Elsevier Editorial System(tm) for Quaternary Science Reviews Manuscript Draft

Manuscript Number: JQSR-D-13-00519R1

Title: Climate variability and associated vegetation response throughout Central and Eastern Europe (CEE) between 60 and 8 ka

Article Type: Special Issue: 4th INTIMATE

Keywords: terrestrial records; climate; pollen; vegetation response; INTIMATE; latitudinal gradients; glacial; Holocene

Corresponding Author: Dr. Angelica Feurdean,

Corresponding Author's Institution:

First Author: Angelica Feurdean

Order of Authors: Angelica Feurdean; Aurel Persoiu; Ioan Tantau; Thomas Stevens; Enikö K Magyari; Bogdan B Onac; Slobodan Markovic; Maja Andric; Simon Connor; Mariusz Galka; Wim Z Hoek; Mariusz Lamentowicz; Pal Sümegi; Ioana Persoiu; Piotr Kolaczek; Petr Kuneš; Elena Marinova; Michal Slowinski; Danuta Michczyńska; Migle Stancikaite; Anders Svensson; Siim Veski; Sorina Fărcaș; Tudor Tămaș; Valentina Zernitskaya; Alida Timar; Spassimir Tonkov; Monika Toth; Kathy J Willis; Mateusz Płóciennik; Tivadar Gaudeny

Abstract: Records of past climate variability and associated vegetation response exist in various regions throughout Central and Eastern Europe (CEE). To date, there has been no coherent synthesis of the existing palaeo-records. During an INTIMATE meeting (Cluj Napoca, Romania) focused on identifying CEE paleo-records, it was decided to address this gap by presenting the palaeo-community with a compilation of high-quality climatic and vegetation records for the past 60-8 kyrs. The compilation should also serve as a reference point for the use in the modelling community working towards the INTIMATE project goals, and in data-model inter-comparison studies. This paper is therefore a compilation of up to date, best available quantitative and semi-quantitative records of past climate and biotic response from CEE covering this period. It first presents the proxy and archive used. Speleothems and loess mainly provide the evidences available for the 60-20 ka interval, whereas pollen records provide the main source of information for the Lateglacial and Holocene. It then examines the temporal and spatial patterns of climate variability inferred from different proxies, the temporal and spatial magnitude of the vegetation responses inferred from pollen records and highlights differences and similarities between proxies and sub-regions and the possible mechanisms behind this variability. Finally, it identifies weakness in the proxies and archives and their geographical distribution. This exercise also provides an opportunity to reflect on the status of research in the area and to identify future critical areas and subjects of research.

# Highlights

- A comprehensive review of climate change and impacts on vegetation in Central and Eastern Europe
- Synchronous climate shifts in CEE and the wider North Atlantic region between 14.7-8 ka
- Reduced magnitude of these climatic shifts in the continental part of Europe
- Cooling intervals between 14.7 and 11.7 ka cal BP strongly expressed during winters
- Vegetation in CEE responded less drastically to the climate shifts compared to Western Europe

Climate variability and associated vegetation response throughout Central and Eastern 1 2 Europe (CEE) between 60 and 8 ka 3 A. Feurdean<sup>1,2\*</sup>, A. Perşoiu<sup>3\*</sup>, I. Tanțău<sup>4</sup>, T. Stevens<sup>5</sup>, S., E.K. Magyari<sup>6</sup>, B.P. Onac<sup>7</sup>, S. 4 Marković<sup>8</sup>; M. Andrič<sup>9</sup>, S. Connor<sup>10</sup>, S. Fărcaş<sup>11</sup>, M. Gałka<sup>12</sup>, T. Gaudeny<sup>13</sup>, W. Hoek<sup>14</sup>, P. 5 Kolaczek<sup>12</sup>, P. Kuneš<sup>15</sup>, M. Lamentowicz<sup>12</sup>, E. Marinova<sup>16</sup>, D.J. Michczyńska<sup>17</sup>, I. Persoiu<sup>18</sup>, M. 6 Płóciennik<sup>19</sup>, M. Słowiński<sup>20, 21</sup>, M. Stancikaite<sup>22</sup>, P. Sumegi<sup>23</sup>, A. Svensson<sup>24</sup>, T. Tămaş<sup>2,5</sup>, A. 7 Timar<sup>26</sup>, S. Tonkov<sup>27</sup>, M. Toth<sup>28</sup>, S. Veski<sup>28</sup>, K.J. Willis<sup>30</sup>, V. Zernitskaya<sup>31</sup> 8 9 **Corresponding authors:** 10 A. Feurdean\*. Biodiversity and Climate Research Centre (BiK-F), Senckenberganlage 25, 11 12 60325 Frankfurt am Main, Germany. Tel: +49(0)6975421870; Fax: +49 69 7542 1800, Email: angelica.feurdean@senckenberg.de; angelica.feurdean@gmail.com 13 A. Persoiu\* Stable Isotope Laboratory, Stefan cel Mare University, Universitătii 13, Suceava 14 720229 Romania. Tel: +402 30 216147 / 589, Fax: +40230-523742. 15 Email: aurel.persoiu@gmail.com 16 \* authors with equal contribution 17 18 <sup>1</sup> Senckenberg Research Institute and Natural History Museum & Biodiversity and Climate 19 Research Center (BiK- F), Senckenberganlange 25, D-60325, Frankfurt am Main, Germany 20 <sup>2</sup> Romanian Academy, Emil Racovită Institute of Speleology, Clinicilor 5, Cluj Napoca, 400006, 21 22 Romania <sup>3</sup> Stable Isotope Laboratory, Stefan cel Mare University, Universitătii 13, 720229 Suceava, 23 24 Romania <sup>4</sup> Department of Geology, Babes-Bolvai University, Kogălniceanu 1, 400084, Cluj-Napoca, 25 Romania

- 1 <sup>5</sup> Centre for Quaternary Research, Department of Geography, Royal Holloway University of
- 2 London, Egham, Surrey, TW20 0EX, UK
- <sup>6</sup> Deptartemt of Physical and Applied Geology, Eötvös Loránd University, Pázmány Péter sétány
- 4 1/C, Budapest, H-1117 Hungary
- <sup>5</sup> <sup>7</sup> School of Geosciences, University of South Florida, 4202 E. Fowler Avenue, NES 107, Tampa,

6 33620, USA

- <sup>8</sup> Laboratory for Palaeoenvironmental Reconstruction, Faculty of Sciences, University of Novi
- 8 Sad, Trg Dositeja Obradovića 2, 21000 Novi Sad, Serbia
- <sup>9</sup> Scientific Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts (ZRC SAZU),
- 10 Institute of Archaeology, Novi trg 2, SI-1001 Ljubljana, Slovenia
- <sup>10</sup> School of Geography and Environmental Science, Monash University, VIC 3800, Australia
- <sup>11</sup> National Institute of Research and Development for Biological Sciences, Institute of Biological
- 13 Research, Republicii 48, 400015 Cluj Napoca, Romania
- <sup>12</sup> Department of Biogeography and Palaeoecology and Laboratory of Wetland Ecology and
- 15 Monitoring, Faculty of Geographical and Geological Sciences, Adam Mickiewicz University,
- 16 Dzięgielowa 27, PL-61 680 Poznań, Poland
- <sup>13</sup> Geographical Institute Jovan CVIJIC of the Serbian Academy of Sciences
   and Arts, Djure JAKSICA 9, SRB- 11000 Belgrade
- <sup>14</sup> Faculty of Geosciences, University of Utrecht, Postbus 80.115 3508 TC, Utrecht, The
   Netherlands
- <sup>15</sup> Department of Botany, Faculty of Science, Charles University, Benátská 2 128 01 Prague,
- 22 Czech Republic
- <sup>16</sup> Centre for Archaeological Sciences, University of Leuven, Celestijnenlaan 200E, bus 2408,
- 24 3001 Leuven, Belgium
- <sup>17</sup> GADAM Centre of Excellence, Institute of Physics-CSE, Silesian University of Technology,
- 26 Krzywoustego 2, 44-100 Gliwice, Poland

- 1 <sup>18</sup> Department of Geography, Ștefan cel Mare University, Universității 13, 720229 Suceava,
- 2 Romania
- <sup>19</sup> Department of Invertebrate Zoology and Hydrobiology, University of Lodz, Banacha St. 12/16,
- 4 90-237, Łódź, Poland
- <sup>5</sup> <sup>20</sup> Department of Environmental Resources and Geohazard, Institute of Geography, Polish
- 6 Academy of Sciences, Kopernika 19, Torun 87-100, Poland
- 7 <sup>21</sup> GFZ German Research Centre for Geosciences, Section 5.2-Climate Dynamics and
- 8 Landscape Evolution, Telegrafenberg, D-14473 Potsdam, Germany
- 9 <sup>22</sup> Nature Research Centre, Institute of Geology and Geography, T. Ševčenkos Str. 13, LT-
- 10 03223, Vilnius, Lithuania
- <sup>23</sup> University of Szeged, 6722 Szeged, Egyetem s. 2, Hungary
- 12 <sup>24</sup> Centre for Ice and Climate, Niels Bohr Institute, University of Copenhagen, Juliane Maries Vej
- 13 30, 2100 Copenhagen, Denmark.
- <sup>25</sup> Faculty of Environmental Science and Engineering, Babeş-Bolyai University, Fântânele 30,
- 15 Cluj Napoca, 400294, Romania
- <sup>26</sup> Laboratory of Palynology, Department of Botany, Faculty of Biology, Sofia University "St.
- 17 KlimentOhridski", Sofia, Bulgaria
- <sup>27</sup> Balaton Limnological Institute, MTA Centre for Ecological Research, Klebelsberg Kuno 3, HU-
- 19 8237 Tihany, Hungary
- <sup>28</sup> Institute of Geology, Tallinn University of Technology, Ehitajate tee 5, 19086 Tallinn, Estonia
- <sup>29</sup> Long-Term Ecology Laboratory, Biodiversity Institute, Department of Zoology, University of
- 22 Oxford, South Parks Road Oxford OX1 3PS United Kingdom
- <sup>30</sup> Laboratory of Geodynamic and Paleogeography, Institute For Nature Management, National
- Academy of Sciences of Belarus, 10, F. Skoriny street, 220114 Minsk, Belarus
- 25
- 26 Abstract

1 Records of past climate variability and associated vegetation response exist in various regions 2 throughout Central and Eastern Europe (CEE). To date, there has been no coherent synthesis 3 of the existing palaeo-records. During an INTIMATE meeting (Cluj Napoca, Romania) focused 4 on identifying CEE paleo-records, it was decided to address this gap by presenting the palaeo-5 community with a compilation of high-quality climatic and vegetation records for the past 60-8 kyrs. The compilation should also serve as a reference point for the use in the modelling 6 7 community working towards the INTIMATE project goals, and in data-model inter-comparison 8 studies. This paper is therefore a compilation of up to date, best available quantitative and semiquantitative records of past climate and biotic response from CEE covering this period. It first 9 presents the proxy and archive used. Speleothems and loess mainly provide the evidences 10 available for the 60-20 ka interval, whereas pollen records provide the main source of 11 12 information for the Lateglacial and Holocene. It then examines the temporal and spatial patterns 13 of climate variability inferred from different proxies, the temporal and spatial magnitude of the vegetation responses inferred from pollen records and highlights differences and similarities 14 between proxies and sub-regions and the possible mechanisms behind this variability. Finally, it 15 16 identifies weakness in the proxies and archives and their geographical distribution. This exercise also provides an opportunity to reflect on the status of research in the area and to 17 identify future critical areas and subjects of research. 18

19

Keywords: terrestrial records, climate, pollen, vegetation response, INTIMATE, latitudinal
 gradients, glacial, Holocene

22

## 23 **1. Introduction**

One of the main aims of the INTegration of Ice-core, MArine, and TErrestrial records (INTIMATE group) is to reconstruct past climatic changes and their impact on the biotic and abiotic environment for the period between 60 and 8 ka. The main mechanisms used to achieve

1 this aim are the refinement of dating methods and resulting chronologies of past changes. 2 quantification of past climatic changes and related impacts, testing for leads and lags in the 3 climatic system and improvement of all the above by modelling the mechanisms driving these 4 changes (Björck et al., 1998, Walker et al., 1999; Blockley et al., 2012a). Initially, the main area 5 of interest was the immediate vicinity of the North Atlantic, later expanding to Eastern Europe (Blockley et al., 2012b) and even farther afield (Petherick et al., 2013). However, discrepancies 6 7 between regions in terms of data availability and quality have lead to a marked dichotomy 8 between Western and Eastern Europe, which strongly hampers, *inter alia*, testing synchronicity of climatic events, analysis of possible lags in the transfer of climatic influences from the North 9 Atlantic towards the east, and analysis of the response of vegetation to climate changes. 10 Further, while records of past climate variability exist in various regions throughout Central and 11 12 Eastern Europe, to date there has been no thorough review paper that synthesizes the available 13 high-resolution climate records and data on the biotic responses to the climatic changes.

Present-day climatic differences between Eastern and Western Europe very likely 14 translate into different climatic histories between the two regions in terms of the timing and/or 15 16 amplitude of palaeoclimatic events. The proximity of Western Europe to the North Atlantic leads 17 to a strong oceanic influence on terrestrial ecosystems, likely overwhelming other possible, distant influences. In contrast, the reduced Atlantic influence in CEE allows for a stronger input 18 19 from other centers of climatic variability (e.g., the Mediterranean Sea, NW Russia and the Black Sea). These influences result in the northern part (in the vicinity of the Baltic Sea) having cold 20 21 winters and short, wet summers, while the southern (closer to the Mediterranean Sea) part has relatively warm, wet winters and dry, hot summers. The differences between the two regions 22 were likely enhanced during the last glacial period by the strong influence of the Fennoscandian 23 24 Ice Sheet and Alpine glaciers on air mass circulation (direction and intensity) and temperatures.

