrichment of incompatible elements during the differentiation of mid-ocean ridge basalts, which may reflect a progressive bias towards enriched compositions as differentiation proceeds; and secondly, the frequently documented cargoes of highly anorthitic plagioclase crystals carried by evolved and enriched liquids from which they cannot have crystallised. These crystals can now be understood as the solidified remnants of depleted, lherzolite-derived melts that have been entrained into melt mixtures from more enriched sources. Increases in the degree of enrichment of cumulate rocks sampled from progressively shallower horizons of the oceanic crust can also be interpreted in terms of enriched melts surviving crustal processing in preference to depleted melts.

Keywords: magmatic evolution, basalt phase equilibria, mantle heterogeneity, geochemical variability, Iceland, MORB

1. Introduction

Volcanism at mid-ocean ridges and ocean islands provides an avenue for investigating the present-day diversity and spatial distribution of chemical heterogeneity in Earth's convecting mantle (Schilling, 1973; Dupré and Allègre, 1983; Zindler and Hart, 1986), complementing observations on mantle rocks that have been exhumed over longer timescales (e.g., Dick et al., 1984; Johnson et al., 1990; Warren, 2016). A key realisation over past decades has been that much of the mantle's geochemical variability can be linked to recycling, whereby the subduction of oceanic lithosphere into the Earth's deep interior has produced chemically distinct reservoirs that have survived convective stirring over billion-year timescales (Chase, 1981; Hofmann and White, 1982; Hofmann, 1997; Stracke, 2012). This paradigm has been

*School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, The University of Manchester, Oxford Road, Manchester, M13 9PL, United Kingdom

Email address: david.neave@manchester.ac.uk (David A. Neave)

established in part with observations on oceanic basalts from densely sampled regions such as Hawaii and Iceland where correlations between isotopic, trace-element and major-element markers of enrichment are thought to reflect the involvement of recycled and lithologically distinct mantle domains in melt generation (Hauri, 1996; Shorttle and MacLennan, 2011). Indeed, it has been shown that lithological variability in the mantle expands the diversity of possible primary melt compositions considerably (Hirschmann and Stolper, 1996; Kogiso et al., 1998; Shorttle et al., 2014; Jennings et al., 2016).

Despite the now abundant evidence for lithological heterogeneity in the mantle, deriving quantitative estimates of mantle source mineralogies from basalt records is a major challenge. One reason for this is the well-documented bias that enriched, recycled mantle sources with high clinopyroxene contents have lower solidus temperatures and higher fusibilities than fertile lherzolites (e.g., Hirschmann and Stolper, 1996; Phipps Morgan, 2001), which must be accounted for when estimating mass fractions of recycled material in basalt source regions (Shorttle et al., 2014; Brown and Lesher, 2014). Moreover, enriched sources, which are often but not exclusively associated with ocean island magmatism, are also more hydrous than their depleted equivalents, further enhancing their fusibility (Wallace, 1998; Asimow and Langmuir, 2003). However, the impacts of variable source composition and fusibility on the evolution and compositional systematics of oceanic basalts remain to be investigated. In particular, the effects of mantle-derived compositional variability and primary melt diversity on the crystallisation efficiency (i.e. mass of crystals produced for any given amount of cooling) and hence survivability of primitive basalts during transport to the surface are poorly understood. This is despite long-standing observations that almost all basalts have experienced some compositional modification *en route* to the surface and that truly primary magmas are exceedingly rare in the rock record (O'Hara, 1968). Characterising rates of mass loss from compositionally distinct basaltic melts undergoing cooling and crystallisation is thus critical if we are to relate chemical variability observed at the surface to chemical and lithological heterogeneities in the mantle.

Phase equilibria experiments performed on oceanic basalts have typically focussed on compositionally uniform model systems or somewhat evolved systems that represent the

40 mixed derivatives of initially more diverse primary melts (e.g., Grove and Bryan, 1983;
 41 Elthon and Scarfe, 1984; Grove et al., 1992; Villiger et al., 2007; Feig et al., 2010). As a
 42 consequence, the different mass loss rates experienced by cooling primary melts with differ-
 43 ent compositions remains unquantified. A more detailed understanding of phase equilibria
 44 relations in mafic magmas is thus required. Here we use new experiments on synthetic ana-
 45 logues of compositionally extreme primitive basalts from Iceland’s Reykjanes Peninsula to
 46 demonstrate how the evolution paths and crystallisation efficiencies of cooling magmas are
 47 controlled by the geochemical characteristics they inherit from the mantle. We then com-
 48 bine our observations on Icelandic systems with thermodynamic simulations to illustrate
 49 how records of mantle chemistry preserved in basalts from Iceland and mid-ocean ridges
 50 may be biased towards those carried by melts from recycled mantle sources.

51 **2. Starting compositions**

52 The abundance of primitive lavas on the Reykjanes Peninsula of Iceland makes it an
 53 excellent location for studying the generation and evolution of oceanic basalts (Jakobsson
 54 et al., 1978). In particular, the Háleyjabunga and Stapafell lavas comprise some of the
 55 most geochemically different basalts known from Iceland in terms of their isotopic and in-
 56 compatible trace element (ITE) compositions, and have proven formative in understanding
 57 melting processes and the lengthscales of mantle heterogeneity (Fig. 1; Gurenko and Chaus-
 58 sidon, 1995; MacLennan, 2008b). Indeed, these lavas are thought to have been derived from
 59 lithologically distinct mantle domains, with the ITE-depleted Háleyjabunga lava resulting
 60 from high-degree melting of an initially fertile lherzolite and the ITE-enriched Stapafell lava
 61 resulting from modest-degree melting of a recycled and modally enriched (i.e. clinopyroxene-
 62 rich) peridotite, sometimes referred to, *sensu lato*, as pyroxenite (Shorttle and MacLennan,
 63 2011; Neave et al., 2018). Central to this interpretation is the recognition that the Fe- and
 64 Na-rich but Ca- and Al-poor Stapafell lava could not have been generated by melting a
 65 fertile lherzolite, while the Fe- and Na-poor but Ca- and Al-rich Háleyjabunga lava could
 66 (Shorttle and MacLennan, 2011). Háleyjabunga and Stapafell, which we shall consider as
 67 depleted and enriched end-members throughout, therefore represent ideal systems for isolat-

ing and evaluating the effects of mantle-derived compositional variability on the evolution of primitive basalts.

Prior to synthesising starting materials based on lava compositions, the Stapafell matrix glass composition was corrected to a similar melt MgO content as the Háleyjabunga matrix glass composition (Condomines et al., 1983; Gurenko and Chaussidon, 1995; Peate et al., 2009). Although primary melt MgO contents can vary substantially with melting depth, melting degree and source composition (e.g., Kinzler and Grove, 1992; Hirose and Kushiro, 1993; Kogiso et al., 1998; Jennings et al., 2016), we sought to minimise initial MgO variability in our starting glasses in order to test whether melt MgO content is a robust index of magmatic differentiation. This is important because many models of basalt petrogenesis assume that melt MgO content and many other commonly used differentiation indices such as magnesium number (Mg#, where $\text{Mg\#} = \text{molar Mg}/(\text{Mg} + \text{Fe}^{2+})$) are simply related to the fractions of melt remaining in evolving systems (e.g., O'Neill and Jenner, 2012; Coogan and O'Hara, 2015). Given that olivine dominates the mineral assemblage in both lavas (Neave et al., 2018), the correction was performed by adding equilibrium olivine to the mean Stapafell matrix glass composition with the Petrolog3 software package until a melt MgO content of ~ 10.5 wt.% was achieved (Danyushevsky and Plechov, 2011; Herzberg and O'Hara, 2002). This resulted in Mg# values of 0.73 and 0.67 for Háleyjabunga and Stapafell respectively when assuming a ferric-to-total iron ($\text{Fe}^{3+}/\Sigma\text{Fe}$) ratio of ~ 0.14 (Shorttle et al., 2015). We also note that correcting matrix glasses to be in equilibrium with the most primitive olivines in each lava ($X_{\text{Fo}} = 91$ and 88 for Háleyjabunga and Stapafell respectively, where $X_{\text{Fo}} = \text{molar Mg}/(\text{Mg} + \text{Fe})$) would simply lengthen the interval of olivine-only crystallisation experienced by the depleted Háleyjabunga composition with respect to that experienced by the enriched Stapafell composition (Fig. A.1; Neave et al., 2018). This would have only second-order effects on the results and interpretations presented below.

3. Methods

3.1. Experimental methods

Experimental starting materials were synthesised from reagent-grade oxide and carbonate powders that were mixed in acetone, dried and then ground in an agate mortar to ensure compositional homogeneity. Ground powders were subsequently melted twice in large-volume Pt crucibles at the Institut für Mineralogie of the Leibniz Universität Hannover, Germany. Each one-hour melting run was performed in air at 1600 °C. Fused powders were quenched after each run by pouring them onto a clean brass plate and then placing crucibles containing any remaining melt into a bath of H₂O. After being checked for signs of quench crystallisation, glassy starting materials were powdered in an agate disc mill.

Crystallisation experiments were then performed in an internally heated pressure vessel at the Institut für Mineralogie of the Leibniz Universität Hannover, Germany. Two suites of equilibrium crystallisation experiments were carried out in graphite-Pt double capsules and Fe-presaturated Au₈₀Pd₂₀ capsules to investigate crystallisation under nominally dry (initial H₂O ~ 0.1 wt.%) and low-H₂O (initial H₂O ~ 0.4 wt.%) conditions respectively (e.g., Husen et al., 2016). These H₂O contents were selected to be as close as experimentally feasible to those expected in the Háleyjabunga and Stapafell melts, 0.03–0.04 and 0.4–0.5 wt.% respectively based on reported Ce contents and nominal H₂O/Ce values of 180–250 (Gurenko and Chaussidon, 1995; Peate et al., 2009; Hartley et al., 2015; Bali et al., 2018). Oxygen fugacity (f_{O_2}) conditions were expected to be close to the carbon-carbon dioxide (CCO) redox buffer for the nominally dry experiments and approximately one log unit above the quartz-fayalite-magnetite (QFM) buffer for the low-H₂O experiments (e.g., Husen et al., 2016). Although our approach conflates f_{O_2} with melt H₂O content, the effects of variable H₂O on mineral-liquid equilibria are expected to overshadow those of variable f_{O_2} within the oxide-free region of phase space examined here (Feig et al., 2010). Further experiments were carried out using starting materials synthesised using glass compositions produced during low-H₂O experiments at 1200 °C in order to mimic fractional crystallisation (e.g., Villiger et al., 2007).

Experiments were performed at 300 MPa and 1140–1260 °C to reproduce the dominant conditions of magmatic differentiation beneath Icelandic rift zones (Neave and Putirka, 2017). These conditions also approach those experienced during mid ocean ridge basalt (MORB) petrogenesis (e.g., Grove et al., 1992), and offer vital insights into wider basalt phase equilibria relations at little-explored crustal pressure (P) conditions. Importantly, experiments on both Háleyjabunga and Stapafell starting glasses were performed simultaneously to ensure that differences in experimental run products at any given set conditions reflect compositional effects alone. Further details about experimental methods and f_{O_2} conditions are provided in Appendix A.

3.2. Analytical methods

Experimental products (including capsules) were mounted in epoxy resin, polished and carbon coated for measurement by electron probe microanalysis (EPMA) with a Cameca SX100 instrument at the Institut für Mineralogie of the Leibniz Universität Hannover, Germany. To ensure internal consistency across multiple sessions, analyses were normalised to repeat measurements of appropriate Smithsonian Microbeam Standards (Jarosewich et al., 1980). Accuracy and precision were monitored by measuring additional Smithsonian Microbeam Standards (Jarosewich et al., 1980, 1987). Major (>1 wt.%) and minor (<1 wt.%) elements were determined with accuracies better than 2% and 10%, and 1σ precisions better than 1% and 15% respectively. In addition, the H_2O content of superliquidus glasses was determined by Fourier-transform infrared (FTIR) spectroscopy with a Bruker IFS88 instrument, also at the Institut für Mineralogie of the Leibniz Universität Hannover, Germany. Typical analyses of standards are provided alongside analyses of experimental products in the Supplementary Material and more information about analytical methods is provided in Appendix A.

4. Equilibrium phase relations

The experimental phase relations we observe depend on the major-element chemistry of the starting materials and the melt H_2O contents that evolve during the experiments

(Figs. 2 and 3). Experiments on the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue are characterised
 by the following order of crystallisation: olivine $\pm$ Cr-spinel, olivine + plagioclase, olivine
 + plagioclase + clinopyroxene (Figs. 2a, 3a, 3c and 3e). Low-Ca pyroxene then joins the
 crystallising assemblage in low-H₂O experiments. In contrast, experiments on the enriched
 Stapafell analogue are characterised by the appearance of clinopyroxene before plagioclase,
 resulting in a different order of crystallisation: olivine $\pm$ Cr-spinel, olivine + clinopyroxene,
 olivine + clinopyroxene + plagioclase (Figs. 2b, 3b, 3d and 3f). Again, low-Ca pyroxene
 then joins the crystallising assemblage in low-H₂O experiments. The difference in major
 element chemistry between our two starting compositions thus translates to a difference in
 plagioclase liquidus temperature (T) of >40 °C in the presence of ~ 0.5 wt.% H₂O and >20
 °C under nominally dry conditions. Experiments on simple systems provide a first-order
 explanation for these differences in plagioclase stability. Refractory melts rich in Ca and
 Al (like our depleted Háleyjabunga analogue) lie closer to low-variance cotectics bordering
 the plagioclase primary phase field than melts rich in Na and Fe (like our enriched Stapafell
 analogue) because of their higher normative anorthite contents (e.g., Presnall et al., 1978).
 Refractory melts therefore reach multiple saturation at relatively higher temperatures than
 enriched melts (Supplementary Fig. A.2). Although the products of our nominally dry
 experiments show similar orders of phase appearance to those of our low-H₂O experiments,
 olivine and plagioclase liquids are suppressed by 20–40 °C in the presence of ~ 0.5 wt.% H₂O,
 in line with previous observations (e.g., Almeev et al., 2007, 2012; Médard and Grove, 2008);
 within the thermal resolution of our experimental approach (20 °C), clinopyroxene stability
 appears to be unaffected by small amounts of H₂O (Fig. 3). Cr-spinel and low-Ca pyroxene
 only occur in the highest- and lowest- T experiments performed under low-H₂O conditions
 respectively.

Differences in cumulative crystal assemblages between the products of equilibrium and
 near-fractional crystallisation experiments are modest until high degrees of crystallisation are
 attained (Figs. 3a–3d). For example, summing the crystal fractions produced at 1200 and
 1180 °C in our near-fractional crystallisation experiments results in an assemblage similar
 to that generated at 1180 °C in our equilibrium experiments. Crystal assemblages only

diverge significantly in the case of the low-H₂O experiment on the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue at 1140 °C, in which significant amounts of low-Ca pyroxene were produced at the expense of olivine via the forsterite + SiO₂ $\rightleftharpoons$ enstatite peritectic reaction in the case of the equilibrium crystallisation experiment (Fig. 3a). Our equilibrium and near-fractional crystallisation experiments nonetheless capture the same first-order phase relations, meaning that equilibrium experiments can be used to inform our understanding of natural systems evolving by primarily fractional processes (e.g., Melekhova et al., 2013).

5. Melt compositions and melt fraction evolution trends

Residual melts produced during the crystallisation of the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue evolve along compositional trajectories distinct from those produced during the crystallisation of the enriched Stapafell analogue (Fig. 4; Supplementary Figs. A.3 and A.4). For example, the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue preserves a relative enrichment in Al until both of the compositional systems investigated are saturated in olivine, plagioclase and clinopyroxene (Figs. 4a and 4c). It also maintains higher Ca/Na values (expressed throughout as molar ratios) across the whole T range explored (Figs. 4b and 4d), though the higher- T saturation of plagioclase in depleted systems drives some convergence in major-element characteristics.

The products of experiments on the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue contain consistently less melt (i.e. quenched glass) at any given T or melt MgO content than those from experiments on the enriched Stapafell analogue, even though both starting compositions have similar liquidus (i.e. olivine saturation) temperatures at any given melt H₂O content (Figs. 3 and 5). For example, melt makes up only ~ 20 wt.% of the products of the experiment using the depleted starting composition under low-H₂O conditions at 1140 °C (i.e. melt fraction (F) ~ 0.2), while it constitutes ~ 50 wt.% of the products of the experiment using the enriched starting composition ($F \sim 0.5$). A similar relationship observed in the products of nominally dry experiments is simply offset to higher temperatures: at 1140 °C, the products of experiments on the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue contain only trace melt ($F \sim 0$), whereas the products of experiments on the enriched Stapafell analogue still contain an ap-

205 preciable ~ 20 wt.% melt ($F \sim 0.2$). Despite being unable to reproduce our experimentally
 206 derived MgO– F trends in detail, thermodynamic simulations with the MELTS algorithm
 207 (performed using the alphaMELTS frontend) nonetheless highlight the important control
 208 that primary melt compositions exert on the efficiency with which magmas crystallise as
 209 they cool (Fig. 5; Ghiorso and Sack, 1995; Smith and Asimow, 2005). Such calculations
 210 also reveal that depleted melts release considerably more heat per unit mass of initially sup-
 211 plied melt (expressed here as the cumulative enthalpy of fusion; $\Sigma[\Delta H_{\text{fus}}]$ (J/g)) during their
 212 early differentiation (MgO > 7.5 wt.%; $T > 1200$ °C) than enriched melts, largely because
 213 of the considerable latent heat release associated with early plagioclase saturation (Fig. 6;
 214 Ghiorso, 1997; Namur et al., 2014; Shorttle et al., 2016). Thus, the latent heat released
 215 by the crystallisation of depleted melts may potentially thermally buffer and hence prevent
 216 the crystallisation of spatially associated enriched melts within long-lived mush columns or
 217 magma plumbing systems.

218 **6. The geochemical consequences of variable crystallisation efficiency**

219 In the previous two sections we have demonstrated that the efficiency with which cooling
 220 basalts crystallise is determined by their major element and H₂O contents, independently
 221 or in concert (Fig. 5). However, observations on natural oceanic basalts indicate that vari-
 222 ability in major elements and H₂O is likely to be correlated (e.g., Michael and Chase, 1987;
 223 Michael, 1995). Indeed, particularly close relationships between H₂O contents, ITE enrich-
 224 ment and major element compositions have been identified in Icelandic basalts (Shorttle and
 225 MacLennan, 2011; Hartley et al., 2015): ITE-depleted systems like Háleyjabunga are not only
 226 poor in Na and Fe but they are also poor in H₂O, whereas Na-, Fe- and ITE-rich systems
 227 like Stapafell are correspondingly rich in H₂O. Therefore, in the following discussions we
 228 compare nominally dry experiments on the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue with low-H₂O
 229 experiments on the enriched Stapafell analogue – these suites of experiments best represent
 230 the poles of geochemical variability present in southwest Iceland.

6.1. Incompatible trace element systematics in basalts

In their study of MORB compositional systematics, O'Neill and Jenner (2012) argued that the ITE content of glasses related by fractional crystallisation should lie along straight lines in $\text{MgO}-\log_{10}(\text{ITE})$ space because of the form of the Rayleigh equation,

$$\log_{10}([\text{ITE}]/[\text{ITE}]_i) = (D_{\text{ITE}} - 1)\log_{10}(F), \quad (1)$$

where $[\text{ITE}]_i$ is the initial ITE content and D_{ITE} is a bulk solid-liquid partition coefficient, and the apparent linear dependence of $\log_{10}(F)$ on melt MgO content (in wt.%) in MORB systems,

$$\log_{10}(F) = 1.245 + 10.132[\text{MgO}]. \quad (2)$$

ITE evolution trajectories calculated for our Icelandic end-members using the approach and partition coefficients of O'Neill and Jenner (2012) and published ITE contents define parallel linear trends separated by the degree of ITE enrichment inherited from the mantle (Fig. 7; Condomines et al., 1983; Gurenko and Chaussidon, 1995; Peate et al., 2009). These trends account for little of the variability present in natural data. However, our experimental findings show that $\text{MgO}-F$, and hence $\text{MgO}-\log_{10}(\text{ITE})$, relationships must be evaluated individually for different primary melt compositions; melt MgO content is not a unique index of magmatic differentiation. Specifically, the products of low- H_2O experiments on the enriched Stapafell analogue retain high melt fractions ($F \sim 0.5$) to low melt MgO contents (~ 6 wt.%), while only trace amounts of melt ($F \sim 0$) remain at comparable melt MgO contents in the products of nominally dry experiments on the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue (Figs. 5a and 5b). We thus produced independent parametrisations of F 's dependence on melt MgO content for our two end-member systems in order to quantify the effects of primary geochemical variability on the evolution of basalt ITE contents. In contrast with O'Neill and Jenner (2012), we fitted our experimental data with error functions because they capture the $F = 1$ asymptotes at high melt MgO contents and the transitions to high crystallisation efficiencies after plagioclase saturation better than simple log-linear relationships (Supplementary Fig. A.5).