During an INTIMATE meeting held in Cluj-Napoca (Romania) in March 2013, it was decided to address this gap and summarize the existing high-resolution records of climate

1 change and related impacts on vegetation in Central and Eastern Europe (CEE) for the period 2 between 60 and 8 ka. CEE is here loosely defined as the region between the Alps and the Baltic 3 Sea to the west, the Scandinavian Peninsula to the north, the Rhodope Mountains and Thracian 4 Plain to the south and the Russian Plain to the east. The 60 and 8 ka interval covers the second 5 half of the last glacial, the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM, ca 22-18 ka BP), the Lateglacial period (ca. 14.7-11.7 ka BP), and the early Holocene (ca 11.7-8 ka BP). The period before the 6 7 Lateglacial is divided into Marine Isotope Stage 3 (MIS 3, ca 60-28 ka BP) and MIS 2 (ca 28-14.7 ka BP). As in Moreno et al. (this volume), the Greenland ice core stratigraphy has been 8 applied as a template for CEE climate variability during the 60-8 ka time period (Blockley et al., 9 2012). This review also serves as a reference point for high-resolution palaeo-data for use in the 10 modelling community working towards the INTIMATE project goals, and in data-model inter-11 12 comparison studies. However, this is not intended to be an exhaustive review of all palaeo-13 records from the CEE region. This paper should be seen as a companion to a similar compilation of Western European quantitative terrestrial palaeoclimate reconstructions for the 14 same period (Moreno et al., this volume). By compiling the best available data from CEE, we 15 16 aim to: i) present the palaeo-community with a concise compilation of high-quality climatic and 17 vegetation records for the 60-8 ka period; ii) decipher the temporal and spatial patterns of climate variability inferred from different proxies and the magnitude of the vegetation responses; 18 19 iii) offer a quantitative (e.g., temperature or precipitation) and qualitative (e.g., colder/warmer, wetter/drier) visual representation of past variability in climatic conditions, highlighting 20 differences and similarities between proxies and regions; iv) (partly) understand the 21 mechanisms behind these changes and variability. 22

23

### 24 **2. Data compilation and selection criteria**

The selection of best available records was guided, as much as possible, by the following criteria: i) the record should cover a fraction of the INTIMATE 60-8 ka time frame; ii)

1 the record should include at least one quantitative or semi-quantitative parameter (proxy or 2 reconstruction); iii) the records should be independently dated or tightly linked to a well-dated 3 record age model. However, during the INTIMATE workshop it emerged that the Lateglacial and 4 early Holocene was the most intensively studied period in CEE and that most records include 5 pollen data. Abiotic proxies (geomorphology, fluvial sediments, stable isotopes, geochemistry, etc) were less used, and usually with a generalised or even contradictory explanation of the 6 7 mechanisms linking them to climatic parameters. Loess, on the other hand, appeared as the most complete palaeo-archive for the period beyond the Lateglacial, albeit with a lower 8 9 resolution and less precise chronology.

10 We first identified *non-pollen records* in order to eliminate the problem of discriminating between the forcing (*i.e.*, climate change) and the response (*i.e.*, vegetation change). In the 11 12 second step, we eliminated those records where it was not clear how a measured variable 13 registered the climatic signal or what the mechanism was by which changes in measured values were assigned to a given climate change. However, due to the extremely low number of suitable 14 15 records, we have also included the pollen-based annual, summer and winter temperature 16 reconstructions from Romania as these are among the very few quantitative climate estimates, are well dated and represent the longest quantitative records from the region. The resulting 17 quantitative and semi-quantitative temperature reconstructions are based on two chironomid 18 19 records, from Poland (Płóciennik et al., 2011) and Romania, respectively (Tóth et al., 2012); a  $\delta^{18}$ O record from speleothems in Romania (Tămaş et al., 2005), a  $\delta^{18}$ O record from bulk 20 carbonates in lake sediments from Slovenia (Andrič et al., 2009), and a pollen-based 21 quantitative reconstruction of summer, winter and mean annual temperature (MAT), as well 22 annual precipitation from NW Romania (Feurdean et al., 2008 a, b). The climate data are 23 24 presented in two distinct time frames: MIS 3 (60-28 cal BP) and MIS 2 (28-14.7 cal BP), and 25 Lateglacial to early Holocene (14.7-8 ka). Discussions follow a north to south gradient.

26

We have used the ages and depth-age models as provided by the authors (see Table 1)

1 for the number of dated points and temporal resolution for each record. All data were plotted on 2 their own depth-age model against the NGRIP stable isotope record (Rasmussen et al., 2006) 3 and INTIMATE event stratigraphy (Blockley et al., 2012b) for the 14.7-8 ka period (Fig. 2), and 4 subsequently used to make a semi-quantitative assessment of the climate characteristics in the 5 region (Table 2). A complete description of the general mechanisms by which these proxies are 6 recording the climatic variables, the methods used to date and extract the climatic signal and 7 the associated problems are found in a companion paper by Moreno et al. (this issue) on 8 Western European climate changes between 60 and 8 ka.

9 To examine the vegetation response to the climate fluctuations we selected a total of 13 pollen sequences with good temporal and spatial coverage in CEE as follows: for small 10 countries only a single pollen sequence was included, whereas for larger countries, or those 11 12 with significant elevation gradients, the two most complete continuous records per country were 13 selected. The pollen taxa in these sequences were then grouped into ecological types that largely follow the protocol for assigning pollen taxa to plant functional types and subsequently 14 biomes (Fletcher et al., 2010; Moreno et al., this volume). The 5 main types were: coniferous, 15 16 cold deciduous trees, temperate deciduous taxa, warm temperate taxa, warm /dry steppe, and 17 other grassland and dry shrubland (Table 2). In addition, pollen and plant macrofossil maps were created for the following time slices: 17, 14.7 13.5, 12.7, 11.7, 10.5, 9.3, 8.2 ka cal BP for 18 19 each record, to aid better geographical visualization of the vegetation dynamics in the CEE.

Quantitative reconstruction of climatic conditions during 60-8 ka in the CEE region poses a series of challenges, including: 1) a lack of investigated records for most of the period extending beyond the Lateglacial, or extremely fragmentary and low-temporal resolution records (the notable exceptions are loess deposits, see below); 2) imprecise age control (up to 10% dating uncertainties), which prevents accurate identification of the "short"-lived (less than 500 yrs) events; 3) difficulties in constraining the significance of the various measured variables in terms of climatic parameter or how the measured values were quantified. Insufficient temporal

resolution and chronological control of the records also prevented: 1) the assignment of accurate dates for the timing of the short climatic events, and 2) a precise correlation, in terms of "synchronicity" or "lags", between the local climatic shifts and the INTIMATE event stratigraphy. However, within the dating uncertainties, possible correlations have been proposed.

6

# 7 3. Climate changes in CEE

8 Our analysis is based on stable isotope variations in lake sediments, speleothems, loess 9 and chironomid assemblages (Fig. 2), but is restricted to loess and speleothem records for the 10 interval between 60 and 14.7 ka.

11

### 12 3.1. 60-8 ka

13 3.1.1. Loess records

Loess covers large parts of CEE, especially in areas south of the previous maximal 14 extent of the former Fenoscandian Ice Sheet. Its distribution widens eastward, towards the 15 Ukrainian and Russian lowlands. The province can further be subdivided into 5 subprovinces, 16 each experiencing contrasting palaeoclimate: 1. between the Alps and the Carpathians; 2. north 17 of the Carpathians; 3. the middle Danube Basin; 4. the lower Danube Basin and the northern 18 19 coast of the Black Sea; and 5. Ukrainian and Russian continental lowlands (Table 4). The source and transport directions of loess in these areas are diverse, with material in the N and E 20 21 parts of the CEE loess belt likely a large deflation area south of former ice margins. By contrast, the central Danube Basin loess is probably initially eroded from high mountain regions and then 22 transported and deposited in floodplains of the Danube and tributaries (Buggle et al., 2008; 23 24 Ujvári et al., 2013). Based on grain size investigations at three loess sections west and another 25 five east of the Carpathian Mountains, Bokhorst et al. (2011) suggested a prevailing westerly wind over CEE during the MIS 3, and a dominant north-westerly wind during the GS-2. 26

Generally, this interpretation corresponds well with the major wind directions previously
 reconstructed by Rozycki (1991) and Marković et al. (2008) based on loess landform orientation
 and modeling results (Rousseau et al., 2011; Sima et al., 2013).

4 The Eastern European loess belt provides a unique opportunity for almost continuous 5 climatic reconstructions over this part of Europe between 60 and 14.7 ka. However each subprovince experienced quite different palaeoclimatic conditions over the time period 6 7 investigated and recovering climatic information is therefore complicated due to the changing 8 influence of specific controls on the preserved proxies. One of the earliest attempts used soil types as indicators of past climatic conditions. However, the significant palaeoenvironmental 9 diversity over the region controls the intensity and type of pedogenesis, meaning the resultant 10 palaeosols represent a wide variety of habitats, from tundra gley layers (Rousseau et al., 2011; 11 12 Antoine et al., 2013), parklands and grasslands soils in the Middle Danube and Ukraine 13 (Gerasimenko and Rousseau, 2008; Marković et al., 2008; Schatz et al., 2011; Kovács et al., 2012), to dry steppic soils in the Lower Danube lowland and around the Black Sea coast 14 (Buggle et al., 2009). Furthermore, uncertainties in loess age models (see Timar-Gabor et al., 15 16 2011; Timar-Gabor and Wintle, 2013 for the Romanian loess) prevent confident correlation of palaeopedological horizons in the CEE with individual NW European interstadials such as: 17 Denekamp, Hengelo, Moershoofd or Glinde, or to specific Greenland interstadials. Refining 18 19 these correlations represents a significant avenue of future research.

Despite this, attempts have been made to correlate multiple episodes of abrupt climatic fluctuations recorded in loess grain-size from Moravian Czech Republic and Central Ukrainian deposits, with cooling in the North Atlantic, partly associated with Heinrich events as well as with cold phases of Dansgaard-Oeschger cycles recorded in Greenland ice (Antoine et al., 2009, 2013; Rousseau et al., 2011). However, investigations in N Serbia using a similar chronological framework and level of uncertainty suggest that it is only possible to establish relationships between grain-size peaks in loess and some Heinrich Events, rather than Greenland stadial

1 events, which require greater precision in age-dating (Stevens et al., 2011) and depending on 2 their magnitude may not show a grain-size response. In any case, Hatté et al. (2013) suggest 3 that these coarse-grain depositional phases are usually associated with the appearance of dry 4 and probably cold climatic events. More frequent periods of coarser grain deposition occurred 5 during the MIS 3 under dominant westerly air circulation (Bokhorst et al., 2011). This greater 6 deposition of coarser material during the relatively cold early last glacial (loosely 74 to 50 ka) 7 compared to during the period around the last glacial maximum is likely to be a consequence of reorganization of atmospheric circulation due to initial ice sheet growth and sediment 8 9 mobilization, as well as changes in depositional regime of the Danube fluvial system. By 10 contrast, during the MIS 2 although ice sheet growth was significantly greater (Wolfarth, 2010), maximal extension of northern European ice may have partially blocked penetration of the 11 12 Atlantic air masses to the east (Dodonov and Baiguzina, 1995). Model results of Van 13 Huissteden and Pollard (2003) indicate a strong anticyclonal circulation over the Fennoscandian 14 Ice Sheet around the last glacial maximum. At the same time, the Alpine ice cap played an important role in the hydrological regime of the Danube River through controlling the 15 16 considerable melt-water driven flow of the system, as well as in the production and transport of 17 source material for later aeolian deposition (Marković et al., 2008). The shift to finer depositional modes is also likely to have been associated with changes to more dense vegetation cover 18 19 during MIS 2 in Serbia (Marković et al., 2005; Zech et al., 2009, 2013).

The relatively sparse quantitative climatic reconstructions from loess subprovinces north of the Carpathians and in the middle Danube Basin generally suggest that the Carpathians significantly modified last glacial climatic gradients. Based on the spatial distribution of ice wedge casts recorded in last glacial loess, Jary (2009) suggested that in the central and E parts of Poland and W Ukraine, permafrost developed twice; in the latest part of early last glacial (potentially equivalent to Heinrich Event (HE) 6) and the late last glacial (approximately from HE2 to YD). Mean annual air temperature (MAAT) has been estimated as between -2 and -6 °C

1 during the older phase (Vandenberghe et al., 1998; Renssen and Vandenberghe, 2003; Vandenberghe et al., 2004), while the common occurrence and large size of the younger phase 2 3 of cryogenic structures indicates continuous areas of permafrost existed in the central and E 4 parts of Poland and W Ukraine. Assuming this interpretation is correct, the MAAT of the coldest phase of the late last glacial was most likely 10 to 15 °C lower than present. Similar 5 environmental conditions are suggested from loess in the N parts of the Ukrainian and Russian 6 7 lowlands (Little et al., 2002). However, significantly drier and warmer conditions are indicated by the general absence of cryo features (Marković et al., 2008) and the relatively high July 8 palaeotemperatures reconstructed from malacofauna (Sümegi and Krolopp, 2002; Marković et 9 al., 2007; Molnár et al., 2010) in the Danubian loess south of the Carpathian Basin, reinforcing 10 the suggestion of diverse climates found in this region. Cold spells related to Heinrich Events, 11 12 the LGM and YD were inferred from a biomarker record from the NW Black Sea region (40-9 13 ka), but the amplitude of these cold phases was apparently smaller than lake temperature records in the region or other records from central Europe would suggest (Sanchi et al., 2014). 14 Dansgaard-Oeschger variability was not detected in this record. 15

16

### 17 *3.1.2.* Speleothem records

The deposition of speleothems in caves of CEE during this time span is discontinuous, 18 19 showing intervals (with variable length) of enhanced and decreased (or even ceased) growth. Such periods are traditionally associated with either warm or cold intervals, respectively. The 20 21 cumulative growth frequency record of 62 U/Th-dated speleothems from different karst regions in NW Romania situated between 450 and 1150 m asl, show more continuous growth during the 22 past 60 ka yrs (Onac, 1996, 2001; Onac and Lauritzen, 1996; Lauritzen and Onac, 1999) 23 24 compared to those at higher latitudes, although the Scandinavian Ice Sheet was only 500 km 25 away (Ehlers et al., 2011). This confirms that NW Romania was neither covered by alpine glaciers nor experienced enough severe permafrost conditions to suppress water percolation 26

into the caves and hence speleothem growth. Further, the growth of a stalagmite in NW Romania between 59 and 46 ka indicates a warm/wet period (Tămaş and Causse, 2001). In contrast, the palaeoclimate records from alpine caves in Central and Western Europe are sparse over this time period (Spötl et al., 2006) are sparse over this time period because the presence of ice caps caused a significant temperature drop, prompting permafrost development, thus preventing the continuous growth of speleothems.

7 An almost continuous isotope record covering the period between 60 and 8 ka was documented by Constantin et al. (2007) from a cave in SW Romania (stalagmite PP10 in Poleva 8 Cave). Its  $\delta^{18}$ O isotopic values show an increase from 60 to 57 ka when they reach a maximum 9 of -7.7 ‰. This interval was interpreted as representing warming at the onset of Marine Isotope 10 Stage 3 (MIS 3). After this event, the oxygen isotopic profile suggests an overall cooling trend 11 12 emphasized by the gradual  $\delta^{18}$ O decrease to -9.0 ‰ at ~42 ka when the stalagmite ceased to grow for a short period of time. Beyond this hiatus, the  $\delta^{18}$ O values decrease abruptly to -10.5 13 % indicating an extreme cold phase between 38 and 35 ka. The gradual increase of  $\delta^{18}$ O 14 values by ca. 2 ‰ after 38 ka and until 25 ka points toward a moderate warming, which was 15 16 followed by rapid cooling at the beginning of the Last Glacial Maximum when the speleothem 17 ceased to grow until the end of the Younger Dryas (Constantin et al., 2007). The cold interval recorded in the PP10 stalagmite between 38 and 35 ka was also documented from central 18 Romania, where archaeological findings in Gura Cheii - Râșnov Cave suggest a cold phase 19 prior to 40 and until at least 34 ka cal BP (Cârciumaru et al., 2012). 20

A new study by Dragusin et al. (2014) demonstrates that  $\delta^{18}$ O record does not show significant variations (-9.2±0.3 ‰) across the 8.2 ka event in the POM2 stalagmite (Ascunsa Cave, SW Romania). The low isotopic variability during the 8.2 ka event apparently reflect only temperature variations, but hydrologic conditions such as relatively more summer vs. winter rainfall cannot be ruled out. One clear indication that environmental conditions changed is the growth rate, which increased 8 times during this event compared to the rest of the Holocene.