ITE evolution paths calculated using our variable MgO– F relationships differ from those predicted with the MgO– F relationship of O’Neill and Jenner (2012) (Equation 2) in three important ways (Fig 7a): firstly, the rates at which ITEs become enriched (i.e. distilled and concentrated) by fractional crystallisation differ greatly between the two end-member systems; secondly, fractional crystallisation of the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue results in a higher rate of ITE enrichment for any given drop in melt MgO content than predicted by O’Neill and Jenner (2012), especially once melt MgO contents decrease below ~ 8 wt.%; and thirdly, fractional crystallisation of the enriched Stapafell analogue results in a lower rate of ITE enrichment than predicted by O’Neill and Jenner (2012). Differences in crystallisation efficiency are thus potentially capable of exerting a considerable influence over the compositional systematics of natural basalts. For example, the apparent lack of progressive ITE enrichment during the differentiation of enriched magmas may reflect the fact that they retain high melt fractions ($F > 0.8$) to well below 8 wt.% MgO meaning that ITE concentrations will increase only modestly during early stages of differentiation.

Low-MgO magmas from southwest Iceland are enriched in ITEs with respect to most spatially associated high-MgO magmas (Fig. 7a). This absence of low-MgO, low-ITE compositions could be interpreted as evidence for the ITE content of residual depleted melts being driven up to levels comparable with those present in enriched melts by efficient crystallisation. However, if such residua existed in the erupted record, they would be readily identified from their ITE ratios or isotopic compositions (Fig. 7b; Shorttle et al., 2014). Indeed, magma mixing has been frequently invoked as a mechanism for erasing such signals of ITE depletion from evolving liquids (MacLennan, 2008a; Shorttle et al., 2016). Namely, progressive decreases in the ITE variability of olivine-hosted melt inclusion populations as a function of decreasing host X_{Fo} have been taken as evidence for concurrent mixing and crystallisation of initially variable melts (MacLennan, 2008a; Neave et al., 2013). Comparable observations have also been made on glass and whole-rock data, in which the most significant decrease in ITE variability occurs between ~ 9.5 and ~ 8.0 wt.% MgO (Shorttle et al., 2014), with this window being potentially wider still in MORB systems (Shorttle, 2015). This window of melt MgO contents coincides with the interval over which differences

285 between MgO– F relationships develop in our experimental dataset (Figs. 5 and 6). It is
286 thus feasible that primitive melts remain unmixed over sufficiently long intervals of cooling
287 that variations in crystallisation efficiency can influence their ITE systematics as discussed
288 below (Figs. 7 and 8).

289 6.2. *Crystal cargoes*

290 The crystal cargoes of some Icelandic basalts demonstrate that primitive melts can un-
291 dergo significant crystallisation before mantle-derived compositional variability is erased
292 by mixing. For example, high-Mg# clinopyroxene crystals from the Borgarhraun lava
293 in north Iceland record crystallisation from systematically more depleted melts than co-
294 erupted olivine-hosted melt inclusions (Winpenny and MacLennan, 2011). High-anorthite
295 (X_{An} , where X_{An} = molar Ca/(Ca + Na + K)) plagioclase crystals from numerous lavas
296 and tephras in Iceland’s Eastern Volcanic Zone preserve comparable signals of crystallisation
297 from liquids more depleted than those which carried them to the surface (Halldórsson et al.,
298 2008; Neave et al., 2014, 2015). When combined with the recognition that depleted prim-
299 itive lavas can avoid interactions with other melts during ascent (Hartley and MacLennan,
300 2018; MacLennan, 2019), these observations on crystals indicate that end-member primi-
301 tive melts probably undergo sufficient isolated differentiation for variations in crystallisation
302 behaviour to affect the compositional systematics of their differentiates. However, unam-
303 biguously separating the effects of mixing from the effects of phase equilibria variability is
304 challenging because they produce similar elemental signals in the rock record. Tracking the
305 isotopic evolution of seemingly cogenetic melts and melt inclusions in detail will be needed
306 to provide clarity here (cf. Shorttle et al., 2014; Shorttle, 2015).

307 6.3. *Geochemical stratification of the crust*

308 The high crystallisation efficiency of depleted basalts does not only result in high ITE
309 contents at low melt MgO contents (Fig. 7a). It also means that depleted basalts approach
310 their solidi at temperatures where other basalts maintain appreciable melt fractions (Figs. 5c
311 and 5d). Although our experimental approach overlooks important dynamical considerations

312 like melt segregation (e.g., Wager et al., 1960), it suggests that depleted evolved melts which
 313 escape mixing would become volumetrically diminished to the point that they would either
 314 freeze in the crust or leave almost no geochemical trace when mixed into other magmas.
 315 In contrast, their enriched counterparts will persist. In other words, for any given thermal
 316 structure imposed by conductive and hydrothermal cooling of the crust, enriched melts in
 317 thermal equilibrium with their surroundings will penetrate in greater volumes to shallower
 318 depths than depleted melts. The mantle-derived geochemical properties of Icelandic basalts
 319 thus exert fundamental controls on their abilities to survive crustal processing and make it
 320 to the surface where they can be sampled.

321 **7. Biasing basalt compositions towards melts from enriched sources**

322 Much of the variability in primitive basalts supplied to the base of Icelandic crust can
 323 be described in terms of mixing between hypothetical depleted and enriched end-members,
 324 broadly comparable with the Háleyjabunga and Stapafell lavas respectively (MacLennan,
 325 2008a,b). Given that these end-members represent melts from distinct mantle sources
 326 (Shorttle and MacLennan, 2011; Neave et al., 2018), basaltic liquids can thus be expressed
 327 in terms of the fraction of their mass derived from enriched sources (X_e) whereby $X_e = 0$
 328 corresponds to the depleted Háleyjabunga end-member and $X_e = 1$ to the enriched Stapafell
 329 end-member. However, our experimental findings suggest that the apparent X_e of a suite of
 330 variably evolved basalts will not just be sensitive to the mean X_e originating in the mantle,
 331 but also the variable survivability of chemically distinct primitive melts. Specifically, for
 332 any initial combination of primitive enriched and depleted end-member melts entering a
 333 magmatic plumbing system ($[X_e]_i$) and differentiating in isolation of each other, the mean
 334 value of X_e in the system increases with decreasing melt MgO content and T (Figs. 8a and
 335 8b). The rate at which X_e changes depends largely on two properties: the initial value of
 336 $[X_e]_i$ and the difference between end-member MgO– F and T – F relationships. In the case
 337 of the former, low- $[X_e]_i$ systems experience proportionally more enrichment than high- $[X_e]_i$
 338 systems. In the case of the latter, relative enrichments are considerable if the effects of
 339 major-element and H₂O variability on MgO– F and T – F systematics are correlated; shifts

in X_e are more modest if they are driven by differences either in major-element or H_2O contents alone.

Projecting MgO – X_e paths into MgO – La and MgO – La/Yb spaces shows that bulk trends in natural Icelandic data can be broadly reproduced by the independent differentiation, eruption and sampling of primitive melts with a $[X_e]_i$ value close to ~ 0.3 (Figs. 8c and 8d). Although end-member melts are unlikely to differentiate wholly independently in nature (MacLennan, 2008a), it should be noted that the differing crystallisation efficiencies of variably enriched primitive melts can both elevate average ITE contents and fractionate some ITE ratios in large datasets. However, comparable projections into MgO – Nb/Zr space are unable to account for the variability present in natural Icelandic data because end-member Zr contents are more fractionated from each other than their Yb contents. (Supplementary Figs. A.6 and A.7). The simple calculations presented in Fig. 8 nevertheless demonstrate that the preferential survival of melts from lithologically enriched source domains can bias chemical proxies that are commonly used to invert magma compositions for melting conditions and source characteristics (Shorttle and MacLennan, 2011; Gale et al., 2014). Hence, the contribution of recycled material to basalt genesis may be overestimated by methods that rely on correcting differentiated compositions for the effects of fractional crystallisation or that use the ITE systematics of evolved melts to estimate the mean properties of unmixed primary melts (e.g., Till et al., 2012; Shorttle et al., 2014). Our findings thus reinforce the importance of using primitive ($MgO > 9$ wt.%), plagioclase undersaturated basalts to investigate mantle properties and melting behaviour.

8. Variable crystallisation efficiency in mid-ocean ridge basalts

Geochemical variability is particularly well defined in Iceland, making it an excellent location for investigating the evolution of compositionally distinct primitive magmas. However, differences in crystallisation efficiency could arise in any setting where primary melts have variable major-element or H_2O contents. For example, neither melting processes nor source characteristics are uniform throughout the global mid-ocean ridge system, resulting in considerable heterogeneity in primary MORB compositions (Klein and Langmuir, 1987;

368 Kinzler and Grove, 1992; Gale et al., 2014; O'Neill and Jenner, 2016). Primitive MORB
 369 glass compositions from the global database of Gale et al. (2013) show considerable vari-
 370 ability in Al_2O_3 contents and Ca/Na values, 14–18 wt.% and 2–4 respectively, at a constant
 371 MgO content of ~ 9 wt.% (Fig. 9a and 9b). Similar degrees of compositional heterogeneity
 372 have also been resolved in regional studies on the Pacific Ocean (Michael and Chase, 1987),
 373 where primary depletions in Ca and Al have been linked with enrichments in ITE and H_2O
 374 contents, defining a pattern of correlated geochemical variability similar to that observed in
 375 Iceland (Shorttle and MacLennan, 2011; Hartley et al., 2015). However, simply extending
 376 the findings of our experiments on Icelandic systems to MORB systems is hampered by spa-
 377 tial variations in geochemical systematics along the mid-ocean ridge system (e.g., Schilling,
 378 1973; Dupré and Allègre, 1983). We therefore used calculations with the MELTS algorithm
 379 (performed using the alphaMELTS frontend) to explore whether MORB systems could be
 380 affected by differences in crystallisation efficiency comparable to those observed in our model
 381 systems from Iceland (Ghiorso and Sack, 1995; Smith and Asimow, 2005).

382 *8.1. Incompatible trace element over-enrichment in MORB*

383 Calculations with the MELTS algorithm capture the first-order T – F – X trends in our
 384 experimental dataset (Fig. 5). That is, although MELTS simulations typically underesti-
 385 mate absolute differences in F evolution between end-member systems, the key experimental
 386 observation that depleted primitive melts crystallise more efficiently than enriched primitive
 387 melts is reproduced, even if the effects on ITE systematics are somewhat muted (Supple-
 388 mentary Fig. A.8). We thus investigated the T – F – X evolution of geochemically variable
 389 primitive MORB compositions by performing fractional crystallisation simulations for all
 390 the near-primary glass compositions (i.e. >9 wt.%) in the Gale et al. (2013) database for
 391 which ITE analyses were reported. For simplicity and internal consistency, all calculations
 392 were performed at 150 MPa and an f_{O_2} buffered at QFM–0.2 (Sinton and Detrick, 1992;
 393 Zhang et al., 2018). Although the degree of H_2O enrichment in MORB varies spatially along
 394 the mid-ocean ridge system (Michael, 1995), we approximated melt H_2O contents from their
 395 Ce contents using a fixed $\text{H}_2\text{O}/\text{Ce}$ of 200. Melt ITE contents were modelled with parti-

tion coefficients implemented in the alphaMELTS software (McKenzie and O’Nions, 1991; Blundy and Wood, 1994; McKenzie and O’Nions, 1995; Wood and Blundy, 1997).

Our alphaMELTS calculations show that different primitive MORB compositions evolve along compositionally distinct liquid lines of descent (LLDs). Initially Al-rich compositions typically saturate in plagioclase at higher melt MgO contents than initially Al-poor compositions, often resulting in rapid decreases in melt Al_2O_3 content as a function of melt MgO content (Fig. 9a). This trend is directly comparable with observations on both our experiments (Fig. 4c) and natural basalts from the Pacific Ocean (Michael and Chase, 1987). In contrast, the preservation of Ca/Na variability in different LLDs is less distinct (Fig. 9b). However, the combined effects of major-element and H_2O variability on the evolution of F are striking (Figs. 9c and 9d). Specifically, F falls at markedly different rates with decreasing melt MgO content and T for different primitive melts. For example, our calculations indicate an F range at a melt MgO content of 8 wt.% (i.e. F_8) of approximately 0.48–0.98; comparable spreads in F can be observed in isothermal slices through F – T space at <1200 °C. These differences in F_8 are primarily driven by differences in the timing of plagioclase saturation: low- F_8 compositions have high initial melt Al_2O_3 contents that promote plagioclase stability (Fig. 9e) – olivine-only crystallisation has a negligible effect on F . There is also a weak positive correlation between F_8 and initial La/Yb values, indicating that crystallisation efficiency may correlate with ITE and H_2O enrichment as it does in our experiments on Icelandic model systems (Fig. 9f). A relationship between melt Al_2O_3 content and La/Yb is nonetheless present, with ITE-depleted melts having initially high Al_2O_3 contents that are swiftly reduced by extensive plagioclase crystallisation (Fig. 9a).

The rate at which the ITE content of residual MORB liquids increases as a function of differentiation degree is typically considered to be greater than can be achieved by fractional crystallisation alone (Bryan et al., 1976). This apparent over-enrichment has been invoked as evidence for MORB genesis by replenishment-mixing-tapping-crystallisation in steady-state reservoirs (O’Hara, 1977; O’Neill and Jenner, 2012), the entrainment of mushes that have experienced *in situ* crystallisation (Langmuir, 1989; Coogan and O’Hara, 2015) and the concurrent mixing and crystallisation of melts with initially high degrees of compositional

425 variability (Shorttle et al., 2016). Importantly, these models often assume that MORB
 426 differentiation can be modelled satisfactorily with a single $\text{MgO}-F$ relationship. However,
 427 geochemically distinct primitive MORB compositions experience different rates of mass loss
 428 during cooling (Fig. 9c and 9d), meaning that incompletely mixed MORB liquids evolving
 429 from different parental melts will become richer in ITEs at rates commensurate with their
 430 specific major-element and H_2O contents (Fig. 7). Evaluating the origin of apparent trace
 431 element over-enrichments in MORB suites is thus highly sensitive to the assumptions made
 432 when modelling crystallisation. For example, our findings suggest that over-enrichment
 433 trends in averaged global datasets could result from the preferential survival and sampling
 434 of enriched compositions as magmatic evolution proceeds. While we do not question the
 435 abundant evidence for magma mixing playing a central role in MORB genesis (e.g., Dungan
 436 and Rhodes, 1978; Costa et al., 2010; Shorttle, 2015), we note that our proposed mechanism
 437 for modifying the composition distribution of evolving basalt populations is independent of
 438 plumbing system architecture, making it universally applicable; no long-lived melt lens is
 439 required for dry, depleted melts to crystallise at depths and temperatures at which hydrous,
 440 enriched melts are able to persist (cf. O'Neill and Jenner, 2012). Moreover, differences in F
 441 arise at melt MgO contents higher than those at which primary melt heterogeneity would
 442 be fully eradicated by mixing (>8 wt.%; Shorttle, 2015). Therefore, average trends in global
 443 MORB data may at least in part represent a mean LLD of compositionally distinct liquids
 444 that become progressively biased towards enriched compositions as differentiation proceeds
 445 and mixing becomes more efficient.

446 8.2. *Crystal cargoes and crustal structure at mid ocean ridges*

447 Anorthitic plagioclase ($X_{\text{An}} > 0.8$) is commonly observed in oceanic basalts from which
 448 it cannot have crystallised (Bryan, 1983; Grove et al., 1992; Nielsen et al., 1995; Lange
 449 et al., 2013; Neave et al., 2013). Combining our experimental findings and MELTS simula-
 450 tions of MORB differentiation reinforces previous interpretations that high- X_{An} plagioclase
 451 in oceanic settings crystallises from Ca- and Al-rich melts (Fig. 10; Grove et al., 1992; Pan-
 452 jasawatwong et al., 1995; Kohut and Nielsen, 2004). As discussed above, primitive melts

with these major-element characteristics are typically associated with ITE depletions (Fig. 9; Michael and Chase, 1987). Moreover, high- X_{An} plagioclase crystals themselves often record growth from melts more depleted than their carrier liquids (Halldórsson et al., 2008; Lange et al., 2013; Neave et al., 2014, 2015). The anorthitic crystal cargoes carried by some oceanic basalts thus feasibly constitute the entrained remnants of depleted magmas which crystallised at depth and contributed little liquid mass to the magmas that brought them to the surface. High- X_{An} plagioclase crystals may therefore be widespread markers of depleted and otherwise cryptic melts generated by high-degree melting of lherzolitic sources.

Cumulates provide parallel evidence for the progressive biasing of residual MORB liquids towards enriched compositions. For example, clinopyroxene core compositions from the uniquely well-sampled Hess Deep rift section through the East Pacific Rise crust show increasing chondrite-normalised Ce/Yb values as functions of both decreasing $\text{Mg\#}_{\text{cpx}}$ and decreasing stratigraphic height that cannot be explained by simple fractional crystallisation – ITEs cannot be fractionated to the required degree (Lissenberg et al., 2013). Although this trend has been taken as evidence for reactive porous flow controlling cumulate (and hence MORB) compositions (Lissenberg and MacLeod, 2016), we speculate that the preferential survival of enriched primary melts during magmatic evolution may also play a role. Plutonic rocks from mid-ocean ridge settings may thus complement and balance the bias towards enriched compositions observed in the volcanic record. Indeed, the crust must host the depleted, crystalline counterparts to enriched melts that have erupted onto the ocean floor unless significant amounts of crystallisation takes place in the mantle. The deep and efficient crystallisation of depleted melts from refractory sources may thus account for the apparent absence of the isotopically ultradepleted compositions noted in xenoliths and abyssal peridotites from erupted archives (Stracke et al., 2011; Byerly and Lassiter, 2014; Burton et al., 2017).

9. Summary

By performing crystallisation experiments on synthetic analogues of geochemically distinct Icelandic basalts we have demonstrated that the compositional paths along which

primitive melts evolve depend strongly on their initial major-element and H_2O contents. Importantly, the rate at which cooling melts lose mass by crystallisation, i.e. their crystallisation efficiency, is contingent on the compositional properties they inherit from the mantle. Specifically, depleted melts generated by high-degree melting of initially fertile lherzolites attain higher crystallinities for any given drop in T or melt MgO content than enriched melts sourced from recycled and potentially pyroxenitic lithologies. These differences in crystallisation efficiency stem primarily from the depression of mineral – and in particular plagioclase – liquids by the combined effects of Na and H_2O enrichment, and Al and Ca depletion in ITE-enriched systems.

Our experimental findings show that the ITE systematics of geochemically heterogeneous basalts cannot be modelled using simple LLDs with uniquely defined $\text{MgO}-F$ and $T-F$ relationships. We illustrate that some features in natural data from Iceland can be accounted for by variations in the crystallisation efficiency of compositionally distinct primary basalts. Although magma mixing undoubtedly plays a major role in controlling erupted basalt compositions, we demonstrate that basalt compositions can also be modified by differences in $\text{MgO}-F$ arising across a differentiation interval where mixing is unlikely to have proceeded to completion. Specifically, we show that the preferential survival of enriched melts during cooling and crystallisation progressively biases mean evolved compositions towards those from enriched and feasibly recycled mantle sources.

Calculations with the MELTS algorithm indicate that compositional heterogeneity in primitive MORB glasses is sufficiently extensive to propagate into significant variations in crystallisation efficiency. The depression of mineral liquids in enriched systems offers a previously underexplored explanation for the apparent over-enrichment of ITEs in differentiating MORB liquids that is independent of magma reservoir architecture; ITE over-enrichment may be rooted in the mantle rather than the magma reservoir. Evidence of ITE and isotopic depletion in cumulate and exhumed mantle rocks suggests that there are deep depleted reservoirs that balance volcanic archives biased towards ITE enrichment. Moreover, high- X_{An} plagioclase cargoes and ITE-depleted cumulate rocks testify to the widespread crystallisation of depleted melts deep within the crust.

Overall, we have shown that our understanding of melting and compositional heterogeneity in the mantle is probably skewed by interpreting an erupted record unlikely to represent the full spectrum of primary melts produced at depth. Although we focussed on Iceland because of its suitability for in-depth study and MORB because of its global significance, feedbacks between primary melt compositions, phase equilibrium relations and sampling biases are likely to be important in myriad geological settings. Understanding the filtering effects of lithospheric thermal structure on the geochemical systematics of erupted basalts represents a crucial next step in using observations from the Earth's surface to map its deep chemical structure.