# 2 3.2. GI-1e

The beginning of GI-1 in the Greenland Ice Core record is centred at 14,692 b2k and 3 4 shows a temperature amplitude increase of 10 °C over just a few years (Blockley et al., 2012b). 5 A warming trend was noticed throughout CEE about the same time (Table 2); however, the timing and magnitude of this warming can only be roughly estimated (Fig. 2). For example in 6 7 Slovenia, the  $\delta^{18}$ O on bulk carbonates from lake sediments indicates a sharp increase in summer temperatures at 14.8 ka cal BP, followed by relatively stable conditions (Andrič et al., 8 2009). Similarly, a rapid warming phase initiated at ~14.8 ka cal BP is revealed by the  $\delta^{18}$ O 9 values of a speleothem from NW Romania (Tămaş et al., 2005) and was also inferred from the 10 growth intervals of another speleothem in Scărișoara Ice Cave (Onac, 2001). For the same 11 12 region, Feurdean et al. (2008) used pollen to document a 2 °C increase (from 2 to 4 °C) in annual temperatures that correlate well with the timing of the GS-2/GI-1e transition in 13 Greenland, increase generated by winter temperatures only (summer temperatures remained 14 15 unchanged). A chironomid-based reconstruction of summer temperatures in the S Romanian 16 Carpathians indicates an increase of ~2.8 °C in summer air temperature during the same 17 transition, reaching a maximum of ~8.1 °C (Tóth et al., 2012). Further to the NE during the same period, July temperatures fluctuated between 12 and 16 °C in central Poland (Ralska-18 19 Jasiewiczowa et al., 1998, pollen data), 13-16.5 °C at Żabieniec bog, central Poland (Płóciennik et al., 2011, chironomid assemblages) and 15.5-16.5 °C at Lake Okunin, in NW Ukraine 20 (Dobrowolski et al., 2001, ostracod assemblages). In the eastern Baltic area, July temperatures 21 below 12 °C (Kirilova et al., 2011 - chironomid data; Veski et al., 2012, pollen data) were 22 characteristic during the early phase of the Lateglacial (roughly overlapping with GI-1e in 23 24 Greenland).

25

## 26 3.3. G1-1d through GI-1a

1 The climatic conditions during this time interval are seen as relatively stable in most of 2 the records, with only two small-leaved decline in annual temperatures, that could be tentatively correlated with GI-1d and GI-1b in Greenland (Fig. 2). Based on the  $\delta^{18}$ O record, Tămaş et al. 3 (2005) report a decline (~1 ‰ in the  $\delta^{18}$ O values) in mean annual temperatures, punctuated by 4 5 rapid and strongly expressed cooling events that could correlate with GI-1d and GI-1b. Chironomid-based July temperatures in S Romania (Tóth et al., 2012) and central Poland 6 7 (Płóciennik et al., 2011) were relatively stable with values slightly lower than those during GI-1e (e.g., a weak increase to 8.1-8.6 °C between 13,700 and 11,480 cal BP in Romania). Instead, 8 pollen-based quantitative reconstructions from NW Romania (Feurdean et al., 2008a) indicate 9 that between 13,800 and 12,700 cal BP (i.e., during GI-1a-c in Greenland), summer 10 temperatures rose close to modern values (13 to 17 °C), whereas winter (ca. -6 to -12 °C) and 11 12 annual temperatures (0.5 to 6 °C) as well as precipitation (550 to 700 mm) were still lower (Fig. 13 2), indicating stronger inter-seasonal variability and enhanced continental conditions compared to the present-day climate. The  $\delta^{18}$ O based climate reconstruction at Lake Bled (Slovenia) 14 shows warmer conditions after 13,800 cal BP (Andrič et al., 2009; Lane et al., 2011), whereas 15 16 the chironomid assemblages indicate a lowering of the lake level connected to warmer and drier 17 environment (Andrič et al., 2009). Another line of evidence for warmer summer temperatures comes from fire activity, which increased between 13,800 and 12,700 cal BP in the Carpathian 18 19 Mountains and lowlands of Hungary and Slovenia (Willis et al., 1997; Andrič et al., 2009; Feurdean et al., 2012a). 20

- 21
- 22 3.4. GS-1

A decline in average temperatures occurred throughout the region after 12,800 cal BP, correlating, within dating uncertainties, with the onset of GS-1 in Greenland. July temperatures registered a decline of 1 °C in Poland and S Romania (chironomids-based; Płóciennik et al., 2011; Tóth et al., 2012), and 2 °C in NW Romania (pollen estimate; Feurdean et al., 2008a).

However, pollen-based estimated winter temperatures drop ~ 9 °C (Feurdean et al., 2008a), 1 2 whereas precipitation declines by ca. 250 mm (Fig. 2). Similarly, diatom inferred winter ice cover 3 in the southern Carpathians suggests that cooling associated to the GS-1 was mainly expressed 4 during winter (Buczkó et al. 2012). Drier and cooler conditions for the stadial are indicated by  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O in speleothems from Romania (Tămas et al., 2005, Romania);  $\delta^{13}$ O (Lane et al., 5 6 2011), chironomid assemblages and lake level in a lacustrine sequence from Slovenia (Andrič 7 et al., 2009), and ostracod assemblages from Poland (Dobrowolski et al., 2001). A drop in precipitation at the onset of GS-1 is also shown by the decreased fluvial activity from Poland 8 (Starkel et al., 2013). Although the GS-1 was generally dry, the record from Northern Poland 9 10 shows that the onset of lacustrine sedimentation occurred during this period, but was most intensive during the first half of the GS-1 (Michczyńska et al. 2013). Further, Goslar et al. (1995) 11 have ascribed rapid fluctuations in  $\delta^{18}$ O of authigenic carbonates in Lake Gościaż (central 12 Poland) to changes in air temperature, synchronous (within dating uncertainiy) with those seen 13 14 in the Greenland ice cores. The rapid (within 170 years) cooling at the onset of the Younger 15 Dryas was foolowed by an even rapid warming (at 11,440 cal BP), seen as a 2 ‰ increase in  $\delta^{18}$ O values within ~70 years. 16

Summarizing the records above, it appears that the decline in temperatures between 12,800 and 11,700 cal BP (corresponding to GS-1) in CEE was more pronounced for winter than for summer, which, along with evidence for a marked drop in precipitation, indicates a progression transition towards more continental, arid or seasonally variable climatic conditions (Table 2).

22

## 23 **3.5. Early Holocene**

Independent palaeoclimatological evidence from CEE suggests that transition to markedly warmer and drier conditions (summers) occurred at 40-50 °N approximately between 11.7 and 8 ka cal BP. In the northern part of Central Europe (above 47 °N), the temperature

1 increase was significantly slower and with smaller magnitudes compared to more southern locations (Table 2). Higher (by 1 - 1.5 °C) than today summer temperatures have been both 2 reconstructed (Seppä and Poska, 2004; Feurdean et al., 2008b; Seppä et al., 2009) and 3 4 modelled (Renssen et al., 2009) for the region during the Early Holocene. Higher summer 5 temperature and lower moisture availability is also demonstrated by the increase in fire activity over large areas and elevations of CEE (Andrič et al., 2008; 2009; Magyari et al., 2010; 6 7 Feurdean et al., 2012; 2013; Connor et al., 2013; Hájková et al., 2013). Climate simulation of the early Holocene for the lowlands of NW Romania (Transylvania) shows, higher summer 8 9 temperatures (by about 4 °C) and lower precipitation values (by about ~33%) but only 10 moderately higher annual temperatures compared to present-day values (Feurdean et al., 2013). In the southern part of the region (Poleva Cave in SW Romania), the steady increase of 11 the  $\delta^{18}$ O values (up to 2‰) in speleothems PP 9 and 10 indicates a gradual warming trend from 12 13 ~11.5 ka, continuing well into the Holocene (Constantin et al., 2007), with similar warming 14 trends seen west (Slovenia, Andrič et al, 2009) and north (Romania, Tămaş et al., 2005) of this site, while more northern regions experienced a less pronounced warming. There is also 15 evidence for a decrease in peat surface moisture and lake levels in NW and E Romania at the 16 beginning of the Holocene (Magyari et al., 2009; Buzcko et al., 2012; Feurdean et al., 2013) and 17 in northeastern Polish lakes (Gałka and Tobolski, 2013; Gałka et al., 2014; Gałka and Sznel, 18 19 2013), while rivers in NW Romania changed their behaviour from braided to meandering, indicating lower discharge and related lower amounts of precipitation (Persoiu, 2010). 20 Simultaneously, kettle hole peatland in N Poland reveals a fen-bog transition, suggesting a 21 decrease in the ground water table, likely related to the complete disappearance of permafrost 22 (Lamentowicz et al., 2008; Słowiński, 2010). The Lake Gościaż record, a lacustrine sequence 23 24 with the highest temporal resolution in the region (1-4 yr/cm), shows an overall warming and 25 drying trend at the Lateglacial/Holocene transition, but with three sub-phases: a phase of dry winter conditions (11.55-11.52 cal BP); a second phase with warm, moist summer conditions 26

(11.52-11.46 cal BP) and a third phase with dry summers (11.46-11.39 cal BP), which caused a
 lowering of the lake level. In central Poland, only a small (if any) summer temperature increase
 is observed in chironomid assemblages during the Early Holocene, compared to the late GS-1
 (Płóciennik et al., 2011).

5

## 6 4. Biotic response

## 7 4.1. Vegetation response to climatic oscillations from 60-20 ka

8 Unlike in S Europe (Fletcher et al., 2010), continuous last glacial lake or mire sediments are very rare and the chronology uncertain in CEE (Šercelj, 1966). Nonetheless, several shorter 9 10 middle last glacial (60-27 ka) loess and solifluction clay sediments have been studied for pollen and plant macrofossils in this region. This, together with the numerous macrocharcoal studies 11 12 from archaeological sites (Środoń, 1968, 1987; Willis and van Andel, 2004; Jankovská and 13 Pokorný, 2008; Komar et al., 2009; Nádor et al., 2011), allow us a general characterisation of the MIS 3 and 2 vegetation in CEE, and a preliminary interpretation of region-wide vegetation 14 responses to rapid climate change events. 15

In the western Carpathians, pollen and plant macrofossil analyses on peat deposits of 16 17 MIS 3 provide evidence for a dense taiga forest cover until the onset of the last glacial maximum (Jankovská et al., 2002; Jankovská and Pokorný, 2008; Kuneš et al., 2008). The record of 18 19 Šafárka (Fig. 3) starts at ~52 ka, ends at around 16 ka cal BP and shows a forest succession from Larix decidua to dense Picea abies taiga. Both Picea abies and Larix decidua macrofossils 20 21 were abundant at the site and Jankovská et al. (2002) inferred the local presence of several other mainly boreal trees like Betula, Alnus, Pinus cembra and P. sylvestris. Pollen of temperate 22 deciduous trees (Corylus, Ulmus, Quercus, Tilia, Fagus and Carpinus) was also recorded and 23 24 the regional presence of these tree taxa was inferred in the Western Carpathians.

Solifluction clay deposits in the northern piedmont zone of the Carpathians (*e.g.*, Dobra,
 Sowliny) indicate that members of herb communities, typical alpine grasslands (*Callianthemum*)

1 coriandrifolium, Dianthus speciosus, Helianthemum alpestre, Leontodon pseudotaraxaci, Linum 2 extraaxillare, Minuartia sedoides, M. verna, Polygonum viviparum, Potentilla aurea, Selaginella selaginoides, Soldanella carpathica), snowbed and scree communities (Arabis alpina, 3 4 Doronicum stiriacum, Cerastium Iapponicum, Ranunculus montanus) were found at altitudes of 5 300-640 m between 40 and 29 ka cal BP (MIS 3; Środoń 1987). Lowland steppe plants were 6 also present (e.g., Alyssum, Artemisia, Aster alpinus, Potentilla heptaphylla, Chenopodiaceae, 7 Festuca, Filipendula, Helianthemum). Macrofossil evidence shows that these were accompanied by cold temperate and boreal trees and tundra dwarf shrubs: Alnus incana, Betula 8 nana, B. pubescens, Larix, Picea excelsa, Pinus cembra, Pinus sylvestris, Populus and Salix, 9 altogether forming a non-analogue steppe-tundra vegetation in association with boreal forest 10 communities. The woody component of these communities was very similar to the Šafárka flora 11 12 suggesting both, open and closed boreal forests in the Western Carpathians. Loess pollen 13 studies in S Poland and S Ukraine furthermore demonstrate that lowland areas north and east of the Carpathian Mountains hosted a vegetation mosaic of steppe tundra and boreal parkland 14 forests, dominated by Pinus sylvestris, Pinus cembra, Betula, Larix, Picea abies, Abies alba and 15 16 various shrubs (Komar et al., 2009). Open woodlands reached well into middle Poland during 17 the MIS 3 (Mamakowa and Latałowa, 2003; Szczepanek et al., 2007).

Vegetation in the lowland and hill zone W, E and S of the Carpathian Mountains over the 18 same period is mainly recorded by macrocharcoal and pollen studies of archaeological sites or 19 loess exposures (e.g., Urban, 1984; Svoboda and Svobodová, 1985; Opravil, 1994; Culiberg 20 and Šercelj, 1995; Haesaerts et al., 1996, 2010; Damblon, 1997; Damblon and Haesaerts, 21 1997; Rudner and Sümegi 2001; Musil, 2003). These studies demonstrate that during the MIS 3 22 a wide spectrum of tree species e.g., Abies alba, Alnus, Betula nana, B. pubescens, B. pendula, 23 24 Carpinus betulus, Corylus, Fagus sylvatica, Fraxinus, Juniperus communis, Larix, Pinus 25 sylvestris, P. mugo, P. cembra, Picea abies, P. excelsa, Populus, Quercus, Salix, Sorbus aucuparia, Ulmus were present in the lowland and hill zones of E Austria, the Czech Republic 26

1 (Moravia, Bohemia), Slovakia, Hungary, Romania and Slovenia. The most diverse woody 2 assemblages were dated to between 35 – 30 ka cal BP (Willis and van Andel, 2004), these also 3 include the oceanic Taxus baccata that likely grew in association with Fagus sylvatica in 4 Moravia (Mason et al., 1994). Notable is that Moravia in the Czech Republic showed 5 exceptional tree diversity with several temperate deciduous tree taxa. In comparison, the 6 lowlands of the Carpathian Basin were dominated by boreal trees such as *Picea abies*. Larix. 7 Betula and Pinus sylvestris (Rudner and Sümegi, 2001), whereas temperate deciduous tree macrocharcoal fragments (Carpinus betulus) are rare in these sequences, suggesting their 8 scarcity in the loess accumulation zone. A greater extent of forest cover (Pinus-dominated) 9 during the early part of MIS 3 (55-38 ka) compared to the period after 38 ka was very recently 10 identified in a pollen record from lowlands of Transylvania (Feurdean et al., sub). This difference 11 12 in the two areas may potentially be explained by the more varied topography of the Czech 13 Republic and its less continental climate. The response of vegetation to climate change during the MIS 3 has been studied in the eastern Hungarian Plain by Nádor et al. (2011), who found 14 Pinus, Picea and Ulmus dominance between 40-30 ka, along with sporadic regional occurrence 15 16 of Tilia, Carpinus betulus, Fagus sylvatica, Quercus, and Corylus avellana, but no increases in 17 arboreal pollen between 40 and 30 ka. This pollen record complements the macrocharcoal record in that it suggests the dominance of mixed deciduous-coniferous forests. 18

19 Moving to the southeast, a mid to late last glacial (MIS 3) vegetation record from Straldzha Mire in the Thracian Plain, Bulgaria shows the dominance of cold steppe vegetation 20 21 with herbs until MIS 2 (Artemisia, Poaceae, Polygonum aviculare type, Chenopodiaceae) (Connor et al., 2013). Notably, the pollen record shows no sign of millennial-scale vegetation 22 fluctuation. On the basis of the pollen data, Connor et al. (2013) inferred the small-scale 23 24 presence of xeric woodland with Quercus, Juniperus and Rosaceae trees/shrubs in the 25 Artemisia-steppe dominated landscape during the period. Comparable vegetation likely prevailed in the south-easternmost part of the Carpathian region, in Serbia (Marković et al., 26

2007, 2008; Zech et al., 2013). In Slovenia, the middle last glacial-associated pollen spectra
 from Ljubljana Moor show fluctuations between mixed coniferous-deciduous woodland
 comprising *Abies*, *Betula*, *Alnus*, *Corylus*, *Quercus*, *Tilia*, *Ulmus*, *Acer*, *Salix* and *Juglans* and
 periods of predominantly steppe-dominated landscape with *Pinus* and *Picea* (Šercelj, 1966).

5 The MIS 3 - 2 transitional sections of the pollen records of the Carpathians and lowlands in E Hungary show: i) a predominance of needle-leaved and cold temperate tree vegetation in 6 7 the W Carpathians (at Jablunka and Safarka); ii) increased representation of steppe herbs in the 8 more continental E Carpathians (Lake St Anne) and lowlands of W Romania (Lake Stiucii); and 9 iii) recurring fluctuations in AP values in the Carpathians Basin (Fehér Lake, Nagymohos; Rudner and Sümegi 2001; Sümegi et al., 2013; Fig. 3). The last glacial maximum part of these 10 pollen records suggests that some woody cover was maintained in these regions during the 11 12 maximum northern hemisphere ice extent (between 26.5 and 19 ka cal BP). This picture is similar to the Thracian Plain (42° N) vegetation response in that it shows no large amplitude 13 vegetation change during the last glacial maximum, although cold steppe dominates at this 14 more southerly latitude, pointing to increased continentality towards the south (Connor et al., 15 16 2013). Temperate deciduous tree pollen is recorded in the Carpathian area, but macrofossils or 17 charcoal of these taxa have not been reported from the last glacial maximum.

18

4.2. Spatial vegetation response to the climate conditions at the end of GS-2 (20-14.7 ka
 cal BP).

A few of the selected high-resolution pollen records in CEE stretch back to the end of GS-2 (20-14.7 ka cal BP). Arranged on a S to N transect, these pollen records reveal three features of the vegetation during this period: i) that the vegetation assemblages were marked by a high proportion of non-arboreal pollen, principally *Artemisia*, Chenopodiaceae and Poaceae; ii) there is an increase in steppe and grasslands along a north (20%) to south (90%) transect, with sites located south of 45 °N (Rila Mountains and the Thracian Plain in Bulgaria) showing

1 the strongest continental conditions; iii) the persistence of open woodlands /parkland forest in 2 CEE (Figs. 4, 5). There is some spatial distinctiveness in the tree species composition and proportion in CEE: i) regions north of 55 °N and east of 20 °E (Latvia, Lithuania, Belarus) 3 4 contain more abundant pioneer species of the tundra and boreal zone (Betula nana, Betula, 5 Pinus); ii) in the Carpathian region (55 °N and 15-25 °E Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary, Romania). Pinus was abundant with a comparatively lower proportion of cold deciduous taxa 6 7 (Betula, Alnus, Salix); iii) in Slovenia (46 °N) Pinus dominated the record entirely; iv) in the Balkans there is also a high proportion of needle-leaved taxa (Figs. 4, 5). Pollen of temperate 8 deciduous taxa (Quercus, Ulmus, Tilia, Carpinus and Fagus) was also recorded in Hungary, 9 10 Romania and Slovenia (Figs. 4, 5; Fărcaş and Tantău, 2012). Plant macrofossil remains of trees are virtually absent in all these sequences. However, woody plant macrofossils of conifers dated 11 12 to the end of GS-2 are known from loess deposits (see Willis and Andel, 2004), and from fluvial 13 sediments in the lowlands of Transylvania (Lascu, 2003). Pollen records covering the end part of GS-2 reinforce the idea that most of the CEE landscapes supported open forest principally 14 needle-leaved and cold deciduous trees, and a small population of temperate deciduous trees 15 16 during the late GS-2, whereas more compact temperate deciduous populations were confined to latitudes south of 46 °N. Although pollen of long-distance transported or reworked origin could 17 have increased the proportion of arboreal taxa during the glacial period, the prevalence of harsh 18 19 climatic conditions for growth and reproduction could have reduced pollen production.

20

## 21 4.3 Spatial vegetation response during GI-1e

Fossil pollen and plant macrofossil sequences from the continental records of CEE indicate that there was a large-scale reduction in dry steppe vegetation and a northern latitudinal expansion of boreal forest vegetation around 14.7 ka cal BP, that correlate approximately to the onset of GI-1 e in Greenland. However, the CEE pollen records also show that the magnitude of vegetational response was not uniform; i) regions from Baltic area (north

1 of 55 °N and 25 °E), previously covered or closer to the ice sheets and permafrost (Estonia, 2 Latvia, Lithuania) show abundant pollen of pioneer taxa such as Betula nana (Amon et al., 3 2010; Amon et al., 2012; Veski et al., 2012), while more eastern records from Belarus (south of 4 54 °N and east of 24 °E) contain a higher proportion of pollen of *Pinus* (up to 90% Zernitskaya, 5 2005; Makhnach et al., 2009). In addition, plant macrofossil records from the Baltic region 6 suggest that a tundra biome (Betula nana) with patchy occurrences of tree birch including 7 Betula sect. Albae (Stančikaitė et al., 2008) occupied the newly deglaciated areas, while boreal tree taxa (Betula and Pinus) expanded from 13.4 ka cal BP in Estonia (Amon et al., 2012), at ca. 8 14.4 ka cal BP in Latvia and Estonia (Heikkila et al., 2009; Veski et al., 2012), and at ~ 14 ka cal 9 BP in south-eastern Lithuania (Stančikaitė et al., 2008) and the northern part of Poland (Gałka 10 et al., 2013). 11

12 In the central part of CEE, including the Carpathians region (46-50 °N; 15-22 °E), there 13 was a considerable increase in biomass and an expansion of boreal forests around 14.7 ka cal BP (Figs. 4, 5). Nevertheless, significant elevational distinctiveness in the vegetation existed in 14 this region. For example, pollen records from sites in the lowlands (Kis Mohos in Hungary, Avrig 15 in Romania) indicate the presence of more fragmented or more open forests of needle-leaved 16 17 (Larix, Pinus), and cold deciduous taxa (Betula, Alnus and Salix); whilst sites in the uplands (Steregoiu, Romania, Lapysky, Slovakia) contained more extensive boreal forests (Figs. 4, 5; 18 19 Willis et al., 1998; Wohlfarth et al., 2001; Björkman et al., 2002; Pokorný, 2002; Kuneš et al., 2008; Pokorný et al., 2010; Tanțău et al., 2006; 2014; Feurdean et al., 2007; 2012b). Plant 20 21 macrofossil records from this area support the inference of the local abundance of Pinus sylvestris, Pinus cembra, P. mugo, Betula and Salix in Romania already at 14,500 ka cal BP 22 (Wohlfarth et al., 2001; Feurdean et al., 2012b) and around 13.2 ka cal BP in the Czech 23 24 Republic (Jankovská, 1984). Further south (south of 46 °N) in Slovenia and Bulgaria, GI-1e is 25 marked by a greater diversity of tree taxa that include needle-leaved taxa such as Larix decidua (only dominant in Slovenia), Pinus diploxylon-type, P. peuce, Juniperus), xerophytic shrubs 26

(*Ephedra distachya, E. fragilis-type*), cold deciduous (*Betula, Salix, Alnus*), as well as temperate
deciduous taxa (*Quercus, Corylus, Acer*) (Tonkov et al., 2006; Andrič et al., 2009; Connor et al.,
2013). The latter group is also locally documented by sub-fossil wood remains of *Quercus, Ulmus* and Rosaceae (Magyari et al., 2008). The lowlands of SE Bulgaria, close to the Black
Sea, however, remained predominantly covered by steppe vegetation (Magyari et al., 2008,
Connor et al., 2013).

Summarizing our pollen and plant macrofossil data-sets for the onset of the Lateglacial,
there is evidence: i) for a northward expansion of boreal forest into CEE; ii) that extensive boreal
forests (needle-leaved) as well as small areas of temperate deciduous forests developed in
latitudes stretching between 45 and 55 °N; iii) that regions south of 45 °N also included
fragmented temperate deciduous forests.

12

#### 13 **4.4 Spatial vegetation response during GI 1a-c**

High-resolution pollen and plant macrofossil records from CEE indicate a further 14 northerly development of boreal forests containing Betula sect. Albae, Betula humilis, Pinus 15 sylvestris, Populus tremula, Picea abies, Juniperus communis and Alnus into the Baltic region 16 between 13.8 and 12.7 ka cal BP, which may correspond to the GI-1a-c warming in Greenland 17 (Stančikaitė et al., 2008, 2009; Heikilla et al., 2009; Amon et al., 2010; 2012; Gaidamavičius et 18 19 al., 2011; Veski et al., 2012), whereas the expansion of *Picea abies* in Belarus the was dated ca 13.2 ka cal. BP (Zernitskaya et al., 2005; Makhnach et al., 2009). The northern treeline became 20 located in central Estonia at ~58.5°N (Figs. 4, 5). In the Carpathian region (45-50 °N), forest 21 assemblages changed from those dominated by Pinus (Pinus spp., P. sylvestris, P. cembra, P. 22 mugo) and Betula to mixed Pinus, Picea abies and Betula (B. pubescens, B. pendula). 23 24 Generally, there is an increased proportion and diversity of cold deciduous taxa (Salix, 25 Sambucus, Alnus, Populus tremula, Prunus padus) but also of temperate tree species such as Ulmus, Quercus, Tilia, Fraxinus excelsior and Corylus avellana at most sites in this region (Figs. 26

4, 5). The plant macro-remains support the inference of more extensive, dense, and diverse
 forest cover during this time interval (Wohlfarth et al., 2001; Pokorný et al., 2002; Ampel, 2004;
 Kuneš et al., 2008; Latalowa et al., 2006; Feurdean et al., 2012b; Magyari et al., 2012).

Sites located south of 46 °N (Slovenia) contained almost pure needle-leaved forests (90%), with only minor contributions of cold deciduous (*Alnus, Betula, Salix*) and warm temperate deciduous taxa (*Quercus, Tilia, Fraxinus excelsior, Acer, Corylus avellana*) (Figs. 4, 5). Sites from Bulgaria (Rila Mountains; Tonkov et al., 2008, 2011), on the other hand, witnessed only modest forest expansion, composed of a mixture of needle-leaved, cold deciduous (primarily at higher elevations) and most notably of warm temperate deciduous taxa (mid-low elevations), whereas no forest expansion is visible in the Thracian Plain (Figs. 4, 5).

11 The response of vegetation to the GI-1a-c warming can be summarized as exhibiting: i) 12 the greatest spatial expansion of forest cover, forest density, and diversity during the 13 Lateglacial; ii) a more consistent spread of warmth-demanding temperate tree taxa; iii) the 14 expansion of more moisture-demanding trees (*Picea abies*) in the Carpathians Mountains; iv) 15 limited forest development in lowlands of SE Balkans (Figs. 4, 5).

16

#### 17 4.5 Spatial vegetation response during GS-1

Significant, region-wide changes in terrestrial vegetation composition occurred in CEE 18 19 around 12,700 cal yr BP, which may correlate with the onset of cold GS-1 event in Greenland. These largely included i) a decrease in plant biomass; ii) fragmentation of the boreal forest and 20 21 a more southerly displacement of temperate forest; and iii) a re-expansion of steppe and grassland vegetation (Figs. 4, 5). Superimposed on this large-scale pattern of vegetation 22 changes during GS-1 there is considerable north to south distinctiveness in the vegetation 23 composition. In the north-eastern Baltic area (N of 55° N and 25°E) there was a stronger re-24 expansion of tundra communities (Betula nana, Salix polaris), whereas trees disappeared 25 (Amon et al., 2012); ii) in the southern Baltic regions (Latvia, Lithuania, N Poland), small 26

1 populations of boreal tree species (Pinus, Betula, Picea) survived the cold GS-1 (Stančikaitė et 2 al., 2008, 2009; Gaidamavičius et al., 2011; Veski et al., 2012), iii) in Belarus, a tundra-forest (Picea) landscape developed N of 54 °N and E of 24 °E, and boreal forest S of 54 °N 3 (Zernitskava, 2008; Makhnach et al., 2009). Sites in the Carpathian region (45-50 °N) show 4 5 fragmentation of the boreal forests and reduced diversity, but also a replacement of large tracts of dry-adapted needle-leaved taxa (*Pinus* and *Larix*) and *Betula* by *Picea abies Alnus*. Ulmus. 6 7 Quercus (Fărcaș et al., 1999; Tantău et al., 2006; Feurdean et al., 2007). În Slovenia, a smallerscale contraction in the forest cover occurred with needle-leaved taxa (Pinus and Larix) 8 remaining the dominant vegetation type but also preserving temperate deciduous forest 9 composed of Quercus, Corylus, Tilia, Ulmus (Andric et al., 2009; Figs. 4, 5). Pollen sequences 10 at sites further south in the Balkans show either a contraction of forest cover (in the Rila 11 12 Mountains) that consisted of *Pinus*, *Betula* and *Quercus* and a corresponding marked expansion 13 of xeric herb communities, grasses and other cold-resistant heliophilous herbs (Tonkov et al., 2013), or the persistence (in the lowlands) of xeric steppe, semi-desert vegetation, in the area 14 near Black Sea (Connor et al., 2013). 15

Overall, apart of the general trend of contraction of the forest cover over the CEE during GS-1, there is also an increase in the steppe communities and therefore enhanced continentallity along a N to S latitudinal transect in this region.

19

### 20 **4.6. Other short-term fluctuations**

High-resolution pollen records from CEE also document smaller vegetation changes occurring around 13.9 ka cal BP (GI1-d), 13.6 ka (GI-c2) and 13.2 ka cal BP (GI-1b) (Fig. 5). This indicates that short-lived climate fluctuations have also produced some response in the vegetation composition in continental areas (Tanțău et al., 2006; 2014; Feurdean et al., 2007, 2012; Stančikaitė et al., 2008; Ammon et al., 2012; Magyari et al., 2012; Veski et al., 2012).