Acknowledgements

We thank Harald Behrens, Renat Almeev, Stefan Linsler, Robert Balzer, Julian Fiege and Ulrich Kroll for their assistance with experiments and analyses. We thank Eric Brown and Deborah Eason for their supportive and constructive comments, Marc Hirschmann and an anonymous reviewer for their helpful comments on an earlier version of this manuscript and Rajdeep Dasgupta for his efficient editorial handling. This work and D.A.N. were supported by the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, the German Research Foundation (NE2097/1-1) and a Presidential Fellowship from the University of Manchester. F.H. acknowledges support from the the German Research Foundation (HO1337/35-1). D.A.N. devised the project and carried out the experiments with the guidance of O.N. and F.H. All authors contributed towards the interpretation of experimental data and the intellectual development of the written manuscript.

Figure 1: The geographical and geochemical context for our experimental work. (a) Map showing the locations of the Háleyjabunga (Hál) and Stapafell (Sta) lavas on the Reykjanes Peninsula of southwest Iceland. (b and c) Plots summarising the major- and trace-element systematics of glass and whole-rock samples from the Reykjanes Peninsula and Western Volcanic Zone of southwest Iceland. All data are from the collation of Shorttle and MacLennan (2011). MgO is a measure of differentiation degree and Nb/Zr a measure of incompatible-trace-element (ITE) enrichment. High-MgO samples are coloured to highlight variability in their (b) Al₂O₃ contents and (c) Ca/Na values (expressed throughout as molar ratios). Matrix glass compositions from Háleyjabunga and Stapafell are shown. Vertical coloured lines show the MgO contents of fractionation-corrected synthetic analogues of Háleyjabunga (orange) and Stapafell (blue) matrix glasses used as experimental starting materials.

Figure 2: Backscattered electron images of experimental samples produced concurrently in Fe-presaturated $\text{Au}_{80}\text{Pd}_{20}$ capsules run at 300 MPa and 1200 °C for 48 hours. Phases are labelled as follows: gl, glass; ol, olivine; plg, plagioclase; and cpx, clinopyroxene. (a) Products of experiment Y0166-6 on the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue. (b) Products of experiment Y0166-9 on the enriched Stapafell analogue.

Figure 3: Phase proportions in experimental products as a function of experimental temperature (T). Phases are labelled as follows: gl, glass; ol, olivine; plg, plagioclase; cpx, clinopyroxene; low-Ca px, low-Ca pyroxene. (a and b) Phase proportions in the products of equilibrium crystallisation (EC) experiments on (a) depleted Háleyjabunga (Hál) and (b) enriched Stapafell (Sta) analogues under low- H_2O conditions (initial $H_2O \sim 0.5$ wt.%) in $Au_{80}Pd_{20}$ capsules. (c and d) Cumulative phase proportions in the products of near-fractional crystallisation (FC) experiments carried out on (c) Hál and (d) Sta analogues under low- H_2O conditions in $Au_{80}Pd_{20}$ capsules. Experiments below 1200 °C were performed using starting materials synthesised to match glass compositions measured in the products of runs at 1200 °C. (e and f) Phase proportions in the products of EC experiments carried out on (e) Hál and (f) Sta analogues under dry conditions (initial $H_2O \sim 0.1$ wt.%) in graphite-Pt double capsules.

Figure 4: Experimentally determined liquid lines of decent (LLDs) summarised on plots of MgO versus (a and c) Al_2O_3 and (b and d) Ca/Na . The products of experiments on depleted Háleyjabunga (Hál) and enriched Stapafell (Sta) analogues are shown in orange and blue hues respectively. Phases are labelled as follows: gl, glass; Cr-sp, Cr-spinel; ol, olivine; plg, plagioclase; cpx, clinopyroxene; low-Ca px, low-Ca pyroxene. Characteristic 2σ analytical uncertainties are shown. (a and b) Equilibrium (EC) and near-fractional (FC) crystallisation experiments carried out under low- H_2O conditions (initial $\text{H}_2\text{O} \sim 0.5$ wt.%) in $\text{Au}_{80}\text{Pd}_{20}$ capsules. (c and d) EC experiments carried out under dry conditions (initial $\text{H}_2\text{O} \sim 0.1$ wt.%) in graphite-Pt double capsules.

Figure 5: Evolution of melt fraction (F) in experimental products. Maximum uncertainties in F estimated from the summed residuals of mass balance calculations do not exceed the size of plot symbols. (a and b) Evolution of F as a function of melt MgO content for experiments carried out under (a) low- H_2O and (b) dry conditions on Icelandic end-member analogues. Symbols are the same as in Fig. 4. MgO– F trends calculated with the MELTS algorithm are shown for comparison (Ghiorso and Sack, 1995; Smith and Asimow, 2005). (c and d) Evolution of F as a function of T for the same experiments carried out under (c) low- H_2O and (d) dry conditions, also shown with trends from calculations with the MELTS algorithm.

Figure 6: Estimates of heat release from evolving Icelandic end-member basalts. (a) Evolution of total heat released per unit mass of initially supplied melt (expressed as $\Sigma[\Delta H_{\text{fus}}]$) as a function of melt MgO content taken from calculations with the MELTS algorithm (e.g., Shorttle et al., 2016). (b) Evolution of $\Sigma[\Delta H_{\text{fus}}]$ as a function of T .

Figure 7: Comparing ITE evolution trends predicted using our experimental findings with natural data from Iceland. (a) Log-linear plots of MgO–La systematics of glass and whole-rock samples from southwest Iceland plotted (Shorttle and MacLennan, 2011) (SM11). A regression through the natural data is shown with a solid black line. The compositions of end-member Icelandic matrix glasses and synthetic analogues are shown as large and small coloured diamonds respectively. Solid lines show the evolution of melt La contents predicted from the Rayleigh fractionation equation using a constant partition coefficient from O’Neill and Jenner (2012) (OJ12) and end-member-specific MgO– F relationships parametrised using our experiments on depleted Háleyjabunga and enriched Stapafell analogues under dry and low- H_2O conditions respectively. Dashed lines show equivalent predictions made using the MgO– F relationship given by O’Neill and Jenner (2012). (b) MgO–La/Yb systematics of glass and whole-rock samples from southwest Iceland with the results of calculations equivalent to those shown in (a).

Figure 8: Biasing of evolved basalt compositions towards melts from enriched sources. (a and b) Plots showing how the proportion of melts from a low- H_2O , enriched end-member source (X_e) evolves as a function of the initial relative abundance of these enriched melts ($[X_e]_i$) with respect to depleted melts and decreasing (a) melt MgO content or (b) T . For any given $[X_e]_i$ greater than zero (i.e. the case where all melts are from a dry, depleted end-member), the mean X_e of remaining melts steadily increases because dry, depleted melts crystallise to a higher degree than low- H_2O , enriched melts for any given decrease in MgO or T . Note that these calculations make the simplifying assumption that no mixing takes place during magmatic evolution, i.e. end-member melts evolve in isolation of each other (cf., MacLennan, 2008a; Shorttle et al., 2016). (c and d) Plots showing how melt (c) La and (d) La/Yb evolve as functions of $[X_e]_i$ and MgO. Melt evolution trajectories were calculated using the same methods as those to construct Fig. 7. End-member compositions, regressions through natural data and melt evolution trajectories predicted using the MgO- F relationship given by O'Neill and Jenner (2012) (OJ12) are reproduced from Fig. 7 for context.

Figure 9: The effect of geochemical heterogeneity on crystallisation efficiency in MORB systems. (a and b) Plots summarising the major element systematics of global mid-ocean ridge basalt (MORB) glass compositions collated by Gale et al. (2013) (G13). At any given MgO content, MORB glasses exhibit considerable variability in both (a) Al_2O_3 contents and (b) Ca/Na values. Coloured lines show LLDs of primitive ($\text{MgO} > 9$ wt.%) MORB glasses calculated using the MELTS algorithm (Ghiorso and Sack, 1995; Smith and Asimow, 2005). Calculations were performed at 150 MPa (Sinton and Detrick, 1992), an oxygen fugacity 0.2 log units below the quartz-fayalite-magnetite buffer (Zhang et al., 2018) and using melt H_2O contents estimated from glass Ce contents by assuming a constant $\text{H}_2\text{O}/\text{Ce}$ value of 200 (Michael, 1995). LLDs are coloured by their initial La/Yb values ($[\text{La/Yb}]_i$). (c and d) Plots illustrating variability in F as functions of (c) melt MgO content and (d) T . Note that the crystallisation of olivine and Cr-spinel has comparatively little effect on F . (e) A plot demonstrating how calculated values of F at a melt MgO content of 8 wt.% (F_8) correlate negatively and significantly with initial melt Al_2O_3 contents ($[\text{Al}_2\text{O}_3]_i$). A regression through the data is shown with a black line; associated r - and p -values are also shown. (f) A plot illustrating the modest but significant positive correlation between ITE enrichment ($[\text{La/Yb}]_i$) and F_8 in crystallising MORB that mirrors the more robust trend in southwest Iceland (Fig. 5). Regression data are shown as in (e); the highest- $[\text{La/Yb}]_i$ point was excluded from the regression.

Figure 10: High-anorthite plagioclase cargoes record the crystallisation of depleted melts. (a) LLDs of primitive (MgO > 9 wt.%) MORB glasses calculated using the MELTS algorithm and coloured by the anorthite content (X_{An} , where X_{An} = molar $\text{Ca}/(\text{Ca} + \text{Na} + \text{K})$) of equilibrium plagioclase once plagioclase joins the liquidus assemblage (Ghiorso and Sack, 1995; Smith and Asimow, 2005). Plagioclase-free intervals of melt evolution are shown as thin grey lines. The first appearance of plagioclase along each LLD is highlighted with a black-outlined circle. (b) A plot comparing the evolution of X_{An} as a function of melt MgO content in MELTS simulations of primitive MORB evolution with our experimentally determined relationships from southwest Iceland. In our experiments, plagioclase forms at both a higher melt MgO content and with a higher X_{An} during the crystallisation of dry, depleted melts than during the crystallisation of low- H_2O , enriched melts at otherwise similar conditions.

Almeev, R. R., Holtz, F., Koepke, J., Parat, F., 2012. Experimental calibration of the effect of H₂O on plagioclase crystallization in basaltic melt at 200 MPa. *American Mineralogist* 97, 1234–1240.

Almeev, R. R., Holtz, F., Koepke, J., Parat, F., Botcharnikov, R. E., 2007. The effect of H₂O on olivine crystallization in MORB: Experimental calibration at 200 MPa. *American Mineralogist* 92 (4), 670–674.

Asimow, P. D., Langmuir, C. H., 2003. The importance of water to oceanic mantle melting regimes. *Nature* 421 (6925), 815–820.

Bali, E., Hartley, M. E., Halldórsson, S. A., Guðfinnsson, G. H., Jakobsson, S., 2018. Melt inclusion constraints on volatile systematics and degassing history of the 2014–2015 Holuhraun eruption, Iceland. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 173, 9.

Barr, J. A., Grove, T. L., 2010. AuPdFe ternary solution model and applications to understanding the f_{O_2} of hydrous, high-pressure experiments. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 160 (5), 631–643.

Berndt, J., Liebske, C., Holtz, F., Freise, M., Nowak, M., Ziegenbein, D., Hurkuck, W., Koepke, J., 2002. A combined rapid-quench and H₂-membrane setup for internally heated pressure vessels: Description and application for water solubility in basaltic melts. *American Mineralogist* 87 (11-12), 1717–1726.

Blundy, J. D., Wood, B. J., 1994. Prediction of crystal-melt partition coefficients from elastic moduli. *Nature* 372 (6505), 452–454.

Brown, E. L., Leshner, C. E., 2014. North Atlantic magmatism controlled by temperature, mantle composition and buoyancy. *Nature Geoscience* 7 (11), 820–824.

Bryan, W. B., 1983. Systematics of modal phenocryst assemblages in submarine basalts: Petrologic implications. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 83 (1-2), 62–74.

Bryan, W. B., Thompson, G., Frey, F. A., Dickey, J. S., 1976. Inferred geologic settings and differentiation in basalts from the Deep-Sea Drilling Project. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 81 (23), 4285–4304.

Burton, K. W., Parkinson, I., Schiano, P., Gannoun, A., Laubier, M., 2017. The record of mantle heterogeneity preserved in Earth’s oceanic crust. In: *American Geophysical Union, Fall Meeting*. pp. V51D–0384.

Byerly, B. L., Lassiter, J. C., 2014. Isotopically ultradepleted domains in the convecting upper mantle: Implications for MORB petrogenesis. *Geology* 42 (3), 203–206.

Chase, C. G., 1981. Oceanic island Pb: Two-stage histories and mantle evolution. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 52 (2), 277–284.

Condomines, M., Grönvold, K., Hooker, P. J., Muehlenbachs, K., O’Nions, R. K., Óskarsson, N., Oxburgh, E. R., 1983. Helium, oxygen, strontium and neodymium isotopic relationships in Icelandic volcanics. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 66, 125–136.

Coogan, L. A., O’Hara, M. J., 2015. MORB differentiation: In situ crystallization in replenished-tapped magma chambers. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 158, 147–161.

Costa, F., Coogan, L. A., Chakraborty, S., 2010. The time scales of magma mixing and mingling involv-

ing primitive melts and melt-mush interaction at mid-ocean ridges. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 159 (3), 371–387.

Danyushevsky, L. V., Plechov, P., 2011. Petrolog3: Integrated software for modeling crystallization processes. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems* 12 (7).

Dick, H. J. B., Fisher, R. L., Bryan, W. B., 1984. Mineralogic variability of the uppermost mantle along mid-ocean ridges. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 69 (1), 88–106.

Dungan, M. A., Rhodes, J. M., 1978. Residual Glasses and Melt Inclusions in Basalts from DSDP Legs 45 and 46: Evidence for Magma Mixing. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 67 (4), 417–431.

Dupré, B., Allègre, C. J., 1983. Pb–Sr isotope variation in Indian Ocean basalts and mixing phenomena. *Nature* 303 (5913), 142–146.

Elthon, D., Scarfe, C. M., 1984. High-pressure phase equilibria of a high-magnesia basalt and the genesis of primary oceanic basalts. *American Mineralogist* 69, 1–15.

Feig, S. T., Koepke, J., Snow, J. E., 2010. Effect of oxygen fugacity and water on phase equilibria of a hydrous tholeiitic basalt. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 160 (4), 551–568.

Gaetani, G. A., Grove, T. L., 1998. The influence of water on melting of mantle peridotite. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 131 (4), 323–346.

Gale, A., Dalton, C. A., Langmuir, C. H., Su, Y., Schilling, J. G., 2013. The mean composition of ocean ridge basalts. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems* 14 (3), 489–518.

Gale, A., Langmuir, C. H., Dalton, C. A., 2014. The Global Systematics of Ocean Ridge Basalts and their Origin. *Journal of Petrology* 55 (6), 1051–1082.

Ghiorso, M. S., 1997. Thermodynamic models of igneous processes. *Annual Reviews of Earth and Planetary Sciences* 25, 221–241.

Ghiorso, M. S., Sack, R. O., 1995. Chemical mass transfer in magmatic processes IV. A revised and internally consistent thermodynamic model for the interpolation and extrapolation of liquid-solid equilibria in magmatic systems at elevated temperatures and pressures. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 119 (2-3), 197–212.

Grove, T. L., Bryan, W. B., 1983. Fractionation of pyroxene-phyric MORB at low pressure: An experimental study. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 84 (4), 293–309.

Grove, T. L., Kinzler, R. J., Bryan, W. B., 1992. Fractionation of Mid-Ocean Ridge Basalt (MORB). In: *Mantle Flow and Melt Generation at Mid-Ocean Ridges*, Geophysical Monograph 71. American Geophysical Union, Washington D.C., pp. 281–310.

Gurenko, A. A., Chaussidon, M., 1995. Enriched and depleted primitive melts included in olivine from Icelandic tholeiites: Origin by continuous melting of a single mantle column. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 59 (14), 2905–2917.

599 Halldórsson, S. A., Óskarsson, N., Grönvold, K., Sigurdsson, G., Sverrisdóttir, G., Steinthórsson, S., 2008.
 600 Isotopic-heterogeneity of the Thjorsa lava-Implications for mantle sources and crustal processes within
 601 the Eastern Rift Zone, Iceland. *Chemical Geology* 255 (3-4), 305–316.
 602 Hartley, M. E., MacLennan, J., 2018. Magmatic Densities Control Erupted Volumes in Icelandic Volcanic
 603 Systems. *Frontiers in Earth Science* 6, 29.
 604 Hartley, M. E., Neave, D. A., MacLennan, J., Edmonds, M., Thordarson, T., 2015. Diffusive over-hydration
 605 of olivine-hosted melt inclusions. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 425, 168–178.
 606 Hauri, E. H., 1996. Major-element variability in the Hawaiian mantle plume.
 607 Herzberg, C., O'Hara, M. J., 2002. Plume-associated ultramafic magmas of phanerozoic age. *Journal of*
 608 *Petrology* 43 (10), 1857–1883.
 609 Hirose, K., Kushiro, I., 1993. Partial melting of dry peridotites at high pressures: Determination of com-
 610 positions of melts segregated from peridotite using aggregates of diamond. *Earth and Planetary Science*
 611 *Letters* 114 (4), 477–489.
 612 Hirschmann, M. M., Stolper, E. M., 1996. A possible role for garnet pyroxenite in the origin of the “garnet
 613 signature” in MORB. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 124, 185–208.
 614 Hofmann, A. W., 1997. Mantle geochemistry: the message from oceanic volcanism. *Nature* 385 (6613),
 615 219–229.
 616 Hofmann, A. W., White, W. M., 1982. Mantle plumes from ancient oceanic crust. *Earth and Planetary*
 617 *Science Letters* 57 (2), 421–436.
 618 Husen, A., Almeev, R. R., Holtz, F., 2016. The Effect of H₂O and Pressure on Multiple Saturation and
 619 Liquid Lines of Descent in Basalt from the Shatsky Rise. *Journal of Petrology* 57, 309–344.
 620 Jakobsson, S. P., Jónsson, J., Shido, F., 1978. Petrology of the western Reykjanes Peninsula, Iceland. *Journal*
 621 *of Petrology* 19 (4), 669–705.
 622 Jarosewich, E., Gooley, R., Husler, J., 1987. Chromium Augite – A New Microprobe Reference Sample.
 623 *Geostandards and Geoanalytical Research* 11 (2), 197–198.
 624 Jarosewich, E., Nelen, J. A., Norberg, J. A., 1980. Reference samples for electron microprobe analysis.
 625 *Geostandards Newsletter* 4 (1), 43–47.
 626 Jennings, E. S., Holland, T. J. B., Shorttle, O., MacLennan, J., Gibson, S. A., 2016. The composition of
 627 melts from a heterogeneous mantle and the origin of ferropicrite: Application of a thermodynamic model.
 628 *Journal of Petrology* 57, 2289–2310.
 629 Johnson, K. T. M., Dick, H. J. B., Shimizu, N., 1990. Melting in the oceanic upper mantle: An ion microprobe
 630 study of diopsides in abyssal peridotites. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 95 (B3), 2661.
 631 Kinzler, R. J., Grove, T. L., 1992. Primary Magmas of Mid-Ocean Ridge Basalts 2. Applications. *Journal*
 632 *of Geophysical Research* 97 (B5), 6907–6925.

633 Klein, E. M., Langmuir, C. H., 1987. Global Correlations of Ocean Ridge Basalt Chemistry with Axial
 634 Depth and Crustal Thickness. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 92 (B8), 8089.
 635 Kogiso, T., Hirose, K., Takahashi, E., 1998. Melting experiments on homogeneous mixtures of peridotite and
 636 basalt: Application to the genesis of ocean island basalts. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 162 (1-4),
 637 45–61.
 638 Kohut, E. J., Nielsen, R. L., 2004. Melt inclusion formation mechanisms and compositional effects in high-
 639 An feldspar and high-Fo olivine in anhydrous mafic silicate liquids. *Contributions to Mineralogy and*
 640 *Petrology* 147 (6), 684–704.
 641 Kress, V. C., Carmichael, I. S. E., 1991. The compressibility of silicate liquids containing Fe_2O_3 and the
 642 effect of composition, temperature, oxygen fugacity and pressure on their redox states. *Contributions to*
 643 *Mineralogy and Petrology* 108 (1-2), 82–92.
 644 Lange, A. E., Nielsen, R. L., Tepley, F. J., Kent, A. J. R., 2013. Diverse Sr isotope signatures preserved in
 645 mid-oceanic-ridge basalt plagioclase. *Geology* 41 (2), 279–282.
 646 Langmuir, C. H., 1989. Geochemical consequences of in situ crystallization. *Nature* 340 (6230), 199–205.
 647 Lissenberg, C. J., MacLeod, C. J., 2016. A Reactive Porous Flow Control on Mid-ocean Ridge Magmatic
 648 Evolution. *Journal of Petrology* 57 (11&12), 2195–2220.
 649 Lissenberg, C. J., MacLeod, C. J., Howard, K. A., Godard, M., 2013. Pervasive reactive melt migration
 650 through fast-spreading lower oceanic crust (Hess Deep, equatorial Pacific Ocean). *Earth and Planetary*
 651 *Science Letters* 361, 436–447.
 652 MacLennan, J., 2008a. Concurrent mixing and cooling of melts under Iceland. *Journal of Petrology* 49 (11),
 653 1931–1953.
 654 MacLennan, J., 2008b. Lead isotope variability in olivine-hosted melt inclusions from Iceland. *Geochimica et*
 655 *Cosmochimica Acta* 72 (16), 4159–4176.
 656 MacLennan, J., 2019. Mafic tiers and transient mushes: evidence from Iceland. *Philosophical Transactions*
 657 *of the Royal Society A* 377 (20180021), 1–20.
 658 McKenzie, D., O’Nions, R. K., 1991. Partial melt distributions from inversion of rare earth element concen-
 659 trations. *Journal of Petrology* 23, 1021–1091.
 660 McKenzie, D., O’Nions, R. K., 1995. The source regions of Ocean Island. *Journal of Petrology* 36 (1),
 661 133–159.
 662 Médard, E., Grove, T. L., 2008. The effect of H_2O on the olivine liquidus of basaltic melts: Experiments
 663 and thermodynamic models. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 155 (4), 417–432.
 664 Melekhova, E., Annen, C., Blundy, J. D., 2013. Compositional gaps in igneous rock suites controlled by
 665 magma system heat and water content. *Nature Geoscience* 6 (5), 385–390.
 666 Michael, P. J., 1995. Evidence from trace elements and H_2O for regionally distinctive sources of depleted