26

#### 1 4.7. Onset of the Holocene and early Holocene (11.7-8 ka cal BP)

2 Pollen and plant macrofossil records indicate that, from about 11.7 ka, there was a significant increase in biomass production, a retraction of cold- and dry-adapted taxa and a 3 4 general northward advance of many tree species into areas that were covered by permafrost 5 during the GS-1 (Figs. 4, 5). The species range shift was not uniform over the whole CEE. In the Baltic region (northern Poland, Lithuania, Belarus, Latvia and Estonia), both pollen and plant 6 7 macrofossil data suggest the establishment of Pinus-Betula forest, enriched by Picea at ca. 11.7 ka cal BP (Zernitskaya et al., 2005; Heikkilä et al., 2009; Veski et al., 2012), but temperate 8 deciduous forests (Ulmus, Quercus, Fraxinus) were largely absent from this region until about 9 10.5-10 ka cal BP (Stančikaitė et al., 2008, 2009; Gaidamavičius et al., 2011; Gryguc et al., 10 2014; Figs. 4, 5). At low and middle elevations in the Carpathian region (including Hungary, 11 12 Czech Republic, Slovakia), there was an initial increase in open woodlands of cold deciduous 13 temperate taxa (Alnus, Betula, Salix) at around 11.7 ka cal BP. This was then followed rapidly (11.3 ka cal BP) by a large-scale increase in temperate forests dominated by Ulmus, Quercus, 14 Tilia, Acer, Fraxinus excelsior, Corylus avellana, though the forests preserved a more open 15 16 character in lowlands (Willis et al., 1998; Tanțău et al., 2006, 2009; Magyari et al., 2010; Feurdean et al., 2012; 2013). This forest composition was preserved at least until 8 ka and 17 represented a larger extension of temperate forest than today. Plant macrofossil analysis at 18 19 these sites also indicates that Larix was a significant component of the very early Holocene forests likely as a response to continental conditions (Feurdean et al., 2007; Magyari et al., 20 21 2012b). A rapid expansion of *Pinus* and temperate deciduous taxa was documented in Slovenia (Andrič et al. 2008, 2009). In the Balkans (Rila Mts., Bulgaria) the rapid climate warming 22 initiated a widespread of pioneer Betula forests with P. sylvestris/mugo, P. peuce for the time 23 24 interval 11.6-9.8 ka at mid-higher elevations altitudes, which shaped the tree-line for nearly 25 4000 years after the onset of the Holocene. The fossil pollen record also revealed the beginning of a wide distribution of mixed Quercus forests with Tilia, Ulmus, Fraxinus excelsior, Acer below 26

the birch zone. These forests reached their maximal distribution *ca.* 10000-9800 cal. BP
 (Tonkov et al., 2013). Lowlands in SE Bulgaria recorded a delayed forest expansion due to the
 prevalence of drier climatic conditions (Connor et al., 2013).

4

#### 5 5. Key findings

i) Analysis of loess deposits suggests more pronounced phases of coarse-grain 6 7 deposition, associated with drier and probably colder climate, during the MIS 3 than during the 8 last glacial maximum. This is likely to be a consequence of changes in general atmospheric circulation due to initial ice sheet growth, as well as changes in depositional regime of the 9 10 Danube fluvial system. During the MIS 2, enlarged northern European ice masses may have partially blocked penetration of the Atlantic air to the east, with strong anticyclonal circulation 11 12 over the Fennoscandian Ice Sheet during the peak of the last glacial phase. The inference of 13 warmer condition during MIS 3 is also supported by a more continuous growth of Romanian speleothems through this period. 14

15 ii) Loess-covered lowland areas in Serbia, SE Hungary, Romania and Bulgaria that are 16 characterised by warm/dry macroclimate today were dominated during the MIS 3 by warm 17 steppe vegetation, often with Artemisia. By contrast, similar loess covered areas but with more humid climatic conditions supported predominant parkland boreal forests accompanied by some 18 19 temperate deciduous trees (Picea abies, Pinus sylvestris, P. cembra, Larix decidua, Ulmus, Salix and Alnus). Despite the high-resolution studies of dry loess steppe areas south of 45 °N, 20 21 millennial-scale vegetation fluctuations have not been recognized. This suggests that temperature and precipitation fluctuations during the MIS-3 were of relatively low magnitude, 22 failing to trigger major shifts in biomes or that the changes were of significant magnitude but did 23 24 not cross critical thresholds for biome shift. On the other hand, a few available records from 25 lowlands and moutaines areas between 45 and 48 °N suggest recurring fluctuations between boreal forest-steppe and steppe vegetation. This suggests that millennial-scale climatic 26

oscillations drove a stronger vegetation response in these more humid macroclimate areas,
 interstadials were characterised by boreal and temperate tree advances lasting for 200-300
 years.

4 iii) Most records from the continental CEE cover the period 14.7 and 8 ka cal BP and 5 show that this region experienced climate changes more or less synchronous (within centennial-6 scale age errors) with those around the North Atlantic region. However, the magnitude of these 7 climatic shifts appears to be less dramatic in the continental part of Europe than in more oceanic Western Europe. Thus, whereas the onset of GI-1e in Greenland was marked by a 10°C 8 increase in annual temperature, the corresponding warming in CEE is only of about 2.8 - 3°C. 9 Similarly, the cooling associated with the onset of GS-1 in Greenland was of about 1-2 °C for 10 MAT. The climate records from CEE show that temperature changes were more pronounced in 11 12 winter than in summer during both cold and warm periods of the Lateglacial indicating enhanced 13 seasonality. Precipitation dropped markedly at the onset of cold periods, suggesting increased continentality. In contrast, early Holocene seasonality was driven by high summer insolation and 14 therefore increased summer temperature. 15

iv) The consequence of lower amplitude cooling in CEE compared to Western Europe 16 17 implies that vegetation was less drastically impacted and allowed for the persistence of open boreal forests at latitudes below 55 °N even during the coldest intervals of the last glacial. 18 19 However, higher resolution pollen records covering the Lateglacial clearly indicate that vegetation responded sensitively to these climate shifts, with the most pronounced changes 20 21 visible at 14.7 (GI-1e), 13.8 (GI-1c-a), 12.7 (GS-1), and at 11.7 ka cal BP (GS-1/Holocene transition). This further underscores the impact of climate change on vegetation across a broad 22 region (Giesecke et al., 2011). 23

v) Differences exist in the temporal response of vegetation to the climate shifts compared to the actual climate shifts in the Greenland ice core record. Thus, while vegetation responded to GI-1e warming, the magnitude of this vegetation response was smaller compared

to the magnitude of temperature increase suggested by the Greenland oxygen isotope record at
14.7 ka cal BP. Conversely, a strong vegetation shift is visible in most pollen records during
G1c-a, at a time when the NGRIP record indicates a more modest temperature increase.

4 vi) On a spatial scale, the records from CEE show that the magnitude of the vegetational 5 response follows a S-N latitudinal and elevation trend. Vegetation at more northern locations 6 appears more strongly impacted by climate changes between 8 and 60 ka, whereas the more 7 southern locations appear more stable. There is also a marked N to S increase in steppe 8 communities, suggesting an increase in continentality following a N-S latitudinal transect. From the these pollen records it is apparent that besides the influences of the North Atlantic, other 9 centers of climatic variability (the Mediterranean Sea, NW Russia and the Black Sea) have 10 created a complex climatic region and vegetation pattern. 11

12

#### 13 6. Suggestions for the future

The key points above not only highlight the main findings, but also the major gaps and 14 problems in palaeoclimatic data from CEE for the period covering 60-8 ka, as well as a selection 15 of future directions for improvement. Numerous records have poor chronological control, mainly 16 17 because of too few dates and use of bulk sediment. There is also a subjective tendency towards wiggle-matching and tuning of time scales, often falsely synchronising the forcing (climate) and 18 19 response (vegetation). Searching for (crypto) tephra layers such as the Campanian Ignimbrite (39,280 ±110 cal yr BP), Vedde Ash (12,007-12,235 b2K cal yr BP), and Laacher See tephra 20 (12,880±40 varves yr BP), would better constrain chronologies and allow for correct 21 identification of lags in the response of regional climate systems and vegetation to both external 22 and internal forcings. In this respect, an important step has been achieved by the identification 23 24 of the Laacher See Tephra in the Trzechowskie palaeolake (Wulf et al., 2013) and Wegliny 25 (Housley et al., 2013). These advances have allowed a precise correlation between pollen and lithological records in Western and Eastern Europe, showing that the abrupt environmental 26

changes and associated impacts on vegetation were synchronous in these regions at the B A/YD transition. In addition, the use of statistically-secure age-models could improve
 chronologies.

4 Quantitative climate reconstructions in the CEE are extremely rare. Therefore, a major 5 future research direction is the construction of local calibration sets and transfer functions to 6 improve the existing, insufficiently quantified biotically-derived paleoclimate reconstructions. The 7 different present-day climate to that of Western and Northern Europe, where most of the calibration sets used for CEE originate, adds a strong bias to the quantitative reconstructions. 8 Except for pollen, there is no single proxy that is investigated in a similar manner in the whole 9 area making proxy inter-comparison difficult. This calls for a coordinated effort to identify sites 10 from various climatic settings that need to be investigated in order to obtain a coherent picture 11 12 of patterns in past climate changes.

While the application of new proxies or methods could provide a much clearer image of the region's past climate, we believe that a systematic use of the well established, classical proxies (i.e., accurately dated and quantified) could also result in an improved understanding of the past climate and environmental changes in the area.

17

## 18 Acknowledgments:

A.F. and A.P. conceived the paper, collected the data sets and drafted chapters of the
manuscript. I.T., T.S., E.K.M., B.P.O and S.M. drafted individual chapters and figures. M.A.,
S.C., S.F., M.G., T.G., W.H., P.K., P.K., M.L., E.M., D.J.M., I.P., M.P., M.S., M.S., P.S., A.S.,
T.T., A.T., S.T., M.T., S.V., K.J.W., V.Z. participated to the workshop and /or contributed to data
and revised the final drafts of the paper. A.F., led to overall wrapping up of the manuscript. This
study is a contribution to the INTIMATE project, funded as a EU COST Action. A.F.
acknowledges support from the German Research Foundation (grant FE-1096/2-1), and PN-II-

1	RU-TE-2011-3-0145 and A.P. acknowledges project 77/2011 and 282/2011, financed by CNCS							
2	for writing up this manuscript. We thank to all contributors to the European Pollen Database.							
3								
4	References							
5	Ampel, L., 2004. Lacustrine and terrestrial response to a rapid temperature rise e a case study							
6	based on sediments record from northwestern Romania. Masters thesis in Quaternary							
7	Geology, Stockholm University, 29 pp.							
8	Amon, L., Saarse, L. 2010. Postglacial palaeoenvironmental changes in the area surrounding							
9	Lake Udriku in North Estonia. Geological Quaterly 54, 85–94.							
10	Amon, L., Veski, S., Heinsalu, A., Saarse, L. 2012. Timing of Lateglacial vegetation dynamics							
11	and respective palaeoenvironmental conditions in southern Estonia: evidence from the							
12	sediment record of Lake Nakri. Journal of Quaternary Science 27, 169–180.							
13	Andrič, M., Kroflič, B., Toman, M.J., Ogrinc, N., Dolenec, T., Dobnikar, M., Čermelj, B. 2008.							
14	Late quaternary vegetation and hydrological change at Ljubljansko barje (Slovenia).							
15	Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, palaeoecology 270, 150–165.							
16	Andrič, M., Massaferro, J., Eicher, U., Ammann, B., Leuenberger, M.C., Martinčič, A., Marinova,							
17	E., Brancelj, A. 2009. A multi-proxy Late-glacial palaeoenvironmental record from Lake							
18	Bled, Slovenia. Hydrobiologia 631, 121–141.							
19	Antoine, P., Rousseau, D.D., Fuchs, M., Hatté, C., Gautier, C., Marković, S.B., Jovanović, M.,							
20	Gaudeenyi, T., Moine, O., Rossignol, J. 2009. High resolutionrecord of the last climatic							
21	cycle in the Southern Carpathian basin (Surduk, Vojvodina, Serbia). Quaternary							
22	International 198, 19–36.							
23	Antoine, P., Rousseau, D.D., Degeai, J.P., Moine, O., Lagroix, F., Kreutzer, S., Fuchs, M.,							
24	Hatté, C., Gauthier, C., Svoboda, J., Lisá, L. 2013. High-resolution record of the							
25	environmental response to climatic variations during the Last Interglacial–Glacial cycle in							

Central Europe: the loess-palaeosol sequence of Dolní Věstonice (Czech Republic).
 Quaternary Science Reviews 67, 17–38.

- Björck, S., Walker, M.J.C., Cwynar, L., Johnsen, S.J., Knudsen, K.-L., Lowe, J.J., Wohlfarth, B.,
  INTIMATE Members, 1998. An event stratigraphy for the last termination in the North
  Atlantic region based on the Greenland Ice Core record: a proposal by the INTIMATE
  group. Journal of Quaternary Science 13, 283–292.
- Björkman, L., Feurdean, A., Cinthio, K., Wohlfarth, B., Possnert, G. 2002. Lateglacial and early
  Holocene vegetation development in the Gutaiului Mountains, northwestern Romania.
  Quaternary Science Reviews, 21, 1039–1059.
- Blockley, S.P.E., Lane, C.S., Turney, C.S.M., Ramsey, C.B. 2012. The INTegration of Ice core,
   MArine and TErrestrial records of the last termination (INTIMATE) 60,000 to 8000 BP.
   Quaternary Science Reviews 36, 1.
- Blockley, S.P.E., Lane, C.S., Hardiman, M., Rasmussen, S.O., Seierstad, I.K., Steffensen, J.P.,
   Svensson, A., Lotter, A.F., Turney, C.S.M., Ramsey, C.B. 2012. Synchronisation of
   palaeoenvironmental records over the last 60,000 years, and an extended INTIMATE
   event stratigraphy to 48,000 b2k. Quaternary Science Reviews 36, 2–10.
- Banak, A., Pavelić, D., Kovačić, M., Mandic, O. 2013. Sedimentary characteristics and source
  of loess in Baranja (Eastern Croatia) Aeolian Research 11, 129-139.
- Bokhorst, M.P., Beets, C.J., Marković, S. B. Gerasimenko, N.P., Matviishina, Z.N., Frechen, M.
  2009. Pedo-chemical climate proxies in Late Pleistocene Serbian-Ukrainian loess
  sequences. Quaternary International 198, 123-133.
- Bokhorst, M.P., Vandenberghe, J., Sümegi, P., Łanczont, M., Gerasimenko, N.P., Matviishina,
   Z.N., Beets, C.J., Marković, S.B., Frechen, M. 2011. Atmospheric circulation patterns in
   central and eastern Europe during the Weichselian Pleniglacial inferred from loess grain
   size records. Quaternary International 234, 62–74.

1	Brauer, A., Endres, C., Gunter, C., Litt, T., Stebich, M., Negendank, J.F.W., 1999. High
2	resolution sediment and vegetation responses to Younger Dryas climate change in
3	varved lake sediments from Meerfelder Maar, Germany. Quaternary Science Reviews
4	18, 321–329.
5	Buczkó, K., Magyari, E., Hübener, T., Braun, M., Bálint, M., Tóth, M., Lotter, A.F. 2012.
6	Responses of diatoms to the Younger Dryas climatic reversal in a South Carpathian
7	mountain lake (Romania). Journal of Paleolimnology 48, 417 – 431.
8	Buczkó, K., Magyari, E., Hubener, T., Braun, M., Bálint, M., Tóth, M., Lotter, A.F. 2012
9	Responses of diatoms to the Younger Dryas climatic reversal in a South Carpathian
10	mountain lake (Romania). J. Paleolimnol., in press.
11	Buggle, B., Hambach, U., Glaser, B., Gerasimenko, N., Marković, S.B., Glaser, I., Zöller, L.
12	2009. Magnetic susceptibility stratigraphy and spatial and temporal paleoclimatic trends
13	in East European loess paleosol sequences. Quaternary International 196, 86–106.
14	Cârciumaru, M., Ion, RM., Nițu, EC., Ștefănescu, R., 2012. New evidence of adhesive as
15	hafting material on Middle and Upper Palaeolithic artefacts from Gura Cheii-Râşnov
16	Cave (Romania). Journal of Archaeological Science 39, 1942–1950.
17	Connor, S.E., Ross, S.A., Sobotkova, A., Herries, A.I.R., Mooney, S.D., Longford, C., Iliev, I.
18	2013). Environmental conditions in the SE Balkans since the Last Glacial Maximum and
19	their influence on the spread of agriculture into Europe. Quaternary Science Reviews 68,
20	200–215.
21	Constantin, S., Bojar, AV., Lauritzen, SE., Lundberg, J., 2007. Holocene and Late
22	Pleistocene climate in the sub-Mediterranean continental environment: A speleothem
23	record from Poleva Cave (Southern Carpathians, Romania). Palaeogeography,
24	Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 243, 322–338.
25	Culiberg, M., Šercelj, A. 1995. Anthracotomical and palynological research in the Palaeolithic
26	site Šandalja II (Istria, Croatia)/Antrakotomske in palinološke raziskave v paleolitski

postaji Šandalja II (Istra, Hrvaška), Razprave IV. razreda SAZU 36(3), 49–57, Ljubljana,
 SAZU.

- Damblon, F. 1997. Palaeobotanical study of representative Upper Palaeolithic sites in the
   central European Plain: a contribution to the SC-004 project. Préhistoire Européenne 11,
   245–253.
- Damblon, F., Haesaerts, P. 1997. Radiocarbon chronology of representative Upper Palaeolithic
   sites in the central European Plain: a contribution to the SC-004 project. Préhistoire
   Européenne 11, 255–276.
- Dobrowolski, R., Bałaga, K., Bogucki, A., Federowicz, S., Melke, J., Pazdur, A., Zubovič, S.,
  2001. Chronostratigraphy of the Okunin and Czerepacha lake-mire
  geosystems(Volhynia Polesiye, NW Ukraine) during the late glacial and Holocene.
  Geochronometria 20, 107–115.
- Dodonov, A.E., Baiguzina, L.L. 1995. Loess stratigraphy of Central Asia: Paleoclimatic and
   paleoenvironmental aspects. Quaternary Science Reviews 14, 707–720.
- Drăgușin, V., Staubwasser, M., Hoffmann, D.L., Ersek, V., Onac, B.P., Veres, D. 2014.
   Constraining Holocene hydrological changes in the Carpathian-Balkan region using
   speleothem <sup>18</sup>O and pollen-based temperature reconstructions. *Climate of the Past Discussions* 10, 381–427. doi:10.5194/cpd-10-381-2014.
- Ehlers, J., Gibbard, P.L., Hughens, P.D. 2011. Quaternary Glaciations Extent and Chronology.
   A Closer Look. Elsevier, Amsterdam, 1108 p.
- Fărcaş, S., de Beaulieu, J.L., Reille, M., Coldea, G., Diaconeasa, B., Goeury, C., Goslar, T.,
  Jull, T. 1999. First 14C datings of late Glacial and Holocene pollen sequences from
  Romanian Carpathes. Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences de Paris 322, 799–
  807.
- Fărcaş, S., Tanțău, I. 2012. Poiana Ruscă Mountains (Romania). Peşteana peat bog. Grana 51,
  249–251.

1	Feurdean, A., Wohlfarth, B., Björkman, L., Tanțău, I., Bennike, O., Willis, K.J., Fărcaş, S.,
2	Robertsson, A.M. 2007. The influence of refugial population on Lateglacial and early
3	Holocene vegetational changes in Romania. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology
4	145, 305–320.
5	Feurdean, A., Klotz, S., Brewer, S., Mosbrugger, V., Tămaş, T., Wohlfarth B. 2008a. Lateglacial
6	climate development in NW Romania - comparative results from three quantitative pollen
7	based methods. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 265, 121–133.
8	Feurdean, A., Klotz, S., Mosbrugger, V., Wohlfarth, B. 2008b. Pollen-based quantitative
9	reconstruction of Holocene climate variability in NW Romania. Palaeogeography,
10	Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 260, 494–504.
11	Feurdean, A., Spessa, A., Magyari, E.K., Willis, K.J., Veres, D., Hickler, T. 2012. Trends in
12	biomass burning in the Carpathian region over the last 15,000 years. Quaternary
13	Science Reviews, 45, 111-125.
14	Feurdean, A., Tămaş, T., Tanțău, I., Fărcaş, S., 2012b. Elevational variation in regional
15	vegetation responses to late-glacial climate changes in the Carpathians. Journal of
16	Biogeography 39, 258–271.
17	Feurdean, A, Liakka, J, Vanniere, B, Marinova, E., Mossbruger V., Hickler T. 2013. Holocene
18	fire regime drivers in the lowlands of Transylvania (Central-Eastern Europe): a data-
19	model approach. Quaternary Science Reviews 81, 48-61.
20	Fletcher, W.J., Sánchez Goñi, M.F., Allen, J.R.M., Cheddadi, R., Coumbourieu-Nebout, N.,
21	Huntley, B., Lawson, I.T., Londeix, L., Magri, D., Margari, V., Müller, U.C., Naughton, F.,
22	Novenko, E., Roucoux, K.H., and Tzedakis, P.C. 2010. Millennial-scale variability during
23	the last glacial in vegetation records from Europe. Quaternary Science Reviews 29,
24	2839–2864.

1	Gaidamavičius, A., Stančikaitė, M., Kisielienė, D., Mažeika, J., Gryguc, G. 2011. Post-glacial
2	vegetation and environment of the Labanoras region, East Lithuania: implications for
3	regional history. Geological Quarterly 55(3), 269–284.

- Gałka, M., Sznel, M. 2013. Late glacial and Early Holocene development of lakes in
   northeastern Poland in view of plant macrofossil analyses. Quaternary International
   292,124–135.
- Gałka, M., Tobolski, K. 2013. Macrofossil evidence of the early Holocene presence of Picea
  abies (Norway spruce) in NE Poland. Annales Botannici Fennici 50, 129–141.

Gałka, M., Tobolski, K., Zawisza, E., Goslar, T. 2014. History of vegetation, human activity, and
 changes in lake level during the Postglacial period in region under the influence of a
 transitional climate (NE Poland). Vegetation History and Archaeobotany 23, 123–152.

- Gerasimenko, N., Rousseau, D.-D. 2008. Stratigraphy and paleoenviroments of the last
   pleniglacial in the Kyiv Loess Region (Ukraine). Quaternaire 19(4), 293–307.
- Giesecke, T., Bennett, K.D., Birks, H.J.B., Bjune, A.E., Bozilova, E., Feurdean, A., Finsinger,
  W., Froyd, C., Pokorný, P., Rösch, M., Seppä, H., Tonkov, S., Valsecchi, V., Wolters, S.
- 16 2011. The pace of Holocene vegetation change testing for synchronous developments.
- 17 Quaternary Science Reviews 30, 2805–2814.
- Goslar, T., Arnold, M., Bard, E., Kuc, T., Pazdur, M., Ralskajasiewiczowa, M., Rozanski, K.,
  Tisnerat, N., Walanus, A., Wicik, B., Wieckowski, K., 1995. High-concentration of
  atmospheric C-14 during the Younger Dryas cold episode. Nature 377 (6548), 414-417.
- Gryguc, G., Kisielienė, D., Stančikaitė, M., Šeirienė, V., Skuratovič, Ž., Vaitkevičius, V.,
  Gaidamavičius, A. 2014. Holocene sediment record from Briaunis palaeolake, Eastern
  Lithuania: history of sedimentary environment and vegetation dynamics. Baltica 26(2)
  doi: 10.5200/baltica.2013.26.13.
- Haesaerts, P., Borziac, I., Chekha, V.P., Chirica, V., Drozdov, N.I., Koulakovska, L., Orlova,
  L.A., van der Plicht, J., Damblon, F. 2010. Charcoal and wood remains for radiocarbon

1	dating Upper Pleistocene loess sequences in Eastern Europe and Central Siberia,
2	Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 291(1-2), 106-127.
3	Haesaerts, P., Damblon, F., Bachner, M., Trnka, G. 1996. Revised stratigraphy and chronology
4	of the Willendorf II sequence, Lower Austria. Archaeologia Austriaca 80, 25-42.
5	Hatte, C, Gauthier, C., Rousseau, D.D., Antoine, P., M. Fuchs, Lagroix, F., Markovich, S.B.,
6	Moine, O., Sima, A. 2013. Excursions to C4 vegetation recorded in the Upper
7	Pleistocene loess of Surduk (Northern Serbia): an organic isotope geochemistry study,
8	Climate of the Past 9, 1001–1014.
9	Hájková, P., Jamrichová, E., Horsák., M., Hájek, M. 2013. Holocene history of a Cladium
10	mariscus-dominated calcareous fen in Slovakia: vegetation stability and landscape
11	development. Preslia 85, 289–315.
12	Heikkilä, M., Fontana, S.L., Seppä, H. 2009. Rapid Lateglacial tree population dynamics and
13	ecosystem changes in the eastern Baltic region. Journal of Quaternary Science 24, 802-
14	815.
15	Housley, R.A., MacLeod, A., Nalepka, D., Jurochnik, A., Masojć, M., Davies, L., Lincoln P.C.,
16	Ramsey, C.B., Gamble, C.S., Lowe, J.J. 2013. Tephrostratigraphy of a Lateglacial lake
17	sediment sequence at Węgliny, southwest Poland, Quaternary Science Reviews 77 (1),
18	4-18.
19	Jankovská, V., 1984. Late glacial finds of Pinus cembra L. in the Lubovnianská kotlina Basin.
20	Folia geobot. phytotax. 19, 323–325.
21	Jankovská, V., Chromý, P., Nižnianská, M. 2002. Šafárka – first palaeobotanical data of the
22	character of Last Glacial vegetation and landscape in the West Carpathians (Slovakia).
23	Acta Palaeobotanica 42, 39–50.
24	Jankovská, V., Pokorný, P. 2008. Forest vegetation of the last full-glacial period in the Western
25	Carpathians (Slovakia and Czech Republic). Preslia 80, 307–324.

1	Jary, Z., 2009. Periglacial markers within the Late Pleistocene loess-palaeosol sequences in
2	Poland and Western Ukraine Quaternary International 198(1-2), 124–135.
3	Jary, Z., Ciszek, D. 2011. Late Pleistocene loess-palaeosol sequences in Poland and western
4	Ukraine. Quaternary International 296, 37-50.
5	Kadereit, A. Wagner, G.A. 2014. Geochronological reconsideration of the eastern European
6	key loess section at Stayky in Ukraine. Climate of the Past,10, 783-796.
7	Kirilova, E., Heiri, O., Veski, S., Lotter, A.F. 2011 Summer temperature shifts during the Late
8	Glacial in Northeastern Europe. EGU General Assembly, Vienna (Austria). Abstracts.
9	Geophysical Research Abstracts 13, 6000.
10	Komar, M., Łanczont, M., Madeyska, T. 2009. Spatial vegetation patterns based on
11	palynological records in the loess area between the Dnieper and Odra Rivers during the
12	last interglacial-glacial cycle. Quaternary International 198(1-2), 152-172.
13	Kovács J., Moravcová M., Újvári G., Pinter A.G., 2012. Reconstructing the paleoenvironment of
14	East Central Europe in the Late Pleistocene using the oxygen and carbon isotopic signal
15	of tooth in large mammal remains. Quaternary International 276-277, 145–154.
16	Kuneš, P., Pelánková, B., Chytrý, M., Jankovská, V., Pokorný, P., Petr, L., 2008. Interpretation
17	of the last-glacial vegetation of eastern-central Europe using modern analogues from
18	southern Siberia. Journal of Biogeography 35, 2223–2236.
19	Lamentowicz, M., Obremska, M. and Mitchell, E.A.D. 2008. Autogenic succession, land-use
20	change, and climatic influences on the Holocene development of a kettle hole mire in
21	Northern Poland. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 151, 21-40.
22	Lane, C., Andrič, M., Cullen, V.L., Blockley, S.P.E. 2011. The occurrence of distal Icelandic and
23	Italian tephra in the Lateglacial of Lake Bled, Slovenia. Quaternary Science Reviews 30,
24	1013–1018.

Lascu, I., 2003. Studiul Tardiglaciarului de la Sieu-Magherus (jud. Bistrita-Nasaud). Bachelor
 Thesis, Babes-Bolyai University, Cluj Napoca

- Latalowa, M., van der Knaap, W.O., 2006. Late Quaternary expansion of Norwayspruce (L.)
   Karst. in Europe according to pollen data. Quaternary Science Reviews 25, 2780–2805.
- Lauritzen, S.E., Onac, B.P. 1999. Isotopic Stratigraphy of a Last Interglacial Stalagmite from
   Northwestern Romania: Correlation with the Deep-Sea record and Northern-Latitude
   Speleothem. Journal of Cave and Karst Studies 61(1), 22–30.
- Little, E.C., Lian, O.B., Velichko, A.A., Morozova, T.D., Nechaev, V.P., Dlussky, K.G., Rutter
   N.W. 2002. Quaternary stratigraphy and optical dating of loess from the east European
   Plain (Russia). Quaternary Science Reviews 21, 1745–1762.
- Magyari, E.K., Chapman, J.C., Gaydarska, B., Marinova, E., Deli, T., Huntley, J.P., Allen,
   J.R.M., Huntley, B. 2008. The 'oriental' component of the Balkan flora: evidence of
   presence on the Thracian Plain during the Weichselian Lateglacial. Journal of
   Biogeography 35, 865–883.
- Magyari, E.K., Chapman, J.C., Passmore, D.G., Allen, J.R.M., Huntley, J.P. & Huntley, B. 2010.
   Holocene persistence of wooded steppe on the Great Hungarian Plain. Journal of
   Biogeography 37, 915-935.
- Magyari, E.K., Buczkó, K., Jakab, G., Braun, M., Pál, Z., Karátson, D., Papp, P., 2009.
   Palaeolimnology of the last crater lake in the Eastern Carpathian Mountains a
   multiproxy study of Holocene hydrological changes. Hydrobiologia 631, 29–63.
- Magyari, E.K., Jakab, G., Bálint, M., Kern, Z., Buczkó, K., Braun, M., 2012. Rapid vegetation
   response to Lateglacial and early Holocene climatic fluctuation in the South Carpathian
   Mountains (Romania). Quaternary Science Reviews 35, 116–130.
- Makhnach, N., Zernitskaya, V., Kolosov, I., 2009. Stable carbon and oxygen isotopes and
   spore-pollen spectra in Late Glacial Holocene carbonate sediments from lake
   Sergeyevskoye, Belarus. Lithosphere 1(30), 103–114 (in Russian).