667 MORB: Implications for evolution of the depleted mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 131 (2),
668 301–320.

669 Michael, P. J., Chase, R. L., 1987. The influence of primary magma composition, H_{2O} and
670 pressure on mid-ocean ridge basalt differentiation. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 96 (2),
671 245–263.

672 Namur, O., Humphreys, M. C. S., Holness, M. B., 2014. Crystallization of interstitial liquid and latent heat
673 buffering in solidifying gabbros: Skaergaard intrusion, Greenland. *Journal of Petrology* 55 (7), 1389–1427.

674 Neave, D. A., MacLennan, J., Hartley, M. E., Edmonds, M., Thordarson, T., 2014. Crystal storage and
675 transfer in basaltic systems: the Skuggafjöll eruption, Iceland. *Journal of Petrology* 55 (12), 2311–2346.

676 Neave, D. A., MacLennan, J., Thordarson, T., Hartley, M. E., 2015. The evolution and storage of primitive
677 melts in the Eastern Volcanic Zone of Iceland: the 10 ka Grímsvötn tephra series (i.e. the Saksunarvatn
678 ash). *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 170 (8), 21.

679 Neave, D. A., Passmore, E., MacLennan, J., Fitton, J. G., Thordarson, T., 2013. Crystal-melt relationships
680 and the record of deep mixing and crystallization in the AD 1783 Laki eruption, Iceland. *Journal of*
681 *Petrology* 54 (8), 1661–1690.

682 Neave, D. A., Putirka, K. D., 2017. A new clinopyroxene-liquid barometer, and implications for magma
683 storage pressures under Icelandic rift zones. *American Mineralogist* 102, 777–794.

684 Neave, D. A., Shorttle, O., Oeser, M., Weyer, S., Kobayashi, K., 2018. Mantle-derived trace element vari-
685 ability in olivines and their melt inclusions. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 483, 90–104.

686 Nielsen, R. L., Crum, J., Bourgeois, R., Hascall, K., Forsythe, L. M., Fisk, M. R., Christie, D. M., 1995.
687 Melt inclusions in high-An plagioclase from the Gorda Ridge: an example of the local diversity of MORB
688 parent magmas. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 122, 34–50.

689 O’Hara, M. J., 1968. Are Ocean Floor Basalts Primary Magma? *Nature* 220, 683–686.

690 O’Hara, M. J., 1977. Geochemical evolution during fractional crystallisation of a periodically refilled magma
691 chamber. *Nature* 266 (5602), 503–507.

692 O’Neill, H. S. C., Jenner, F. E., 2012. The global pattern of trace-element distributions in ocean floor basalts.
693 *Nature* 491 (7426), 698–704.

694 O’Neill, H. S. C., Jenner, F. E., 2016. Causes of the compositional variability among ocean floor basalts.
695 *Journal of Petrology* 57 (11&12), 2163–2194.

696 Panjasawatwong, Y., Danyushevsky, L. V., Crawford, A. J., Harris, K. L., 1995. An experimental study of
697 the effects of melt composition on plagioclase-melt equilibria at 5 and 10 kbar: implications for the origin
698 of magmatic high-An plagioclase. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 118 (4), 420–432.

699 Peate, D. W., Baker, J. A., Jakobsson, S. P., Waight, T. E., Kent, A. J. R., Grassineau, N. V., Skovgaard,
700 A. C., 2009. Historic magmatism on the Reykjanes Peninsula, Iceland: A snap-shot of melt generation at

a ridge segment. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 157 (3), 359–382.

Phipps Morgan, J., 2001. Thermodynamics of pressure release melting of a veined plum pudding mantle. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems* 2 (4), 2000GC000049.

Presnall, D. C., Dixon, S. A., Dixon, J. R., O'Donnell, T. H., Brenner, N. L., Schrock, R. L., Dycus, D. W., 1978. Liquidus Phase Relations on the Join Diopside-Forsterite-Anorthite from 1 atm to 20 kbar: Their Bearing on the Generation and Crystallization of Basaltic Magma. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 66 (2), 203–220.

R Development Core Team, 2008. R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing.

Schilling, J. G., 1973. Iceland Mantle Plume: Geochemical Study of Reykjanes Ridge. *Nature* 242 (5400), 565–571.

Schuessler, J. A., Botcharnikov, R. E., Behrens, H., Misiti, V., Freda, C., 2008. Oxidation state of iron in hydrous phono-tephritic melts. *American Mineralogist* 93 (10), 1493–1504.

Shorttle, O., 2015. Geochemical variability in MORB controlled by concurrent mixing and crystallisation. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 424, 1–14.

Shorttle, O., MacLennan, J., 2011. Compositional trends of Icelandic basalts: Implications for short-length scale lithological heterogeneity in mantle plumes. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems* 12 (11), 1–32.

Shorttle, O., MacLennan, J., Lambart, S., 2014. Quantifying lithological variability in the mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 395, 24–40.

Shorttle, O., Moussallam, Y., Hartley, M. E., MacLennan, J., Edmonds, M., Murton, B. J., 2015. Fe-XANES analyses of Reykjanes Ridge basalts: Implications for oceanic crust's role in the solid Earth oxygen cycle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 427, 272–285.

Shorttle, O., Rudge, J. F., MacLennan, J., Rubin, K. H., 2016. A Statistical Description of Concurrent Mixing and Crystallization during MORB Differentiation: Implications for Trace Element Enrichment. *Journal of Petrology* 57 (11&12), 2127–2162.

Sinton, J. M., Detrick, R. S., 1992. Mid-ocean ridge magma chambers. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 97 (B1), 197–216.

Smith, P. M., Asimow, P. D., 2005. AdiaPh: A new public front-end to the MELTS, pMELTS, and pHMELTS models. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems* 6 (2), 1–8.

Soetaert, K., Van den Meersche, K., van Oevelen, D., 2009. limSolve: Solving Linear Inverse Models.

Stracke, A., 2012. Earth's heterogeneous mantle: A product of convection-driven interaction between crust and mantle. *Chemical Geology* 330–331, 274–299.

Stracke, A., Snow, J. E., Hellebrand, E., von der Handt, A., Bourdon, B., Birbaum, K., Günther, D., 2011. Abyssal peridotite Hf isotopes identify extreme mantle depletion. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 308 (3–4), 359–368.

- Till, C. B., Grove, T. L., Krawczynski, M. J., 2012. A melting model for variably depleted and enriched ilmenite in the plagioclase and spinel stability fields. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth* 117 (6), 1–23.
- Villiger, S., Ulmer, P., Müntener, O., 2007. Equilibrium and fractional crystallization experiments at 0.7 GPa; the effect of pressure on phase relations and liquid compositions of tholeiitic magmas. *Journal of Petrology* 48 (1), 159–184.
- Wager, L. R., Brown, G. M., Wadsworth, W. J., 1960. Types of igneous cumulates. *Journal of Petrology* 1 (1), 73–85.
- Wallace, P. J., 1998. Water and partial melting in mantle plumes: Inferences from the dissolved H₂O concentrations of Hawaiian basaltic magmas. *Geophysical Research Letters* 25 (19), 3639–3642.
- Warren, J. M., 2016. Global variations in abyssal peridotite compositions. *Lithos* 248–251, 193–219.
- Winpenny, B., MacLennan, J., 2011. A partial record of mixing of mantle melts preserved in Icelandic phenocrysts. *Journal of Petrology* 52 (9), 1791–1812.
- Wood, B. J., Blundy, J. D., 1997. A predictive model for rare earth element partitioning between clinopyroxene and anhydrous silicate melt. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology* 129 (2–3), 166–181.
- Wright, T. L., Doherty, P. C., 1970. A linear programming and least squares computer method for solving petrologic mixing problems. *Geological Society Of America Bulletin* 81 (8), 1995–2008.
- Zhang, H. L., Cottrell, E., Solheid, P. A., Kelley, K. A., Hirschmann, M. M., 2018. Determination of Fe³⁺/ΣFe of XANES basaltic glass standards by Mössbauer spectroscopy and its application to the oxidation state of iron in MORB. *Chemical Geology* 479, 166–175.
- Zindler, A., Hart, S. R., 1986. Chemical Geodynamics. *Annual Reviews of Earth and Planetary Sciences* 14 (1), 493–571.

Appendix A. Methodological details

Appendix A.1. Experimental methods

Nominally dry experiments were carried out by loading ~30 mg of each dried starting glass powder into two graphite capsules that were then encased pairwise within Pt outer capsules. Low-H₂O experiments were carried out by loading ~50 mg of each dried starting glass powder into Au₈₀Pd₂₀ capsules that had first been pre-saturated with ~0.25 wt.% Fe to minimise Fe loss to capsule materials (Gaetani and Grove, 1998). Au₈₀Pd₂₀ capsules then were bound together pairwise with Pt wire.