1	Mamakowa, K., Latałowa, M. 2003. Quaternary. In: Dybova-Jachowicz, S., Sadowska , A.
2	(Eds.) , Palinology. Wydawnictwa Instytutu Botaniki PAN, pp. 224–273 (in Polish).
3	Marković, S.B., McCoy, W.D., Oches, E.A., Savić, S., Gaudenyi, T., Jovanović, M., Stevens, T.,
4	Walther, R., Ivanišević, P., Galić, Z. 2005. Paleoclimate record in the Late Pleistocene
5	loess-paleosol sequence at Petrovaradin Brickyard (Vojvodina, Serbia). Geologica
6	Carpathica 56, 483–491.
7	Marković, S.B., Oches, E.A., Mc Coy,W.D., Frechen, M., Gaudenyi, T., 2007. Malacological and
8	sedimentological evidence for "warm" glacial climate from the Irig loess sequence,
9	Vojvodina, Serbia. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems 8(9), 1–12.
10	Marković, S.B., Bokhorst, M., Vandenberghe, J., Oches, E.A., Zöller, L., McCoy, W.D.,
11	Gaudenyi, T., Jovanović, M., Hambach, U., Machalett, B. 2008. Late Pleistocene loess-
12	paleosol sequences in the Vojvodina region, North Serbia. Journal of Quaternary
13	Science 23, 73–84.
14	Michczyńska, D.J., Starkel, L., Nalepka, D., Pazdur, A. 2013. Hydrological changes after the last
15	ice retreat in northern Poland using radiocarbon dating. Radiocarbon 55(2-3), 1712-
16	1723.
17	Molnár, Z., Bíró, M. 1995. A kardoskúti Fehér-tó Természetvédelmi Terület kezelési tervet
18	alapozó botanikai felmérése és természetvédelmi értékelése. MTA ÖBKI, Vácrátót. (in
19	Hungarian)
20	Moreno, A., Svensson, A., Brooks, S.J., Connors, S., Engels, S., Fletcher, W., Genty, D., Heiri,
21	O., Labuhn, I., Persiou, A., Peyron, O., Sadori, L., Valero-Garcés, B., Wulf, S.,
22	Zanchetta, G., and data contributors. 2013. A compilation of Western European
23	terrestrial records 60-8 ka BP: towards an understanding of latitudinal climatic gradients.
24	Quaternary Science Reviews, this volume.
25	Musil, R. 2003. The Middle and Upper Palaeolithic game suite in central and south-eastern
26	Europe, In: van Andel, T.H., Davies, S.W. (Eds.), Neanderthals and Modern Humans in

the European Landscape during the Last Glaciation. McDonald Institute for
 Archaeological Research, Cambridge, pp. 167–190.

- Nádor, A., Sinha, A., Magyari, Á., Tandon, S.K., Medzihradszky, Zs., Babinszki, E., Thamó Bozsó, E., Unger, Z., Singh, A. 2011. Late Quaternary (Weichselian) alluvial history and
   neotectonic control on fluvial landscape development in the southern Körös plain,
   Hungary. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 299, 1–14.
- Onac, B.P. 1996. Mineralogy of speleothems from caves in Padurea Craiului Mountains
   (Romania), and their palaeoclimatic significance. Cave and Karst Science 24, 109–124.
- 9 Onac, B.P., Lauritzen, S.E., 1996. The climate of the last 150,000 years recorded in
   10 speleothems: preliminary results from north-western Romania. Theoretical and Applied
   11 Karstology 9, 9–21.
- Onac, B.P. 2001. Mineralogical studies and Uranium-series dating of speleothems from
   Scarisoara Glacier Cave (Bihor Mountains, Romania). Theoretical and Applied
   Karstology 13-14, 33–38.
- Opravil, E. 1994. Vegetation. In: Svoboda, J. (Ed.), Pavlov I—Excavation 1952-1983, Ch. V.,
   ERAUL 66. The Dolní Veštonice Studies 2, Liége, pp. 177–180 Liége.
- Persoiu, I., 2010. Reconstruction of Holocene Geomorphological Evolution of Somesu Mic
   Valley (Unpublished PhD thesis). "A. I. Cuza" University, Iasi, Romania (in Romanian).
- Petherick, L., Bostock, H., Cohen, T.J., Fitzsimmons, K., Tibby, J., Fletcher, M-S., Moss, P.,
  Reeves, J., Mooney, S., Barrows, T., Kemp, J., Jansen, J., Nanson, G., Dosseto, A.
  2013. Climatic records over the past 30 ka from temperate Australia a synthesis from
  the Oz-INTIMATE workgroup. Quaternary Science Reviews 74, 58–77.
- Płóciennik, M., Self, A., Birks, H.J.B., Brooks, S.J., 2011. Chironomidae (Insecta: Diptera)
   succession in Żabieniec bog and its palaeo-lake (Central Poland) through the Late
   Weichselian and Holocene. Paleogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 307,
   150–167.

1	Pokorný, P., 2002. A high-resolution record of Late-Glacial and Early-Holocene climatic and
2	environmental change in the Czech Republic. Quaternary International 91, 101–122.
3	Pokorný, P., Šída, P., Chvojka, O., Žáčková, P., Kuneš, P., Světlík, I., Veselý, J., 2010.
4	Palaeoenvironmental research of the Schwarzenberg Lake, southern Bohemia, and
5	exploratory excavations of this key Mesolithic archaeological area. Památky
6	archeologické 101, 5–38.
7	Ralska-Jasiewiczowa, M., Goslar, T., Madeyska, T., Starkel, L., 1998. Lake Gościąż, Central
8	Poland, a Monographic Study. Part 1. W. Szafer Institute of Botany, PAS Kraków,
9	Poland, 340 pp.
10	Rasmussen, S.O., Andersen, K.K., Svensson, A.M., Steffensen, J.P., Vinther, B.M., Clausen,
11	H.B., Siggaard-Andersen, ML., Johnsen, S.J., Larsen, L.B., Dahl-Jensen, D., Bigler,
12	M., Röthlisberger, R., Fischer, H., Goto-Azuma, K., Hansson, M.E., Ruth, U., 2006. A
13	new Greenland ice core chronology for the last glacial termination. Journal of
14	Geophysical Research 111, D6.
15	Renssen, H., Vandenberghe, J., 2003. Investigation of the relationship between permafrost
16	distribution in NW Europe and extensive winter sea-ice cover in the North Atlantic Ocean
17	during the cold phases of the Last Glaciation. Quaternary Science Reviews 22(2-4),
18	209–223.
19	Renssen, H., Seppä, H., Heiri, O., Roche, D.M., Goosse, H., Fichefet, T., 2009. The spatial and
20	temporal complexity of the holocene thermal maximum. Nature Geoscience 2(6), 411-
21	414.
22	Rousseau, D.D., Antoine, P., Gerasimenko, N., Sima, A., Fuchs, M., Hatte, C., Moine, O.,
23	Zoeller, L. 2011. North Atlantic abrupt climatic events of the last glacial period recorded
24	in Ukrainian loess deposits, Climate of the Past 7, 221–234.
25	Rozycki, S.Z. 1991. Loess and Loesss like deposit. PAN, Wroclaw, 187 pp.

1	Rutter, N., Rokosh, D., Evans, M.E., Little, E.C., Chlachula, J., Velichko, A. 2003 Correlation
2	and interpretation of paleosols and loess across European Russia and Asia over the last
3	interglacial-glacial cycle. Quaternary Science Reviews 60, 101-109.
4	Rudner, Z.E., Sümegi, P. 2001. Recurring taiga forest-steppe habitats in the Carpathian Basin
5	in the Upper Weichselian. Quaternary International 76/77, 177–189.
6	Sanchi, L., Ménot, G., Bard, E., 2014. Insights into continental temperatures in the northwestern
7	Black Seaarea during the Last Glacial period using branched tetraether lipids.
8	Quaternary Science Reviews 84, 98-108.
9	Schatz, A.K., Zech, M., Buggle, B., Gulyás, S., Hambach, U., Marković, S.B., Sümegi, P.,
10	Scholten, T. 2011. The late Quaternary loess record of Tokaj, Hungary: Reconstructing
11	palaeoenvironment, vegetation and climate using stable C and N isotopes and
12	biomarkers. Quaternary International 240, 52–61.
13	Seppä, H., Poska, A. 2004. Holocene annual mean temperature changes in Estonia and their
14	relationship to solar insolation and atmospheric circulation patterns. Quaternary
15	Research 61(1), 22–31.
16	Seppä, H., Bjune, A.E., Telford, R.J., Birks, H.J.B., Veski, S. 2009. Last nine-thousand years of
17	temperature variability in Northern Europe. Climate of the Past 5, 523–535.
18	Šercelj, A. 1966. Pelodne analize pleistocenskih in holocenskih sedimentov Ljubljanskega barja
19	/ Pollenanalytische Untersuchungen der Pleistozänen und Holozänen Ablagerungen von
20	Ljubljansko barje, Razprave IV. razreda SAZU 9, Ljubljana, SAZU, 431–469.
21	Sima, A., Kageyama, M., Rousseau, D.D., Ramstein, P. Balkanski, Y., Antoine, P., Hatté, C.
22	2013. Modeling dust emission response to North Atlantic millennial-scale climate
23	variations from the perspective of East European MIS 3 loess deposits. Climate of the
24	Past 9, 1385–1402.

- Słowiński, M. 2010. Macrofossil reconstruction of preboreal wetland formed on dead ice block a
   case study of the Borzechowo mire in East Pomerania, Poland. Studia Quaternaria 27,
   3–10.
- Spötl, C., Mangini, A., Richards, D.A. 2006. Chronology and paleoenvironment of Marine
  Isotope Stage 3 from two high-elevation speleothems, Austrian Alps. Quaternary
  Science Reviews 25:1127–1136.
- Środoń, A. 1968. O roślinności interstadiału Paudorf w Karpatach Zachodnich (summary: On
  the vegetation of the Paudorf Interstadial in the Western Carpathians). Acta
  Palaeobotanica 9(1), 3–28.
- Stančikaitė, M., Kisielienė, D., Moe, D., Vaikutienė, G. 2009. Lateglacial and early Holocene
   environmental changes in northeastern Lithuania. Quaternary International 207 (1-2),
   80–92.
- Stančikaitė, M., Šinkūnas, P., Šeirienė, V., Kisielienė, D. 2008. Patterns and chronology of the
   Lateglacial environmental development at Pamerkiai and Kašučiai, Lithuania.
   Quaternary Science Reviews 27(1-2), 127–147.
- Starkel, L., Michczyńska, D.J., Krąpiec, M., Margielewski, W., Nalepka, D., Pazdur, A. 2013.
   Progress in the Holocene chrono-climatostratigraphy of Polish territory.
   Geochronometria 40(1), 1–21.
- Stevens T, Marković SB, Zech M, Hambach U, Sümegi P. 2011. Dust deposition and climate in
   the Carpathian Basin over an independently dated last glacial-interglacial cycle.
   Quaternary Science Reviews 30, 662–681.
- Sümegi and Krolopp, 2002. Quatermalacological analysis for modeling the upper Weichselian
   palaeoenvironmental changes in the Carpathian Basin. Quaternary International 91, 53–
   63.

1	Sümegi, P., Magyari, E., Dániel, P., Molnár, M., Törőcsik, T. 2013. Responses of terrestrial
2	ecosystems to Dansgaard-Oeshger cycles and Heinrich-events: a 28,000-year record of
3	environmental changes from SE Hungary. Quaternary International 293, 34–50.
4	Svoboda, J., Svobodová, H. 1985. Les industries de type Bohunice dansleur cadre
5	stratigraphique et écologique. L'Anthropologie 89, 505–514.
6	Szczepanek, K., Kalinowicz, N., Gebica, P., 2007. Alluvial deposits and vegetation of the
7	Interpleniglacial period of the Vistulian Glaciation in the Wisłok River valley between
8	Rzeszów and Łańcut (Sub-Carpathian Trough). Prz. Geol. 55, 595–600.
9	Tanțău, I., Reille, M., de Beaulieu, J.L., Fărcaş, S. 2006. Late Glacial and Holocene vegetation
10	history in the southern part of Transylvania (Romania): pollen analysis of two sequences
11	from Avrig. Journal of Quaternary Science 21, 49-61.
12	Tanțău, I., Reille, M., de Beaulieu, J.L., Fărcaş, S., Brewer, S. 2009. Holocene vegetation
13	history in Romanian Subcarpathians. Quaternary Research 72, 164–173.
14	Tanțău, I., Feurdean, A., de Beaulieu, J.L., Reille, M., Fărcaş, S. 2014. Vegetation sensitivity to
15	climate changes and human impact in the Harghita Mountains (Eastern Romanian
16	Carpathians) over the past 15,000 years. Journal of Quaternary Science 29, 141–152.
17	Tămaș, T., Causse, C. 2001. U-Th TIMS chronology of two stalagmites from V11 Cave (Bihor
18	Montains, Romania). Theoretical and Applied Karstology 13-14, 25-32.
19	Tămaș, T., Onac, B.P., Bojar, A.V. 2005. Lateglacial-Middle Holocene stable isotope records in
20	two coeval stalagmites from the Bihor Mountains, NW Romania. Geological Quarterly
21	49(2), 185–194.
22	Timar-Gabor, A., Vandenberghe, D.A.G., Vasiliniuc, S., Panaoitu, C.E., Panaiotu, C.G., Dimofte,
23	D., Cosma, C. 2011. Optical dating of Romanian Loess a comparison between silt-sized
24	and sand-sized quartz. Quaternary International 240, 62–70.

1	Timar-Gabor, A., Wintle, A.G. 2013. On natural and laboratory generated dose response curves
2	for quartz of different grain sizes from Romanian loess. Quaternary Geochronology 18,
3	34–40.
4	Tonkov, S., Possnert, G., Bozilova, E. 2006. Lateglacial vegetation and radiocarbon dating of
5	Lake Trilistnika, Rila Mountain (Bulgaria). Vegetation History and Archaeobotany 16(1),
6	15–22.
7	Tonkov, S., Bozilova, E., Possnert, G., Velcev, A. 2008. A contribution to the postglacial
8	vegetation history of the Rila Mountains, Bulgaria: the pollen record of Lake Trilistnika.
9	Quaternary International 190, 58–70.
10	Tonkov, S., Possnert, G., Bozilova, E. 2011. The Lateglacial in the Rila Mountains (Bulgaria) re-
11	visited: The pollen record of Lake Ribno (2184 m). Review of Palaeobotany and
12	Palynology 166(1-2), 1–11.
13	Tonkov, S., Bozilova, E., Possnert, G. 2013. Postglacial vegetation history as recorded from the
14	subalpine Lake Ribno (NW Rila Mts.), Bulgaria. Central European Journal of Biology
15	8(1), 64–77.
16	Tóth, M., Magyari, E.K., Brooks, S.J., Braun, M., Buczkó, K., Bálint, M., Heiri, O. 2012. A
17	chironomid-based reconstruction of late glacial summer temperatures in the southern
18	Carpathians (Romania), Quaternary Research 77, 122–131.
19	Újvári, G., Klötzli, U., Kiraly, F., Ntaflos, T., 2013. Towards identifying the origin of metamorphic
20	components in Austrian loess: Insights from detrital rutile chemistry, thermometry and U-
21	Pb geochronology. Quaternary Science Reviews 75, 132–142.
22	Urban, B. 1984. Palynology of Central European loess-soil sequences. In: Pécsi, M. (Ed.),
23	Lithology and Stratigraphy of Loess and Paleosols. Geographical Research Institute,
24	Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Budapest, pp. 229–248.
25	Van Huissteden, K., Pollard, D. 2003. Oxygen isotope stage 3 fluvial and eolian successions in
26	Europe compared with climate model results. Quaternary Research 59, 223–233.

- Vandenberghe, J., Hujizer, B., Mucher, H., Laan W. 1998. Short climatic oscillations in a
   western European loess sequence (Kesselt, Belgium). Journal of Quaternary Science
   13, 35–38.
- Vandenberghe, J., Lowe, J., Coope, R., Litt, T., Zoller, L. 2004. Climatic and environmental
  variability in the midlatitude Europe sector during the last interglacial-glacial cycle, In
  Past Climate Variability Throughout Europe and Africa, edited by R. W. Battarbee, F.
  Gasse, and C. E. Stickley, pp.393–416, Springer, Dordrecht, Netherlands.
- Veski, S., Amon, L., Heinsalu, A., Reitalu, T., Saarse, L., Stivriņš, N., Vassiljev, J. 2012. Late Glacial vegetation dynamics in the eastern Baltic region, a complete record since the
   Bølling (GI-1e). Quaternary Science Reviews 40, 39–53.
- Walker, M.J.C., Björck, S., Lowe, J.J., Cwynar, L., Johnsen, S., Knudsen, K.-L., Wohlfarth, B.,
   INTIMATE group, 1999. Isotopic 'events' in the GRIP ice core: a stratotype for the Late
   Pleistocene. Quaternary Science Reviews 18, 1143–1150.
- Wohlfarth, B., 2010. Ice free conditions in Sweden during Marine Oxygen Isotope Stage 3.
   Boreas 39, 377–398.
- Willis, K.J., Braun, M., Sumegy, P., Toth, A., 1997. Does soil change cause vegetation change
   or vice verse? A temporal sequence from Hungary. Ecology 78, 740–750.
- Willis, K.J., Rudner, E., Sumegi, P., 2000. The full-glacial forests of central and southeastern
   Europe. Quaternary Research 53, 203–213.

Willis, K.J., van Andel, T.H. 2004. Trees or no trees? The environments of central and eastern
 Europe during the Last Glaciation. Quaternary Science Reviews 23, 2369–2387.

Wohlfarth, B., Hannon, G., Feurdean, A., Ghergari, L., Onac, B.P., Possnert, G., 2001.
Reconstruction of climatic and environmental changes in NW Romania during the early
part of the last deglaciation (15,000-13,600 cal years BP). Quaternary Science Reviews
20, 1897–1914.

- Wulf, S., Ott, F., Slowinski, M., Noryskiewicz, AM., Drager, N., Martin-Puertas, C., Czymzik, M.,
   Neugebauer, I., Dulski, P., Bourne, AJ., Blaszkiewicz, M., Brauer, A., 2013. Tracing the
   Laacher See Tephra in the varved sediment record of the Trzechowskie palaeolake in
   central Northern Poland. Quaternary Science Reviews 76, 129 139.
- Zech, M., Buggle, B., Leiber, K., Marković, S., Glaser, B., Hambach, U., Huwe, B., Stevens, T.,
  Sümegi, P., Wiesenberg, G., Zöller, L. 2009: Reconstructing Quaternary vegetation
  history in the Carpathian Basin, SE Europe, using n-alkane biomarkers as molecular
  fossils: problems and possible solutions, potential and limitations. Eiszeitalter und
  Gegenwart. Quaternary Science Journal 58, 148–155.
- Zech, R., Zech, M., Marković, S., Hambach, U., Huang, Y. 2013. Humid glacials, arid
   interglacials? Critical thoughts on pedogenesis and paleoclimate based on multi-proxy
   analyses of the loess–paleosol sequence Crvenka, Northern Serbia. Palaeogeography,
   Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 387, 165–175.
- Zernitskaya, V.P., Matveyev, A.V., Makhnach, N.A., Mihailov, N.D., 2005. Stratigraphic scheme
   of the Late Glacial and Holocene deposets of the Belarus. Lithosphere 1(22), 157–165
   (in Russian).
- Zernitskaya V.P. Late Glacial Holocene history of Belarusian boreal forests. Abstract.
   International Conference "Man and environment in boreal forest zone: past, present and
   future". Moscow. July 24-30, 2008, 29-30.
- 20

## 21 Figures caption

Figure 1. Location of sites discussed in the text. Numbers refer to sites listed in Table 1: 1 –
Lake Bled (SI), 2 – Żabieniec Bog (PL), 3 – Brazi Lake (RO), 4 – V11 Cave (RO), 5 – Lake
Sergeyeyskoe (BY), 6 – Lake Ginkunai (LT), 7 – Jezioro Linówek (PL), 8 – Kobylnica Wołoska
(PL), 9 – Lake Kurjanovas (LV), 10 - Lake Nakri (EE), 11 - Labský důl (CZ), 12 – Švarcenberk
(CZ), 13 – Kis Mohos (HU), 14 – Steregoiu and Preluca Țiganului (RO), 15 - Avrig (RO), 16 –

1 Straldzha (BG), 17 - Trilistnika (BG), whereas small letters refer to loess sites: a - Dolni Vestonice (Antoine et al., 2013); b - Katymar (Bokhorst et al., 2011); c - Tokaj (Schatz et al., 2 2011); d – Zmajevac (Banak et al., 2013); e – Petrovaradin (Marković et al., 2005); f – Irig 3 4 (Marković et al., 2007); g - Mońorin (Bokhorst et al., 2011); h - Titel (Bokhorst et al., 2009); i -5 Surduk (Antoine et al., 2009); j - Crvenka (Stevens et al., 2011); k - Tyszowice (Jary and 6 Ciszek, 2011); I – Dubavka (Bokhorst et al., 2011); m – Radymo (Bokhorst et al., 2011); n – 7 Likkvin (Rutter et al., 2003); o - Korostylievo (Rutter et al., 2003); p - S. Bezradychy (Bokhorst et al., 2011); g – Sazhijka (Bokhorst et al., 2011); r – Pyroove (Bokhorst et al., 2011); s – Stayky 8 (Kadereit and Wagner, 2014); t - Korshov (Jary and Ciszek, 2011). Golobovo (loess site in 9 Russia, not shown). 10

11

Figure 2. Selected palaeoclimate reconstructions from CEE between 15 and 8 ka cal BP plotted
against the NGRIP δ18O curve (Rasmussen et al., 2006) and INTIMATE event stratigraphy of
Blockley et al. (2012b).

15

Figure 3. Vegetation changes during mid to late last glacial (MIS 3, 2) in selected terrestrial pollen records from CEE. The taxa are grouped into a summary percentage diagram where each pollen type was assigned to a major vegetation type following a simple biome scheme.

19

Figure 4. Vegetation changes between 14.7 and 8 ka cal BP in selected high-resolution terrestrial pollen records from CEE. The taxa are grouped into a summary percentage diagram where each pollen type was assigned to a major vegetation type following a simple biome scheme. All records are plotted using the best available chronology for each individual site.

24

Figures 5. Vegetation changes at selected time slices between 17 and 8 ka cal BP. The time 1 slices were selected to match significant climatic shifts during the investigated time period. The 2 3 taxa are grouped following the same scheme as in Figure 4 and 5. 4 Tables 5 6 7 Table 1. List of compiled records from CEE in the INTIMATE chronological framework, 8 specifying the dating method used, the climate variable that was reconstructed and the used 9 proxy. 10 11 Table 2. Summary of inferred climate changes between 14.7 and 8 ka cal BP at individual high-12 resolution sites from CEE. 13 14 Table 3. Major vegetation types (megabiomes) in CEE Europe. Each pollen type was assigned to one of these megabiomes. 15 16 17 Table 4. Temporal and spatial environmental dynamics over the Eastern European loess belt. Abbreviations: CP-continuous permafrost; DP-discontinuous permafrost; T-tundra; TA-taiga; 18 19 DF-forest; FS-forest steppe; PL-mosaic parkland; MS-modern steppe; CLS-cold loess steppe; WLS-warm loess steppe; DWLS-dry warm loess steppe. 20 21

		Country		Chronology		Deconstructed					
Nº	Archive		Country	Country	Country	Site	Type of dating	Number of dated points	Mean temporal resolution	variable	Quantified proxy
1	Lake	Slovenia	Lake Bled	<sup>14</sup> C, tephra	2 3	69 (isotopes) 180 (pollen)	Temperature	Bulk carbonates δ <sup>18</sup> Ο Pollen Plant macroremains	Andrič et al., 2009, Lane et al., 2011		
2	seatments	Poland	Żabieniec bog	$^{14}C$	5	252	Temperature	Chironomids	Plociennik et al., 2011		
3		Romania	Lake Brazi	$^{14}C$	7	124	Temperature	Chironomids	Toth et al., 2012		
4	Speleothemes	Romania	V11 Cave	U/Th	10	63	Temperature	Calcite $\delta^{18}$ O	Tămaș et al., 2005		
5		Belarus	Lake Sergeyeyskoe	$^{14}C$	5	121	Vegetation	Pollen	Makhnach et al., 2009		
6		Lithuania	Lake Ginkunai	$^{14}C$	8	56	Vegetation	Pollen	Stancikaite et al., 2008, 2009		
7		Poland	Jezioro Linówek	<sup>14</sup> C	2	200 (pollen) 40 (lant macroremains	Vegetation Lake level	Pollen Plant macroremains	Gałka et al., 2014		
8			Kobylnica Wołoska	<sup>14</sup> C	6	66 (pollen) 18 (plant macroremains	Vegetation	Pollen Plant macroremains	Kołaczek et al., in press.		
9	eat	Latvia	Lake Kurjanovas	<sup>14</sup> C	6	66	Vegetation	Pollen Plant macroremains LOI	Heikkilä et al., 2009		
10	ments /P	Estonia	Lake Nakri	<sup>14</sup> C	9	80 (pollen) 30 (macro)	Vegetation	Pollen Plant macroremains LOI	Amon et al., 2012; Veski et al., 2012		
11	edi	Crash	Labský důl	$^{14}C$	5	165	Vegetation	Pollen	Engel et al., 2010		
12	lake s	Republic	Švarcenberk	<sup>14</sup> C	3	60	Vegetation	Pollen	Pokorný, 2002, Pokorný et al., 2010		
13	i i	Hungary	Kiss Mohos	<sup>14</sup> C	8	163	Vegetation	Pollen	Willis et al., 1998		
14	Follen	Romania	Preluca Țiganului Steregoiu	<sup>14</sup> C	12 12	65 35	Vegetation Temperature Precipitation Lake level	Pollen Plant macroremains Zoological remains LOI Micro-macrocharcoal Mineral magnetic measurements	Björkman et al., 2002; Feurdean et al., 2007, 2012b; Ampel, 2004		
15			Avrig	$^{14}C$	10	104	Vegetation	Pollen	Tanțău et al., 2006		
16			Atolov Straldzha	<sup>14</sup> C	7	790	Vegetation Biomes	Pollen Micro-charcoal Mineral magnetic susceptibility	Connor et al., 2013		
17	7	Bulgaria	Trilistnika	<sup>14</sup> C	6	293	Vegetation	Pollen	Tonkov et al., 2008; 2012		

Chronology		NW Slovenia	S Romania	W Romania	NW Romania	<b>Central Poland</b>	Baltic region
Event	Age (b2k)	Lake carbonates δ <sup>18</sup> Ο	Chironomids	Speleothem δ <sup>18</sup> Ο	Pollen-based	Chironomids	Pollen and macrofossil -based
8.2 ka BP	8300 - 8140	Cold			Cold		Cold
9.3 ka BP	9350 - 9240	Cold		Cold	Cold		Cold
Holocene	11703	Warm	Warm	Warm	Warm		Moderate
GS-1	12896 - 11703	Cold and dry	Moderate	Cold and dry	Moderate, with very cold winters, dry	Mild	Cold
GI-1a	13099 - 12896	Moderate, drying tendency	Moderate	Warm	Slightly warm, wet	Warm	Moderate
GI-1b	13311 - 13099	Moderate	Moderate	Cold and wet	Moderate, cold winter	Warm	Cold
GI-1c	13954 - 13311	Moderate	Moderate	Warm	Warmest during the LG, warm winter, wet	Warm, colder than GI-1e	Moderate
GI-1d	14075 - 13954	Moderate, wetter	Cold	Cold	Cool winters, slightly warm summer	Warm	Cold
GI-1e	14692 - 14075	Warm and dry	Moderate	Very warm	Warm and dry	Warm	Cold
GS-2a		Very cold	Very cold			Very cold	Very cold

Megabiomes	Characteristic pollen taxa
Coniferous trees	Picea, Pinus, Abies, Larix, Juniperus
Cold deciduous trees	Alnus, Betula, Salix, Populus
Temperate deciduous trees	Ulmus, Quercus (deciduous-type), Tilia, Corylus, Acer, Fraxinus, Acer, Carpinus, Hedera, Ilex, Fagus, Viscum, Sambucus, Viburnum, Cornus, Frangula, Myrica, Prunus, Sorbus
Warm temperate taxa	Quercus (evergreen-type), Olea, Carpinus orientalis/Ostrya, Loranthus, Fraxinus ornus-type, Rhamnus/Paliurus, Euonymus, Jasminum, Colutea, Cotinus
Grass and shrubs	Ericaceae, Calluna, Hippophae, Poaceae, Cyperaceae, other NAP
Xerophythic herbs	Artemisia and Chenopodiaceae/Amaranthaceae

Between the Alps and the CarpathiansCLSFS-PL-WLSCLS-TDF-FS-TAN of the Carpathian Mts.DPFS-T-TACD-T-CLS-TADF-FS-TAMiddle DeputeDL CLS DW/LSDL WLS DW/LSCLS DL WLS
Carpathians     DP     FS-T-TA     CD-T-CLS-TA     DF-FS-TA       Middle Depute     DL CLS DWLS     DL WLS DWLS     CLS DL     FS-DL MS
N of the Carpathian Mts. DP FS-T-TA CD-T-CLS-TA DF-FS-TA
Lower Danube and Northern DWLS-CLS PL-WLS-DWLS DWLS-CLS FS-PL-MS
coast of the Black Sea
Ukrainian and Russian lowlands   DP-CLS   FS-WLS-T   DP-T-CLS   DF-FS-TA-

Figure 1 Click here to download high resolution image









# Figure 5a Click here to download high resolution image



Figure 5b Click here to download high resolution image