765 Prepared capsules were suspended from a Pt wire in the hot zone of an internally heated
766 pressure vessel (IHPV) at the Institut für Mineralogie of the Leibniz Universität Hannover,
767 Germany (Berndt et al., 2002). All experiments were performed at 300 MPa using an Ar
768 pressure medium. Pressure was continuously monitored with a strain gauge manometer and
769 did not vary more than the uncertainty of the manometer (5 MPa) during experimental runs.
770 Experiments were performed in 20 °C steps between 1260 and 1140 °C. Temperature was
771 continuously monitored over the vessel's 25 mm-high hot zone with four unsheathed S-type
772 (Pt-Pt₉₀Rh₁₀) thermocouples and was typically within 5 °C of the target temperature. Run
773 durations varied from 25 hours for the hottest superliquidus experiments to 72–117 hours
774 for the coolest crystal-rich experiments. Capsules were quenched at the end of experimental
775 runs by fusing the Pt wires on which they were suspended, dropping them into a cold zone
776 at base on the vessel.

777 *Appendix A.2. Analytical methods*

778 Experimental products (including capsules) were mounted in epoxy resin, polished and
779 carbon coated for analysis by electron probe microanalysis (EPMA) with a Cameca SX100
780 instrument at the Institut für Mineralogie of the Leibniz Universität Hannover, Germany.
781 Silicon, Ti, Al, Cr, Fe, Mn, Mg, Ca, Na, K and P were measured in glasses with a beam size of
782 10 µm (occasionally 5 µm in highly crystalline samples), an accelerating voltage of 15 kV and
783 a current of 10 nA. Silicon, Ti, Al, Cr, Fe, Mn, Mg, Ca, Na and K were measured in minerals
784 with a beam size of 1 µm, an accelerating voltage of 15 kV and a current of 15 nA. Gold,
785 Pd and Fe were measured in capsules with a beam size of 1 µm, an accelerating voltage of
786 15 kV and a current of 40 nA. Elements were counted on peak for 20 s, with the exceptions
787 of Si and Na that were counted on peak for 10 s to minimise drift and Na migration.
788 Background counting times were half of the on-peak counting times. The following standards
789 were used for calibration: wollastonite (Si and Ca), TiO₂ (Ti), Al₂O₃ (Al), Cr₂O₃ (Cr),
790 Fe₂O₃ (for Fe in silicates and Cr-spinel), Fe metal (for Fe in capsules), Mn₃O₄ (Mn), MgO
791 (Mg), albite (Na), orthoclase (K), apatite (P), Au metal (Au) and Pd metal (Pd). To
792 ensure internal consistency across multiple sessions, analyses were normalised as follows:

793 glass analyses were normalised to VG-2 basalt glass (NMNH 111240-52; using the preferred
 794 MgO content); clinopyroxene, low-Ca pyroxene and plagioclase analyses were normalised to
 795 Kakanui augite (NMNH 122142; using preferred values); olivine analyses were normalised to
 796 San Carlos olivine (NMNH 111312-44); and chromite analyses were normalised to Tiebaghi
 797 Mine chromite (NMNH 117075) (Jarosewich et al., 1980). Accuracy and precision were
 798 monitored by measuring the following standards that were also normalised for each analytical
 799 session: A-99 basaltic glass (NMNH 113498), Ney County Cr-augite (NMNH 164905) and
 800 Lake County plagioclase (NMNH 115900) (Jarosewich et al., 1980, 1987). Major (>1 wt.%)
 801 and minor (<1 wt.%) elements were determined with accuracies better than 2% and 10%,
 802 and 1σ precisions better than 2% and 15% respectively. Typical analyses of standards are
 803 provided alongside analyses of experimental products in the Supplementary Material.

804 Glass H_2O concentrations were determined in experimental products with low crystal
 805 contents by Fourier-transform infrared (FTIR) spectroscopy with a Bruker IFS88 instrument
 806 at the Institut für Mineralogie of the Leibniz Universität Hannover, Germany (e.g., Husen
 807 et al., 2016). Experimental glasses produced at 1260 °C under nominally dry conditions
 808 contain $0.09 \pm 0.00(1\sigma)$ wt.% H_2O , whereas glasses produced at 1240–1260 °C under low-
 809 H_2O conditions contain $0.40 \pm 0.04(1\sigma)$ wt.% H_2O .

810 *Appendix A.3. Experimental oxygen fugacities*

811 When imposing no solid buffer, the IHPV used has an intrinsic f_{O_2} slightly above the
 812 QFM buffer (Husen et al., 2016). Nominally dry experimental glasses produced in graphite-
 813 Pt double capsules were theoretically buffered at an f_{O_2} close to the carbon-carbon dioxide
 814 (CCO) buffer. Colorimetric analyses of nominally dry glasses produced at 1240–1260 °C
 815 returned variable $\text{Fe}^{3+}/\Sigma\text{Fe}$ contents of 0.09–0.19, consistent with f_{O_2} conditions between
 816 QFM–1 and QFM+1 (Schuessler et al., 2008). However, these $\text{Fe}^{3+}/\Sigma\text{Fe}$ determinations
 817 were subject to large uncertainties because of the low Fe^{3+} content of graphite-buffered
 818 experimental glasses. Colorimetric analyses of low- H_2O experimental glasses produced at
 819 1240–1260 °C return more consistent $\text{Fe}^{3+}/\Sigma\text{Fe}$ values of $0.23 \pm 0.02(1\sigma)$, which correspond to
 820 an f_{O_2} of QFM+1.5 $\pm$ 0.3(1σ) (Kress and Carmichael, 1991). $\text{Au}_{80}\text{Pd}_{20}$ capsule compositions

821 indicate a comparable f_{O_2} of QFM+1.1 $\pm$ 0.2(1 σ) (Barr and Grove, 2010).

822 *Appendix A.4. Estimating phase proportions*

823 Phase proportions were estimated from experimental glass and mineral compositions
824 with a non-weighted least-squares mass balance approach (e.g., Wright and Doherty, 1970).
825 Calculations were performed by balancing the composition of the starting glass against the
826 composition of all phases observed in experimental products using the lsei() function of the
827 limSolve package in R (R Development Core Team, 2008; Soetaert et al., 2009). Root mean
828 square (rms) errors of least-squares calculations were always <0.29, which approximate to
829 absolute maximum uncertainties in individual phase proportions of $\sim$ 0.03.

Figure A.1: The effect of correcting matrix glass (gl) compositions to putative primary compositions. The Stapafell (Sta) matrix glass composition was corrected to a similar melt MgO content as the Háleyjabunga (Hál) matrix glass before synthesising a starting glass by adding approximately 7 wt.% olivine using the Petrolog3 software package (Condomines et al., 1983; Herzberg and O’Hara, 2002; Danyushevsky and Plechov, 2011). Correcting Háleyjabunga and Stapafell starting glass compositions to be in equilibrium with the most primitive olivines in each of the eruptions requires the further addition of 7 and 5 wt.% olivine respectively. Thus, correcting back to putative primary compositions would simply result in the depleted Háleyjabunga analogue experiencing an interval of olivine-only crystallisation at high temperatures that would not occur during cooling of the enriched Stapafell analogue, accentuating differences in MgO– F relationships between our model end-member systems.

Figure A.2: Sketch phase diagram illustrating how refractory melts rich in Ca and Al reach multiple saturation at higher temperatures than enriched melts rich in Na and Fe because of their higher normative anorthite contents. Phase boundaries at 1 atm are reproduced from Presnall et al. (1978) and compositions from Háleyjabunga (Hál, depleted) and Stapafell (Sta, enriched) are shown only for illustrative.

Figure A.3: The evolution of glass major element contents in low-H₂O experiments. Equilibrium (EC) and near-fractional (FC) crystallisation experiments carried out under low-H₂O conditions. Data are shown for both depleted Háleyjabunga (Hál) and enriched Stapafell (Sta) analogues. Symbols show phase assemblages: gl, glass; Cr-sp, Cr-spinel; ol, olivine; cpx, clinopyroxene; plg, plagioclase; low-Ca px, low-Ca pyroxene.

Figure A.4: The evolution of glass major element contents in nominally dry experiments. Equilibrium crystallisation (EC) experiments carried out under nominally dry conditions. Data are shown for both depleted Háleyjabunga (Hál) and enriched Stapafell (Sta) analogues. Symbols show phase assemblages: gl, glass; Cr-sp, Cr-spinel; ol, olivine; cpx, clinopyroxene; plg, plagioclase; low-Ca px, low-Ca pyroxene.

Figure A.5: Plots showing the error-function fitting used to parametrise the evolution of F as functions of (a and b) melt MgO content and (c and d) T . MgO- F and T - F relationships were parametrised using nominally dry experiments on the depleted Háleyjabunga (Hál) analogue and low- H_2O experiments on the enriched Stapafell (Sta) analogue because these most closely reflect the natural variability in Icelandic end-member systems. Maximum uncertainties in F estimated from the summed residuals of mass balance calculations are no greater than the symbols used.

Figure A.6: Comparing ITE evolution trends predicted using our experimental findings with natural data from Iceland. (a) Log-linear plots of MgO–Nb systematics of glass and whole-rock samples from southwest Iceland plotted (Shorttle and Maclellan, 2011) (SM11). A regression through the natural data is shown with a solid black line. The compositions of end-member Icelandic matrix glasses and synthetic analogues are shown as large and small coloured diamonds respectively. Solid lines show the evolution of melt La contents predicted from the Rayleigh fractionation equation using a constant partition coefficient from O'Neill and Jenner (2012) (OJ12) and end-member-specific MgO– F relationships parametrised using our experiments on depleted Háleyjabunga and enriched Stapafell analogues under dry and low- H_2O conditions respectively. Dashed lines show equivalent predictions made using the MgO– F relationship given by O'Neill and Jenner (2012). (b) MgO–Nb/Zr systematics of glass and whole-rock samples from southwest Iceland with the results of calculations equivalent to those shown in (a).

Figure A.7: Plots showing how melt (a) Nb and (b) Nb/Zr evolve as functions of $[X_e]_i$ and MgO. Melt evolution trajectories were calculated using the same methods as those to construct Fig. A.7. End-member compositions, regressions through natural data and melt evolution trajectories predicted using the MgO– F relationship given by O’Neill and Jenner (2012) (OJ12) are reproduced from Fig. A.7 for context.

Figure A.8: Plots showing melt evolution trends equivalent to those presented in Fig 8 but derived from calculations with the MELTS algorithm instead of parametrised experimental data. These plots demonstrate that MELTS simulations capture the first-order signals present in our experimental dataset and can thus be used to extend our approach to systems beyond Iceland, even if absolute differences between end-member systems are underestimated.